

CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

45 FREMONT, SUITE 2000
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2219
VOICE (415) 904-5200
FAX (415) 904-5400
TDD (415) 597-5885

**W30b**

DATE: August 21, 2015
TO: Coastal Commissioners
FROM: Charles Lester, Executive Director

SUBJECT: **MINUTES of MEETING of June 10-12, 2015**
City of Newport Beach
City Council Chambers
100 Civic Center Drive
Newport Beach, CA 92660

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 10, 2015

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Kinsey.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chair Kinsey, Vice Chair Zimmer, Bochco, Cox, Groom, Howell, McClure, Shallenberger, Uranga; Turnbull-Sanders arrived at 9:30 a.m.; Vargas arrived at 2 p.m. Non-voting: Beland, Jones. Absent: Mitchell.
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public address the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.
5. **CHAIR'S REPORT.** Information only.

STATEWIDE

6. **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**
 - a. **Director's Report.** Information only.
 - b. **Legislative Report.** Information only.
 - c. **Public Hearing and Briefing on Revised Draft Sea Level Rise Policy Guidance.** Commission staff briefing and public hearing on revised draft Sea Level Rise Policy Guidance. Item trailed until after items 6d and 6e. Public comment and Commission discussion. No action taken.
 - d. **2016 Schedule of Meeting Dates and Locations.** Item trailed until after item 6e. The Commission changed the November location to the North Central Coast and the December location to the South Central Coast.

Motion & vote: Shallenberger moved to approve the calendar as amended and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Groom. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

e. **Refugio Oil Spill Report.** Information only.

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (LOS ANGELES COUNTY)

7. **ADMINISTRATIVE CALENDAR.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
 - a. **Application No. 5-15-0263 (Moore, San Pedro)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-15-0320 (Rosenmayr & Strippoli, Pacific Palisades)**
8. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** Staff recommended approval with conditions.
 - a. **Application No. 5-15-0004 (Romano, Santa Monica)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-15-0005 (Demontesquiou, Santa Monica)**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT

9. **CONSENT CALENDAR.**
 - a. **Application No. 6-15-0503 (Menvielle, San Diego)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Cox. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

REPORT OF CLOSED SESSION.

The Commission received litigation information and advice regarding:

Arnold Land Co. v. CCC,
Baltimore Land Co. v. CCC,
Frank v. CCC,
Friends of Children's Pool v. City of San Diego,
Markee et al. v. County of Santa Barbara et al.,

The Commission received litigation information and advice and provided direction regarding:

Capistrano Shores Property LLC v. CCC
Horizontal Development LLC et al. v. CCC,

The Commission received litigation information and advice regarding a matter of potential litigation.

ENFORCEMENT

9.1. **ENFORCEMENT REPORT.** None.

9.3. **Commission Consent Cease & Desist Order No. CCC-15-CD-03 (Front Runner LLC, Santa Monica Mountains, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval of the Consent Cease & Desist Order.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to issue the Cease and Desist order pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

9.5. **Commission Consent Restoration Order No. CCC-15-RO-03 (Front Runner LLC, Santa Monica Mountains, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval of the Restoration Order.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to issue the Restoration order pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

9.7. **Cease and Desist Order No. CCC-15-CD-04 (West Newport Oil Company, Orange Co.) [POSTPONED]**

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT

10. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

11. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved one item [14b] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

12. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

- a. **City of San Diego LCP Amendment No. LCP-6-OCB-15-0006-1 (Ocean Beach Community Plan) Time Extension.** Staff recommended approval of the time extension.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to grant the time extension and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- b. **City of Carlsbad LCP Amendment No. LCP-6-CII-14-0597-1 (Car Country Initiatives 2 and 4) Certification Review.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

- c. **Port of San Diego Master Plan Amendment #6-PSD-MAJ-45-13 (Convention Center Expansion III) Certification Review.** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to adopt the certification of Port Master Plan Amendment No. 6-PSD-MAJ-45-13 and recommended a yes vote, seconded by McClure. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

13. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-6-LJS-14-0063 (BC5 Camino LLC, San Diego)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and opened the de novo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

14. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 6-15-0223 (City of San Diego Park and Recreation Department, Children's Pool)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

- b. **Application No. 6-15-0580 (San Dieguito Park Joint Powers Authority (JPA), San Diego)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (LOS ANGELES COUNTY)

- 15. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR LOS ANGELES COUNTY.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

- 16. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).**

- 17. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-5-VEN-15-0026 (422 Grand Boulevard LLC, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised substantial on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and continued the matter to a future hearing. **Substantial Issue found.**
- b. **Appeal No. A-5-VEN-15-0027 (416 Grand Boulevard LLC, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised substantial on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and continued the matter to a future hearing. **Substantial Issue found.**
- c. **Appeal No. A-5-VEN-15-0029 (Klein, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed.

Motion & vote: Vargas moved to determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No Substantial Issue found.**

- d. **Appeal No. A-5-MNB-15-0032 (IMG LLC, Manhattan Beach Open Volleyball Tournament, Manhattan Beach)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed.

Motion & vote: Shallenberger moved to determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Howell. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No Substantial Issue found.**

18. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.

- a. **Application No. 5-15-0030 (Sunshine Enterprises LP, Santa Monica)**
[POSTPONED]

STATEWIDE

19. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** None.
20. **COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS.** Information only.
21. **CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.
22. **SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.
23. **SANTA MONICA BAY RESTORATION REPORT.** None.
24. **DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL'S REPORT.** None.

The Commission recessed for the day at 5:00 p.m.

THURSDAY, JUNE 11, 2015

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Kinsey.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chair Kinsey, Vice Chair Zimmer, Bochco, Cox, Groom, McClure, Shallenberger, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga; Vargas arrived at 9:30 a.m. Non-voting: Beland, Jones. Absent: Howell, Mitchell.
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (ORANGE COUNTY)

5. **ADMINISTRATIVE CALENDAR.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
 - a. **Application No. 5-15-0008 (Cardarella, Newport Beach)**
6. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** Staff recommended approval with conditions.
 - a. **Application No. 5-14-0577 (Bablot, Newport Beach)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-14-1668 (City of Newport Beach Park Avenue Bridge)**
 - c. **Application No. 5-14-1840 (Brown, Newport Beach)**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. **Approved with conditions.**

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** Staff recommended approval with conditions.
 - a. **UCSB Notice of Impending Development No. UCS-NOID-0009-14 (KITP Southern Tarplant Seedbank Restoration Project).** Staff recommended approval of the Notice of Impending Development.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

ENFORCEMENT

8. **ENFORCEMENT REPORT.** [For Enforcement items, see Wednesday Items 9.1, 9.3, 9.5]

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (ORANGE COUNTY)

9. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR ORANGE COUNTY.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

10. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved two items [13c, 13d] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

11. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs)**

- a. **Laguna Beach Local Coastal Program Amendment LCP-5-LGB-14-0344-1 (Water Quality Ordinance Update).** Staff recommended approval of the Implementation Plan as submitted.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a no vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Approved as submitted.**

12. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-5-LGB-14-0027 (MSSK Ventures LLC, Laguna Beach)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised Substantial Issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and opened the de novo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Shallenberger moved to continue and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Continued.**

13. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 5-14-1211 (City of Newport Beach Grass Field) [POSTPONED]**
- b. **Application No. 5-14-1213 (City of Newport Beach Fire Rings)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion: McClure moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco.

Amending motion & vote: McClure moved to require the applicant to submit evidence within 90 days of California State Parks' concurrence with the Corona del Mar portion of the plan and to require the Executive Director review and approve any changes to the plan and determine if those changes require a permit amendment and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. The roll call vote was 9 in favor (Bochco, Cox, Groom, McClure, Shallenberger, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Zimmer, Kinsey) and one opposed (Vargas). **Approved.**

Vote on the main motion: The roll call vote was 9 in favor (Bochco, Cox, Groom, McClure, Shallenberger, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Zimmer, Kinsey) and one opposed (Vargas). **Approved with conditions as amended.**

- c. **Application No. 5-14-1717 (Lido Group Retail LLC, Newport Beach)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
- d. **Application No. 5-14-1784 (City of Newport Beach Road & Parking Improvement)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
- e. **Application No. 5-14-1837 (Signal Landmark, Huntington Beach)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Uranga moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by McClure. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

- f. **Application No. 5-14-0200 (City of Newport Beach Dredging and Beach Nourishment)** Staff recommended approval with conditions. Staff made an oral modification to recommended Special Condition No. 5.

Motion & vote: Shallenberger moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

14. **FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.**

- a. **Consistency Certification No. CC-0002-15 (City of Newport Beach, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended that the Commission conditionally concur that the project is consistent. Staff made an oral modification to recommended Special Condition No. 5.

Motion & vote: Shallenberger moved to conditionally concur pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

15. **REVISED FINDINGS.**

- a. **Permit No. A-5-LGB-13-0223 (Meehan, Laguna Beach)** Staff recommended adoption of the revised findings.

Motion & vote: Kinsey moved to adopt the revised findings and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote of the prevailing side (Bochco, Cox, Groom, McClure, Turnbull-Sanders, Vargas, Zimmer, Kinsey) was unanimous. **Approved.**

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

16. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

17. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved one item [18a] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Shallenberger moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. **Approved with conditions.**

18. **NOTICE OF IMPENDING DEVELOPMENT.**

- a. **Malibu State Beaches Notice of Impending Development No. MSB-NOID-0005-14 (El Matador Parking Lot and Trail Erosion Repairs).** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

19. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 4-12-076 (Kellogg Avenue LLC, Goleta) [WITHDRAWN]**

The Commission recessed for the day at 2:45 p.m. and departed for a field trip Crystal Cove State Park Historical District.

FRIDAY, JUNE 12, 2015

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order by Chair Kinsey at 9:00 a.m.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chair Kinsey, Vice Chair Zimmer, Bochco, Cox, Groom, McClure, Shallenberger, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga. Vargas arrived at 9:45 a.m. Absent: Howell, Mitchell. Non-voting present: Beland, Jones.
3. **AGENDA CHANGES**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.

ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES AND FEDERAL CONSISTENCY

5. **ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES and FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.** Report by the Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, negative determinations, matters not requiring public hearings, and status report on offshore oil & gas exploration & development. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
6. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 2 items [7a, 8a] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

7. **PERMIT AMENDMENTS.**
 - a. **Permit No. 9-13-0344-A1 (Southern California Gas Co., Goleta)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
8. **FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.**
 - a. **CD-0002-15 (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Seal Beach)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
 - b. **CD-0003-15 (Department of Veterans Affairs, San Francisco)** Staff recommended that the Commission concur that the project is consistent.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to concur that the Long Range Development Plan is consistent and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

NORTH COAST DISTRICT

9. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
10. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 2 items [12a, 12b] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Cox. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

11. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-1-ARC-12-3 (Humboldt State University Foundation, Arcata)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: McClure moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

12. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 1-14-0249 (Humboldt Bay Harbor District, Humboldt Co.)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
- b. **Application No. 1-14-1590 (Pacific Gas & Electric Co., Humboldt Co.)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

NORTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

13. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There was no report for this item.
14. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.
15. **NEW APPEALS.**
 - a. **Appeal No. A-2-SMC-10-016 (McGregor, San Mateo Co.)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the

Commission found substantial issue and opened the hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by McClure. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

16. **PERMIT AMENDMENTS.**

- a. **Permit No. 1-98-057-A3 (California Department of Transportation, Half Moon Bay)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Zimmer. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

17. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

18. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved one item [21a] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

19. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

- a. **Santa Cruz County LCP Amendment No. LCP-3-SCO-14-0817-1 Part B (Sign Exceptions). Certification Review.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to concur pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- b. **Pismo Beach LCP Amendment No. LCP-3-PSB-14-0830-3 (PDP and Affordable Housing).** Staff recommended denial of the Implementation Plan as submitted and approval if modified as suggested.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Certification denied as submitted.**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to certify the Implementation Plan if modified as suggested pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Shallenberger. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with modifications.**

20. **NEW APPEALS.**

a. **Appeal No. A-3-MCO-15-0023 (Cisar, Monterey Co.) [POSTPONED]**

21. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

a. **Application Nos. A-3-SCO-09-001 and A-3-SCO-09-002 (Frank, et al., Santa Cruz Co.)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

22. **REVISED FINDINGS.**

a. **Santa Cruz County LCP Amendment No. LCP-3-SCO-14-0833-2 (Seacliff Village Plan).** Staff recommended that the Commission adopt the revised findings.

Motion & vote: Turnbull-Sanders moved to adopt the findings pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. The vote of the prevailing side (McClure, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Vargas, Kinsey) was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

STATEWIDE

23. **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS.** Information only.

There being no old or new business, the meeting of the California Coastal Commission adjourned at 10:40 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Charles Lester
Executive Director

