CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

5 FREMONT STREET, SUITE 2000 N FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2219 CE AND TDD (415) 904-5200 PETE WILSON, Governor

STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

ON CONSISTENCY DETERMINATION

Consistency Determination No. CD-026-97	
Staff:	MPD-SF
File Date:	3/5/97
45th Day:	4/19/97
60th Day:	5/4/97
Commission Meeting:	4/8/97

FEDERAL AGENCY: U.S. Navy

DEVELOPMENT LOCATION:

The Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center, south of Harbor Drive and slightly north of Shelter Island, adjacent to San Diego Bay, City of San Diego (Exhibits 1-2)

DEVELOPMENT DESCRIPTION:

Construction of a 2,061 square meter (approximately 1/2 acre) gymnasium for military personnel use (Exhibits 3-6)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Navy proposes to construct a 2,061 sq. meter gymnasium for military personnel use adjacent to San Diego Bay at the Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center in San Diego. The project is needed because the impending closure of the adjacent Naval Training Center, which is located to the north of the site across Harbor Drive, will mean that the nearest gym available for use by Anti-Submarine Warfare Center personnel would otherwise be over three miles away.

CD-26-97 Navy, San Diego Page 2

The main coastal issue raised is the project's visibility from Harbor Drive and/or Harbor Island. The site is currently used for small boat storage, and the immediate site does not contain structures. However, immediately adjacent to the site are other existing Navy buildings at the Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center; these buildings are of comparable heights (or taller). The predominant views from Harbor Drive and Harbor Island are of multi-story buildings, and the view across this site is not particularly significant. Thus, the project is compatible with nearby Navy development and will not significantly detract from scenic public coastal views. The project is therefore consistent with the view protection policy (Section 30251) of the Coastal Act.

The Navy's Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center is not closed to public access, and the project would not generate any burdens on public access. The project is therefore consistent with the public access and recreation policies (Sections 30210-30212) of the Coastal Act.

STAFF SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION:

I. Project Description. The Navy proposes to construct a 2,061 sq. meter (approx. 22,000 sq. ft.) gymnasium for military personnel use along the San Diego Bay shoreline, just north of Shelter Island, at the fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center in San Diego. The maximum height of the gymnasium will be 33 ft. The Navy states the gymnasium is needed due to the impending closure of the adjacent Naval Training Center, because the nearest gym available to the Anti-Submarine Warfare Center personnel would otherwise be over three miles away. The Navy states the gymnasium is necessary to support new students in meeting their basic training requirements, which include participation in physical training programs. The project site is currently used for small boat storage, which will be relocated.

II. <u>Status of Local Coastal Program</u>. The standard of review for federal consistency determinations is the policies of Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act, and not the Local Coastal Program (LCP) of the affected area. If the Commission has certified the LCP and incorporated it into the CCMP, the LCP can provide guidance in applying Chapter 3 policies in light of local circumstances. If the Commission has not incorporated the LCP into the CCMP, the LCP cannot guide the Commission's decision, but it can provide background information. The City of San Diego's LCP is fully incorporated into the CCMP.</u>

III. <u>Federal Agency's Consistency Determination</u>. The Navy has determined the project to be consistent to the maximum extent practicable with the California Coastal Management Program.

IV. Staff Recommendation:

The staff recommends that the Commission adopt the following resolution:

Concurrence

The Commission hereby <u>concurs</u> with the consistency determination made by the Navy for the proposed project, finding that the project is consistent to the maximum extent practicable with the California Coastal Management Program.

V. Findings and Declarations:

The Commission finds and declares as follows:

A. <u>Public Views</u>. Section 30251 of the Coastal Act provides:

The scenic and visual qualities of coastal areas shall be considered and protected as a resource of public importance. Permitted development shall be sited and designed to protect views to and along the ocean and scenic coastal areas, to minimize the alteration of natural land forms, to be visually compatible with the character of surrounding areas, and, where feasible, to restore and enhance visual quality in visually degraded areas. New development in highly scenic areas such as those designated in the California Coastline Preservation and Recreation Plan prepared by the Department of Parks and Recreation and by local government shall be subordinate to the character of its setting.

The San Diego Bay shoreline offers numerous scenic bay and ocean views from roads such as Harbor Drive and the pedestrian pathway paralleling the shoreline. The main public areas from which scenic views could be affected by the project are along Harbor Drive and/or Harbor Island. The maximum height of the gymnasium would be 33 ft. at the apex of the basketball court (Exhibits 4 & 5). The site is currently used for small boat storage, and the immediate site is does not contain structures. The Navy believes the proposed project will be more attractive than the existing boat storage, which will be relocated. In addition, immediately adjacent to the site are other existing Navy buildings

CD-26-97 Navy, San Diego Page 4

at the Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center. These buildings, the location and heights of which are shown in Exhibit 6, are of comparable heights to or taller than the proposed project. Thus, the proposed project will not alter the character of the predominant views from Harbor Drive and Harbor Island, which are already of multi-story buildings at the Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Center and on Harbor Island. The Commission concludes that the project is consistent with the prevailing visual character of the area, will not significantly detract from scenic coastal public views across the site, and is therefore consistent with the provisions of Section 30251 of the Coastal Act.

B. <u>Public Access and Recreation</u>. Sections 30210 through 30212 of the Coastal Act require the maximization and maintenance of public access and recreation opportunities. Section 30210 provides that: "... maximum access ... and recreational opportunities shall be provided for all the people consistent with public safety and military security needs" Section 30212 requires the provision of public access to be provided in new development projects located between the first public road and sea, again, consistent with military security and public safety needs.

The proposed project is located within an area where the Navy recently proposed a consistency determination for a public ferry pier to the Naval Air Station North Island in Coronado (CD-119-96), which the Commission concurred with on November 15, 1996. Therefore, unlike many of the Navy's San Diego bases such as in the nearby Point Loma area, this Navy area surrounding the project site is accessible to the public. Moreover, the project would not generate any burdens on public access. The Commission therefore finds that the project would not adversely impact public access and recreation and would be consistent with the Sections 30210-30212 of the Coastal Act.











