

CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

45 FREMONT, SUITE 2000
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2219
VOICE AND TDD (415) 904-5200

*Tu 5a*

RECORD PACKET COPY

TO: ALL COMMISSIONERS

FROM: PETER DOUGLAS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

SUBJECT: MINUTES OF MEETING OF January 8 to 10, 1997
Crown Plaza - Holiday Inn - LAX
5985 West Century Blvd.
Los Angeles

Wednesday, January 8, 1997 pages 1 to 9

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Wednesday, January 8, 1997, at 10:00 a.m. by Chairman Calcagno.

2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Calcagno, Vice Chairman Flemming, Commissioners Areias, Branham, Brennan, Campbell, Giacomini, Holanda, Pavley, Rick, Staffel and Wan. Absent: Sanders.

ENERGY and OCEAN RESOURCES3. **ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATION.**

a. **Application No. E-96-20 (Chevron, San Luis Obispo Co.)** Trailed until after the elections. Staff recommended approval with special conditions as modified in addendum.

Donna M. Herbert & John Paulson, both representing applicant, were available for questions.

DRAFT

There being no objection, Chairman Areias ruled that the administrative permit be issued by the Executive Director. **Approved.**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATION.

a. **Application No. 5-96-236 (Grand Prix Assn. of Long Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

There being no objection, Chairman Calcagno ruled that the administrative permit be issued by the Executive Director. **Approved.**

5. CONSENT CALENDAR.

a. **Application No. 5-96-235 (Bednar, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended approval with special condition.

Motion & Vote: Rick moved staff recommendation, seconded by Wan, and the roll call vote was 8 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

STATEWIDE

6. ELECTION of CHAIRMAN, VICE-CHAIRMAN and REPRESENTATIVE to SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY. Giacomini nominated Areias for Chairman, seconded by Pavley, and the hand vote was 8 in favor an 0 opposed. Wan nominated Giacomini for Vice Chairman, seconded by Pavley, and the hand vote was 9 in favor an 0 opposed. Pavley nominated Hisserich for Representative to Santa Monica Mountains Conservancy, seconded by Giacomini, and Chairman Areias ruled that it was unanimously approved.

7. COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS. Informational only.

8. **CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None. _____

9. **SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY REPORT.** Informational only. _____

10. **DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL'S REPORT.** Informational only. _____

11. **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

a. **Temporary Events.** Informational only. The following signed up to speak on this item: Jennifer Levinson; Jennifer Pautz; Michael Behan & John C. Leppert, both representing City of San Diego; W. Victor; Viet Ngo; Don Falkenstien, representing Alliance to Keep Beach Access Free; Jon Stevenson, representing Association of Volleyball Professionals; Jim Wolfe, representing City of Manhattan Beach; Dusty Brogan & Lynn Atkinson, both representing Los Angeles County Dept. of Beaches & Harbors. _____

b. Report by Department of Finance on fiscal control audit. Informational only. _____

c. **Section 309 Assessment & Strategy.** Informational only. _____

ENERGY and OCEAN RESOURCES

12. **ENERGY & OCEAN RESOURCES REPORT.** Executive Director Douglas reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and status of offshore oil & gas exploration & development. _____

STATEWIDE

13. **FEDERAL CONSISTENCY REPORT.** Executive Director Douglas reported on Negative Determinations issued by the federal consistency staff, and of other major non-energy federal consistency matters. _____

14. **FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.**

a. **CC-126-96 (Goleta Sanitary District, Santa Barbara Co.)** Staff recommended approval.

Kamil. S. Azoury, representing Goleta Sanitary Dist., requested to speak in favor of the recommendation.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Staffel, and the roll call vote was 7 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

b. **CD-140-96 (National Park Service, San Diego)** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & Vote: Flemming moved staff recommendation, seconded by Giacomini, and Chairman Areias substituted the previous roll call vote (7-0). **Passed.**

c. **CC-146-96 (Port of Long Beach, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval.

Geraldine Knatz, representing Port of Long Beach; Mayor Beverly O'Neill, representing City of Long Beach; and Robert Kanter, representing Port of Long Beach; all requested to speak on behalf of the applicant. Cat Kuhlman & Steven John, both representing EPA, requested to speak regarding process. Lt. Col. Wylie Bearup & Dr. Michael Palesmo, both representing Corps of Engineers; and Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club, all requested to express concerns about the project. Catherine Rich, representing Audubon Society; four representatives of California Earth Corps requested to speak in opposition to the project: Mel Nutter, Don May, Michelle Syper & John Cohn. Mark Gold, representing Heal the Bay; Ann Cantrell, representing El Dorado Audubon Society & Save the Park Long Beach; and Kay M. Gilbert, representing Natural Resources Defense Council; all requested to speak in opposition to the project.

Motion & Vote: Staffel moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT

15. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Damm reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

a. **Long Beach LCP Amendment No. 7-96 (Minor) Currie.** Staff recommended concurrence with the Executive Director. There being no objection, Vice Chairman Giacomini ruled that the Commission concurred. **Approved.**

16. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved item 17 m to the Calendar, and recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: Flemming moved staff recommendation, seconded by Pavley, and the roll call vote was 6 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

17. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.

a. **Application No. 5-95-294 (Nasr, Los Angeles)** **Postponed.**

b. **Application No. 5-96-191 (Mavar, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Four speakers spoke in favor of the project: Nancy Mavar, Vergil Best, Raymond Medak, and Ed Ruddy. Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club, expressed concerns about the project.

Motion & Vote: Flemming moved staff recommendation, seconded by Staffel, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

LUNCH RECESS. The Commission recessed for lunch at 12:30 and reconvened at 2:15 p.m..

REPORT of CLOSED SESSION. In closed session the Commission discussed three items of pending litigation for information only.

c. **Application No. 5-96-200 (Belmont Brewing, Long Beach)** Staff recommended denial.

Two speakers requested to speak in favor of the project: Chuck Greenberg, representing applicant, and Dennis Eschen, representing City of Long Beach Parks, Rec. & Marine. Three speakers requested to speak in opposition: Dr. Susan F. Rabin, Dick Roddewig, and Henry Warzybok.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved approval of the application, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 7 in favor (Calcagno, Flemming, Giacomini, Pavley, Rick, Staffel & Areias) and 2 opposed (Campbell & Wan). **Passed.**

d. **Application No. 5-96-219 (Los Angeles Co. and Parks & Rec. "sunshelters")** Postponed.

e. **Application No. 4-96-179 (L.A. Co. "sunshelters")** Postponed.

f. **Application No. 5-96-221 (Santa Monica parking program)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Paul Foley, representing City of Santa Monica, spoke in favor of the recommendation. Sherman Stacey, representing Friends of Adelaide Drive Neighborhood Assn; Paul K. Beien; Lt. Colonel Wayne A Barter; Louis Savett; Terry Sanders; and Mrs DeShazo; all spoke in favor of the project. Mark Massara; Kathy Knight; Elizabeth Sedlak; Joseph P. Harrington; and Audrey Petersen; all spoke in opposition.

Motion & Vote: Pavley moved staff recommendation, seconded by Wan, and the roll call vote was 4 in favor (Flemming, Pavley, Rick & Areias) and 5 opposed (Calcagno, Campbell, Giacomini, Staffel & Wan). **Failed.**

g. **Application No. 5-96-231 (Port of Long Beach, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Geraldine Knatz, representing Port of Long Beach; Mayor Beverly O'Neill, representing City of Long Beach; and Robert Kanter, representing Port of Long Beach; all requested to speak on behalf of the applicant. The following speakers filled out requests to speak in support of the

project: Shanna Wesley, representing Senator Betty Karnette; Andrea S. Chaudron, representing Assemblymember Sally Havice; Abbie Winter, representing Assemblyman Ruykendall; Michael Patrick Murchison, representing Los Angeles County Supervisor Don Knabe; Kevin Schroeder, representing International Longshoreman's & Warehouseman's Union; Kirk Wilson, representing Inland Boatmans Union; and Hugo Morris, representing Joint Council of Teamsters, No. 42. Lt. Col. Wylie Bearup & Dr. Michael Palesmo, both representing Corps of Engineers; submitted requests to express concerns about the project. The following speakers submitted requests to speak in opposition: Catherine Rich, representing Audubon Society; four representatives of California Earth Corps: Mel Nutter, Don May, Michelle Syper & John Cohn; Mark Gold, representing Heal the Bay; Kathy Knight; Ann Cantrell, representing El Dorado Audubon Society & Save the Park Long Beach; Kay M. Gilbert, representing Natural Resources Defense Council; Bruce Monroe, representing Sierra Club Angeles Chapter; Kenneth Jay Freeland; and Goodhue.

Motion & Vote: Staffel moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 8 in favor and 1 opposed (Pavley). **Passed.**

h. **Application No. 5-96-223 (Lee Group, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Jeff Lee, representing applicant, agreed with recommendation.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

i. **Application No. 5-96-224 (Lee Group, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

The hearing for this item was combined with item h above.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and Chairman Areias substituted the previous roll call vote (9-0). **Passed.**

j. **Application No. 5-96-246 (The Lee Group, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

The hearing for this item was combined with item h above.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and Chairman Areias substituted the previous roll call vote (9-0). **Passed.**

k. **Application No. 5-96-247 (Lee, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

The hearing for this item was combined with item h above.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and Chairman Areias substituted the previous roll call vote (9-0). **Passed.**

l. **Application No. 5-96-248 (Lee, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

The hearing for this item was combined with item h above.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and Chairman Areias substituted the previous roll call vote (9-0). **Passed.**

m. **Application No. 5-96-249 (Heimstaedt, Newport Beach)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

n. **Application No. 5-96-197 (Long Beach/Fieldstone Park)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Dennis Eschen, representing City of Long Beach, submitted a request to speak on behalf of the applicant. Joseph Sanders, representing Technical Advisory Committee of City of Long Beach, and A. C. duPont, representing Long Beach Rowing Assoc., both submitted requests to speak in opposition to the project. John Nunn and Eric Eldridge, both representing Long Beach Rowing Association, submitted requests to

express concerns about the project. Larry Goodhue, submitted a request to speak on behalf of the appellant.

Motion & Vote: Staffel moved staff recommendation, seconded by Wan, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

RECESS. The Commission recessed for the day at 6:45 p.m..

Thursday, January 9, 1997 - pages 10 to 16

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Thursday, January 9, 1997, at 9:00 a.m. by Vice Chairman Giacomini.
 2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Vice Chairman Giacomini, Commissioners Branham, Brennan, Calcagno, Campbell, Flemming, Pavley, Rick, Staffel and Wan. Absent: Holanda & Sanders. Chairman Areias arrived at 9:05.
-

NORTH COAST DISTRICT

3. CONSENT CALENDAR.

a. **Application No. 1-96-5 (Kent, Marin Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions. There being 3 votes to remove this item from the Calendar, Chairman Areias ruled that it would be heard at a subsequent meeting. **Postponed.**

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

3.5 ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATIONS. See items a. and b. on addendum to the agenda. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Approved: There being no objection, Chairman Areias ruled that these administrative permits be issued by the Executive Director.

4. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** See items a. through c. on page 8 of the agenda. Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Matt Richman, representing applicants on 4a, and Charles S. Offer, applicant on 4b, both submitted requests to speak in favor of projects.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Wan, and the roll call vote was 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 1 abstention (Flemming). **Passed.**

NORTH COAST DISTRICT

5. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Scholl reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

6. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff added item 9a to the Calendar, and recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: There being no speakers, Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

7. LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM.

a. **San Mateo Co. LCP Amendment No. 1-96 (Devil's Slide Tunnel Initiative).** Staff recommended approval.

Ruben Barrales, representing San Mateo County Board of Supervisors, submitted a speaker slip in favor of the project. Three speakers submitted slips in favor of staff recommendation: Zoe Kersteen-Tucker, representing Citizens Alliance for the Tunnel Solution; Lennie Roberts, representing Save Our Coast; and Chris Thollaug, representing Sierra Club.

Motion & Vote on Plan as Submitted: Giacomini approval of Land Use Plan Amendment as submitted, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

8. NEW APPEALS.

a. **Appeal No. A-1-96-81 (Garside, Marin Co.)** Staff recommended postponement. There being no objection, Chairman Areias opened the hearing on substantial issue, and continued it to a later meeting. **Postponed.**

b. **Appeal No. A-1-96-82 (formerly A-3-96-120) (Tyler & Tezza, San Mateo Co.)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Keith Sugar submitted a request to speak on behalf of the appellants. Michael McCracken submitted a request to speak on behalf of the applicants.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

9. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.

a. **Application No. 1-96-30 (Nature Conservancy & Manila CSD, Humboldt Co.)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

b. **Application No. 1-96-63 (Redwood Development, Sonoma Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Judy Davidoff submitted a request to speak on behalf of the applicants.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

9.5 PERMIT AMENDMENT.

a. **Permit No. 1-90-109-A5 (CalTrans, Marin Co.)** **Postponed.**

CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

10. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Grove reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

a. **San Luis Obispo Co. LCP Amendment No. 2-96 Certification Review.** Staff recommended concurrence with the Executive Director. There being no objection, Chairman Areias ruled that the Commission concurred. **Approved.**

b. **Capitola LCP Minor Amendment No. 1-96 (Satellite Dishes).** Staff recommended concurrence with the Executive Director. There being no objection, Chairman Areias ruled that the Commission concurred. **Approved.**

11. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.

12. **NEW APPEALS.**

a. **Appeal No. A-3-96-113 (Vadnais, San Luis Obispo Co.)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised substantial issue.

Richard Grasseti, representing Cambria Legal Defense Fund, submitted a request to speak on behalf of the appellants. Joe Boud submitted a request to speak on behalf of the applicants.

Motion & Vote on No Substantial Issue: Wan moved that the appeal raised no substantial issue, seconded by Giacomini, and the roll call vote was 2 in favor (Rick & Staffel) and 7 opposed (Calcagno, Campbell, Flemming, Giacomini, Pavley, Wan & Areias). **Failed.**

There being no objection, Chairman Areias opened the hearing on the merits of the project, and continued it to a later meeting. **Postponed.**

b. **Appeal No. A-3-96-115 (Pobar & Bender, Pismo Beach)**
Withdrawn.

c. **Appeal No. A-3-96-118 (Marble, Monterey Co.)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Four speakers submitted requests to speak on behalf of the appellants: James M. Moriarty; Hildegard Mitchell; Mark A. Massara; and Maureen C. Moriarty. Duncan T. Todd AIA submitted a request to speak on behalf of the applicants.

Motion & Vote: Giacomini moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

d. **Appeal No. A-3-96-121 (Gordon, Santa Cruz)** **Withdrawn.**

13. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATION.

a. **Application No. 3-96-112 (Archer, Monterey)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Dan Archer spoke in favor of the project. Mark A. Massara, representing Sierra Club Coastal Program, spoke in opposition.

Motion: Calcagno moved staff recommendation, seconded by Staffel.

Motion & Vote to Continue: Pavley moved to continue the hearing for up to 60 days, seconded by Giacomini, and the roll call vote was 4 in favor (Giacomini, Pavley, Wan & Areias), 4 opposed (Calcagno, Flemming, Rick & Staffel) and 1 abstention (Campbell). **Failed.**

Vote on Main Motion: The roll call vote on the main motion above was 6 in favor (Calcagno, Flemming, Giacomini, Rick, Staffel & Areias) and 3 opposed (Campbell, Pavley & Wan). **Passed.**

14. FINDINGS.

a. **Permit No. 3-96-102 (Page, Pacific Grove)** Staff recommended approval of findings as modified in addendum.

Mary-Margaret O'Connell, representing applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Staffel moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the hand vote was 3 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

15. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Scholl reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

16. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff added four items to the Calendar (19a, 19c, 19d & 19e), and recommended approval with special conditions as clarified orally.

Two speakers submitted requests to speak on behalf of applicants: A. L. Cole (19a), Don Schmitz (19c, 19d & 19e).

Motion & Vote: Wan moved staff recommendation, seconded by Staffel, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

17. LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM (LCP).

a. **Ventura LCP Amendment No. 2-96 (Harbor Plan) Postponed.**

18. NEW APPEAL.

a. **Appeal No. A-4-96-16 (Caltrans, Ventura Co.)** Staff recommended postponement. There being no objection, Chairman Areias opened the hearing on substantial issue, and continued it to a later meeting. **Postponed.**

19. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.

a. **Application No. 4-95-140 (Caltrans, Malibu)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

b. **Application No. 4-96-28 (Gottlieb, Mauch, Harberger, Vail & Tagoni, Los Angeles Co.) Postponed.**

c. **Application No. 4-96-130 (Levy & Gershoy, Malibu) Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. Approved.**

d. **Application No. 4-96-173 (Harter, Malibu) Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. Approved.**

e. **Application No. 4-95-184 (Reich, Malibu) Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. Approved.**

f. **Application Nos. 5-90-839, 5-90-840, 5-90-841, 5-90-842, 5-91-49, 5-91-50, 5-91-51, 5-91-58, 5-91-59, 5-91-183, 5-91-184, 5-91-185, 5-91-186, 5-91-187, 5-91-188 & 5-91-189 (Lechuza Villas West, Malibu)). Postponed.**

REPORT of CLOSED SESSION. In closed session the Commission took action on Shea/Vickers Development et al. v. CCC, et al.; Witter and Richardson v. CCC; and Doyle v. City of Los Angeles, CCC.

RECESS. The Commission recessed for the day at 12:05 p.m..

Friday, January 10, 1997 - pages 17 to 19

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Friday, January 10, 1997, at 9:00 a.m. by Chairman Areias.

2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Areias, Commissioners Brennan, Campbell, Flemming, Pavley, Staffel and Wan. Absent: Branham, Calcagno, Giacomini, Holanda, Rick and Sanders.

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT

3. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** See items a. through c. on page 14 of the agenda. Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: There being no speakers, Campbell moved staff recommendation, seconded by Staffel, and the roll call vote was 6 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

4. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Damm reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

a. **Encinitas LCP Amendment No. 1-96 (Encinitas Ranch Specific Plan).** Staff recommended concurrence with the Executive Director. There being no objection, Chairman Areias ruled that the Commission concurred. **Approved.**

5. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.

6. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM (LCP).**

- a. **Coronado LCP Amendment No. 2-96 Time Extension.** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & Vote: There being no speakers, Pavley moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the hand vote was 6 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

7. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 6-96-80 (Parks & Rec., valet parking)** **Postponed.**
-

- b. **Application No. 6-96-120 (SD Co. Parks & Rec., lagoon opening)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Barbara Simons, representing County of San Diego, was available for questions. Doug Gibson, representing San Elijo Lagoon Conservancy, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Campbell moved staff recommendation, seconded by Flemming, and the roll call vote was 6 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

8. **FINDINGS.**

- a. **Application No. 6-96-89 (Casa de la Playa HOA, San Diego)** Staff recommended approval of findings.

- b. **Appeal No. A-6-96-104 (Casa de la Playa HOA, San Diego)** Staff recommended approval of findings.

Motion & Vote on Both: Wan moved staff recommendation on both sets of findings, seconded by Pavley, and the hand vote was 4 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

ADJOURNMENT. There being no old or new business, the meeting adjourned at 9:15 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

PETER M. DOUGLAS
Executive Director

pmg

