CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

South Coast Area Office 200 Oceangate, 10th Floor Long Beach, CA 90802-4302 (562) 590-5071

D PACKET COPY PETE WILSON, Governor

Filed: 2/16/98 49th Day: 4/6/98 180th Day: 8/15/98 Staff: CP-LB Staff Report: 3/19/98 Hearing Date: April 7-10, 1998 Commission Action:

STAFF REPORT: REGULAR CALENDAR

APPLICATION NO.: 5-98-042

APPLICANT: City of Long Beach

AGENTS:

PROJECT LOCATION: Ma

CT LOCATION: Marina Green and Shoreline Drive (Chestnut Avenue to Ocean Boulevard), Downtown Shoreline, City of Long Beach, Los Angeles County.

Jack Humphrey, Advance Planning Officer

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Implement metered parking on 388 existing parking spaces in the Marina Green public parking lots, and install between 189 and 245 new curbside parking spaces with parking meters on Shoreline Drive.

> Lot Area N/ABuilding Coverage 0 sq. ft. 0 sq. ft. Pavement Coverage Landscape Coverage 0 sq. ft. Parking Spaces 577 to 633 Zoning PD-1 Plan Designation Planned Development District 1 Ht abv fin grade 6.5 feet

Robert Paternoster, Director of Queensway Bay Development

SUMMARY OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the proposed project with special conditions regarding protection of public coastal access parking, the management of metered parking, parking fees, membership in the City's Parking and Traffic Association, and the submittal of final plans. The City agrees with the recommendation.

LOCAL APPROVAL RECEIVED:

1. City of Long Beach Approval in Concept, 2/13/98.

PS

SUBSTANTIVE FILE DOCUMENTS:

-

1.	City of	Long Beach (Certifie	ed Local (Coastal Program, 7/22/80.
2.	Coastal	Development	Permit	P-79-5250) (Marina Green).
з.	Coastal	Development	Permit	5-90-834	(Long Beach Convention Center).
4.	Coastal	Development	Permit	5-94-010	(Shoreline Village Parking).
5.	Coastal	Development	Permit	5-94-127	(Marina Green Parking).
6.	Coastal	Development	Permit	5-95-055	(Long Beach Aquarium).
7.	Coastal	Development	Permit	5-96-124	(Rainbow Harbor).
8.	Coastal	Development	Permit	5-96-268	(Aquarium Parking Structure).

STAFF NOTE:

A Coastal Development Permit is required from the Commission for the proposed development because the project site is located on state tidelands within the Commission's area of original jurisdiction. Pursuant to Section 30519 of the Coastal Act, any development located within the Commission's area of original jurisdiction requires a Coastal Development Permit from the Commission. The Commission's standard of review for the Coastal Development Permit for the proposed development is the Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act. The City of Long Beach certified LCP is advisory in nature and may provide guidance.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Commission adopt the following resolution:

I. Approval with Conditions

The Commission hereby <u>grants</u>, subject to the conditions below, a permit for the proposed development on the grounds that the development will be in conformity with the provisions of Chapter 3 of the California Coastal Act of 1976, is located between the sea and first public road nearest the shoreline and is in conformance with the public access and public recreation policies of Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act, and will not have any significant adverse impacts on the environment within the meaning of the California Environmental Quality Act.

II. Standard Conditions

1. <u>Notice of Receipt and Acknowledgment</u>. The permit is not valid and development shall not commence until a copy of the permit, signed by the permittee or authorized agent, acknowledging receipt of the permit and acceptance of the terms and conditions, is returned to the Commission office.

- 2. <u>Expiration</u>. If development has not commenced, the permit will expire two years from the date this permit is reported to the Commission. Development shall be pursued in a diligent manner and completed in a reasonable period of time. Application for extension of the permit must be made prior to the expiration date.
- 3. <u>Compliance</u>. All development must occur in strict compliance with the proposal as set forth in the application for permit, subject to any special conditions set forth below. Any deviation from the approved plans must be reviewed and approved by the staff and may require Commission approval.
- 4. <u>Interpretation</u>. Any questions of intent or interpretation of any condition will be resolved by the Executive Director or the Commission.
- 5. <u>Inspections</u>. The Commission staff shall be allowed to inspect the site and the project during its development, subject to 24-hour advance notice.
- 6. <u>Assignment</u>. The permit may be assigned to any qualified person, provided assignee files with the Commission an affidavit accepting all terms and conditions of the permit.
- 7. <u>Terms and Conditions Run with the Land</u>. These terms and conditions shall be perpetual, and it is the intention of the Commission and the permittee to bind all future owners and possessors of the subject property to the terms and conditions.

III. Special Conditions

1. Public Parking

. ÷

All parking in the Marina Green public parking lots and on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way shall be reserved for the use of the general public and shall be available for use on a first-come, first-served basis. There shall be no exclusive use of parking spaces or reserved parking spaces within the Marina Green public parking lots or on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way by any person or group other than the general public (handicapped spaces excluded).

2. <u>Metered Parking</u>

The metered parking system installed in the Marina Green public parking lots shall not allow persons to park their vehicles for more than two hours without returning to purchase additional time. However, the users of the public parking spaces in the Marina Green parking lots shall be permitted to use the metered parking spaces for at least four hours (if they keep paying the required fee for each two hour interval) before being required to vacate the parking space. Therefore, parking lot users must return to their vehicles and purchase additional time at two hour intervals. Any change in the time limits shall be submitted to the Executive Director to determine whether a permit amendment is required.

3. Parking Fees

By acceptance of this permit the City agrees that any increase in the approved parking fees which exceed 25% in any one-year period, or 50% in any three-year period, shall require an amendment to the Coastal Development Permit. The City shall submit any increase in the parking fees to the Executive Director to determine whether an amendment to this permit is necessary.

4. Parking & Traffic Association

The City, and all designated operators and managers of the affected parking supplies, shall participate in the Traffic and Parking Management Association established pursuant to the City of Long Beach certified Local Coastal Program as soon as such association is established [see certified LCP Downtown Shoreline Planned Development Plan (PD-6): General Development and Use Standard (b)6]. The City shall include the parking resources approved by this permit in the total parking resources addressed by the Traffic and Parking Management Association. The parking resources in the Marina Green public parking lots and on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way are required by this permit to be part of the total parking resources managed by the association.

5. Final Plans

Coastal Development Permit 5-98-042 permits between 189 and 245 new public parking spaces (with parking meters) on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way. Within ninety days of the establishment of the parking spaces the City shall submit final plans, for the review of the Executive Director, which show the exact number and location of public parking spaces provided on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way. The final plans shall be in substantial conformance with the conceptual plans submitted with this application and are attached to the March 19, 1998 staff report as Exhibit #3. Any deviation from the conceptual plans shall be submitted to the Executive Director to determine whether an amendment to this permit is necessary.

IV. Findings and Declarations

The Commission hereby finds and declares:

A. <u>Project Description</u>

Coastal Development Permit application 5-98-042 contains two proposals, both of which involve public parking and metered parking in the Downtown Shoreline area of Long Beach (Exhibit #1). The City of Long Beach is the applicant. The proposals are part of the City's overall plan to implement a consistent parking management plan in the Downtown Shoreline area.

In the first proposal, the City proposes to implement a metered parking system in the existing Marina Green public parking lots located in the Downtown

Shoreline area of Long Beach (Exhibit #2). The metered parking system, which will apply to 388 existing public parking spaces, will be implemented through the use of eight 6.5 foot tall receipt issuing computer panels placed in various locations in the parking lots. Users of the public parking lots will put their money or credit card into the computer, and they will be issued a receipt which allows them to park in the public lot for a specified amount of time. The receipt must be placed on the dashboard of the vehicle in order for the parking enforcement patrol to verify conformance with the metered parking system. The City proposes to charge a rate of one dollar for each thirty minutes of time purchased. Currently, there is no charge for parking in the Marina Green public parking lots. The Marina Green is a public park located next to the Downtown Long Beach Marina and the 1st Place Beach (Exhibit #4).

Secondly, the City proposes to install at least 189, and up to 245, new curbside public parking spaces in the right-of-way of Shoreline Drive, between Chestnut Avenue and Ocean Boulevard (Exhibits #2&3). The exact number of new parking spaces is not yet finalized as the City must allow for future bus stops and right turn lanes. Shoreline Drive has not had any legal curbside parking in the past. The recent widening of the street and the addition of several traffic signals to slow traffic has enabled the City to propose new curbside public parking. The proposed parking will increase the parking supply for the Queensway Bay development which commenced in 1995.

The proposed new curbside public parking spaces will be metered with conventional coin operated parking meters (one meter per parking space). The City proposes to charge a rate of one dollar for each thirty minutes of time purchased, with a limit of ninety minutes to discourage aquarium and convention center visitors (typically long-term parkers) from using the on-street public parking. The convention center and the aquarium have large parking reservoirs which charge a maximum of six to seven dollars for long-term (less than one day) parking.

The Marina Green park, its public parking lots, and the proposed curbside parking spaces on Shoreline Drive, are all situated on State tidelands which are administered by the City of Long Beach under the Long Beach Tidelands Trust Agreement. Because the site is located on State tidelands, it is within the Commission's area of original jurisdiction pursuant to Section 30519 of the Coastal Act. Any development located within the Commission's area of original jurisdiction requires a Coastal Development Permit from the Commission. No Local Coastal Development Permit is required from the City. The Commission's standard of review for the proposed project is the Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act. The certified LCP is advisory in nature and may provide guidance.

B. <u>Downtown Shoreline Area History</u>

As previously stated, the proposed project is located on State tidelands in the Downtown Shoreline area of Long Beach (Exhibit #2). The tidelands are administered by the City of Long Beach under the Long Beach Tidelands Trust Agreement with the State of California. The Chapter 138 line, the boundary between the privately owned upland properties and the public tideland areas in

the Downtown Shoreline area, is the former mean high tide line. The public tideland areas subject to the Long Beach Tidelands Trust Agreement are the filled areas which lie seaward of the Chapter 138 line. The Chapter 138 line runs roughly corresponds to the alignment of Seaside Way (Exhibit #2). The entire area of Long Beach's Downtown Shoreline south of the Seaside Way was once part of the natural ocean and beach.

The Downtown Shoreline area of Long Beach currently contains the Downtown Long Beach Marina, Marina Green Park, the Long Beach Convention and Entertainment Center, Hyatt Regency Hotel, Rainbow Lagoon Park, Shoreline Village shopping center, Shoreline Park, Rainbow Harbor, the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific, Catalina Landing, and a wetlands mitigation park located on the site of the former Golden Shore public boat launch (Exhibit #2). Until its demolition in 1979, the famous Pike amusement park was situated on the now land-locked beach in the Downtown Shoreline area.

All of the current Downtown Shoreline attractions are relatively new developments which have replaced much older uses which can now only be seen in historical photographs of Long Beach. The tidelands area upon which the Downtown Shoreline area is situated is comprised of fill which the City began depositing in the shoreline area in the 1920's.

In the early 1920's, the original Long Beach Municipal Auditorium was constructed on the beach and on twenty acres of landfill located south of today's intersection of Ocean and Long Beach Boulevards. After the construction of the auditorium, there were problems created by storms and coastal erosion in the area. In order to protect the auditorium from these problems, a horseshoe (rainbow) shaped breakwater was constructed around it. Because of its shape it was named "Rainbow Pier", even though it was actually a breakwater with a road constructed on top of it.

In the late 1940's, the City of Long Beach began filling in the water area enclosed by the Rainbow Pier breakwater creating additional public trust lands upon which a larger, more modern auditorium was constructed.

Filling of the shoreline area continued in the late 1950's and early 1960's with the Tidelands Filling Project. The landfill area was used as an informal recreation area until the late 1970's when the City began to improve the area. In 1975, the City began demolition of the original Long Beach Municipal Auditorium in order to begin construction of the Long Beach Convention and Entertainment Center, the Hyatt Regency Hotel, and Rainbow Lagoon and Park on the former site of the Rainbow Pier. In 1979, the Pike amusement park was officially closed and demolished.

The Commission approved several Coastal Development Permits in 1979 for the development of the Downtown Shoreline area created by the Tidelands Filling Project. The Tidelands Filling Project created the existing landfill upon which the modern Long Beach Convention and Entertainment Center, Shoreline Park, Shoreline Village, Hyatt Regency Hotel, and Rainbow Lagoon and Park are all located (Exhibit #2). The Marina Green and its parking lots are located on this filled area.

Coastal Development Permit P-79-5250 (City of Long Beach) was issued for the improvement of Marina Green Park with 145 public parking spaces. Coastal

. .

Development Permit P-79-5253 (City of Long Beach) was issued for the City's improvement of Shoreline Park and Lagoon. In 1979 the Commission also approved Coastal Development Permits P-79-5249, P-79-5251 and P-79-5252 (City of Long Beach) for the construction of the 1,694 slip Downtown Long Beach Marina, the Shoreline Village shopping center, and the 131 slip Downtown Harbor (a.k.a. Shoreline Village Marina or Pacific Terrace Harbor). These improvements were completed in the early 1980's and all of them continue to provide southern California area residents and visitors with many coastal related recreational activities.

[Note: Shoreline Park is currently closed for reconstruction as part of the Queensway Bay Plan-(See Coastal Development Permit 5-96-124). Shoreline Park will soon be restored to its former status as a region serving waterfront recreation area providing the public with many coastal related recreational activities. The park is scheduled to reopen to the public in June 1998.]

On August 12, 1994, the Commission approved Coastal Development Permit 5-94-127 (City of Long Beach) for the restriping of several parking lots in the Downtown Shoreline area. The Marina Green public parking lots were restriped in order to increase the number of originally approved coastal access parking spaces from 145 to the current number of 388 parking spaces. These 388 public parking spaces provide parking for visitors to the 1st Place Beach, the most eastern of the City's beaches, and the rest of the downtown waterfront (Exhibit #4).

The Queensway Bay Plan is the City's plan to create a major waterfront attraction in the Downtown Shoreline area of Long Beach to provide affordable recreation and entertainment for local residents and area visitors. On May 10, 1995, the Commission approved the City of Long Beach Local Coastal Program (LCP) amendment No. 1-95 incorporating the Queensway Bay Plan into the City's certified LCP. Two of the central components of the plan are the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific and Rainbow Harbor (formerly referred to as Queensway Bay Harbor).

On May 10, 1995, the Commission approved the first Coastal Development Permits for the implementation of the Queensway Bay Plan. Coastal Development Permit 5-95-055 (City of Long Beach) permitted the construction of the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific in Shoreline Park (Exhibit #2). The permit also approved the demolition of two ramps attached to the Queensway Bay Bridge, and the construction of two new signalized intersections on Shoreline Drive. A large section of Shoreline Drive was rebuilt and a new landscaped median has been installed to give the route more the look of a city street and less like a freeway. The Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific is currently nearing completion and is expected to open in June of 1998.

Coastal Development Permit 5-95-052 (City of Long Beach) permitted the construction of a recreational vehicle park in the Golden Shore area in the westernmost reaches of the Downtown Shoreline area (Exhibit #2). The Golden Shore Recreational Vehicle Park has been constructed and is currently operating on the State tidelands parcel located directly north of the now closed Golden Shore public boat launch.

Coastal Development Permit 5-96-124 (City of Long Beach), approved by the Commission on September 12, 1996, permits the construction of Rainbow Harbor

ŧ.,

and reconstruction of Shoreline Park (previously referred to as Queensway Bay Harbor and Riverfront Park) on site of the former Shoreline Park and Lagoon (Exhibit #2). Also approved by Coastal Development Permit 5-96-124 was the creation of a wetland habitat mitigation area on the site of the Golden Shore public boat launch (Exhibit #2). Rainbow Harbor is nearing completion and is scheduled to open as a tourist attraction this year.

More recently, on February 6, 1997, the Commission approved Coastal Development Permit 5-96-268 (City of Long Beach) for the construction of a five-level parking structure next to the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific on Shoreline Drive in the Downtown Shoreline area of Long Beach (Exhibit #3). The proposed structure will provide a 1,471 space parking reservoir to serve the parking needs of Rainbow Harbor, Shoreline Park, the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific, and other Downtown Shoreline area attractions proposed and approved under the Queensway Bay Plan.(Exhibit #2).

In regards to the City's future plans for the Downtown Shoreline area, the Queensway Bay Plan includes a proposal to convert four acres of public park area on the north side of Rainbow Harbor (between the parking structure and Shoreline Village) to privately financed commercial uses (Exhibit \sharp 2). The currently proposed curbside parking spaces on Shoreline Drive are part of the proposed plan to meet the parking demands of the proposed commercial uses.

The Queensway Bay Plan, as well as the certified LCP, require the that any conversion of public park area to commercial uses be accompanied by the provision of equivalent replacement parkland in the Queensway Bay area. In order to maintain the existing amount of public park area in the Queensway Bay area, the City has recently constructed a new public park area on the South Shore area of Queensway Bay near the Queen Mary. The Port of Long Beach issued the development permit for the new park next to the Queen Mary. The proposed commercial uses around Rainbow Harbor and the adequacy of the replacement parkland will be the subject of future Coastal Development Permit hearings before the Commission.

C. <u>Public Access/Parking</u>

The provision or lack of adequate parking affects the public's ability to access the coast. The Commission has consistently found that a direct relationship exists between the provision of adequate parking and availability of public access to the coast. Adequate parking facilities are necessary in order to assure continued public access to the popular recreational area on Long Beach's Downtown Shoreline. Section 30252 requires that new development should maintain and enhance public access to the coast by providing adequate parking facilities.

Section 30252 of the Coastal Act states, in part:

The location and amount of new development should maintain and enhance public access to the coast by... (4) providing adequate parking facilities or providing substitute means of serving the development with public transportation....

...

The proposed project will increase the parking supply and will not generate a parking demand of its own. The City's proposal to install at least 189, and up to 245, new curbside public parking spaces in the right-of-way of Shoreline Drive will improve the public's ability to access the coast by providing more public parking spaces than were previously located in the area.

The provision of at least 189 new curbside parking spaces will more than offset the loss of approximately sixty public parking spaces that were demolished during the reconstruction of Shoreline Park. Prior to 1996, Shoreline Park contained approximately 210 public parking spaces located in several designated parking areas and along the curbs of the park access road. When reconstructed, Shoreline Park will have its own 150 space public parking lot, sixty spaces less than it had prior to 1996. When the Commission approved Coastal Development Permit 5-96-124 for the construction of Rainbow Harbor and the reconstruction of Shoreline Park, the City stated that it would replace the lost sixty parking spaces on the right-of-way of Shoreline Drive. The current proposal will carry out the City's promise to replace all of the park's displaced parking spaces. Shoreline Drive has not had any legal curbside parking in the past.

The recent widening of Shoreline Drive and the addition of several traffic signals to slow traffic has enabled the City to propose the new curbside public parking. However, the exact number of new parking spaces is not yet finalized as the City must allow for future bus stops and right turn lanes. Coastal Development Permit 5-98-042 permits between 189 and 245 new public parking spaces (with parking meters) on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way. The City must provide the Commission with the final count of all new parking spaces on Shoreline Dive so that the correct number and location of all public parking spaces can be adequately documented for future reference.

Therefore, the permit is conditioned to require the City to submit final plans showing the exact number and location of public parking spaces provided on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way. The final plans shall be submitted within ninety days of the establishment of the parking spaces, and they shall be in substantial conformance with the conceptual plans submitted with this application and are attached to this staff report as Exhibit #3. Any deviation from the conceptual plans shall be submitted to the Executive Director to determine whether an amendment to this permit is necessary.

The part of the City's current proposal that could negatively impact the public's ability to access the coast is the installation of a metered parking system in place of public parking that has historically been free. In addition to the City placing parking meters on all the new parking spaces proposed on Shoreline Drive, the City also proposes to implement a metered parking system in the existing Marina Green public parking lots located in the Downtown Shoreline area of Long Beach (Exhibit #2).

The Marina Green metered parking system, which will apply to 388 existing free public parking spaces, will be implemented through the use of eight 6.5 foot tall receipt issuing computer panels placed in various locations in the parking lots. Users of the public parking lots will put their money or credit card into the computer, and they will be issued a receipt which allows them to park in the public lot for up a specified period of time. The receipt must be

٤.,

placed on the dashboard of the vehicle in order for the parking enforcement patrol to verify conformance with the metered parking system. The City proposes to charge a rate of one dollar for each thirty minutes of time purchased.

The metered parking proposal is part of the City's overall plan to implement a consistent parking management plan in the Downtown Shoreline area. The Downtown Shoreline area is currently undergoing a renaissance with the establishment of several new developments that will attract large numbers of people to the coast. The new developments include the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific, Rainbow Harbor, and the newly reconstructed Shoreline Park. Established uses in the area, like the Downtown Marina, the beach, Shoreline Village shopping center, and the Long Beach Convention Center, already attract large numbers of people to the area.

Several uncoordinated parking reservoirs provide parking for the existing uses and must also accommodate the additional demands of the new uses in the area. Shoreline Park and the 1st Place Beach each have their own metered parking lots for park and beach visitors. The Commission approved the parking meters in Shoreline Park as part of Coastal Development Permit 5-96-124 for the construction of Rainbow Harbor and the reconstruction of Shoreline Park. The Downtown Long Beach Marina has a parking reservoir of over 1,200 parking spaces which are available only to marina permit holders (boaters). The Long Beach Convention Center and the Hyatt Hotel have their own large parking reservoirs which charge a maximum of six to seven dollars for long-term (less than one day) parking (Exhibit #2).

The Downtown Shoreline area now has a brand new five-level, 1,471 space parking structure to serve the parking needs of Rainbow Harbor, Shoreline Park, the Long Beach Aquarium of the Pacific, and other Downtown Shoreline area attractions proposed and approved under the Queensway Bay Plan (Exhibit #2). The new parking structure will charge approximately six to seven dollars for long-term (less than one day) parking.

The Shoreline Village shopping center includes a 433 space public parking lot located just west of the Marina Green public parking lots. Users of the Shoreline Village parking lot must make a purchase to receive a parking validation, or they must pay a parking fee of up to six dollars.

Only the Marina Green public parking lots currently allow for free parking. Free public parking at the coast is very rare in Los Angeles and Orange Counties. Most City, County and State beaches in Southern California now charge by the hour for parking (various rates) or they charge a flat rate of approximately five to seven dollars for a day use parking permit.

The free parking in the Marina Green public parking lots is often used by Shoreline Village visitors and Convention Center visitors in order to avoid the fees charged in their parking lots. The Marina Green public parking lots provide the necessary parking for beach visitors, marina visitors and other coastal recreationists. The overuse of the Marina Green parking lots by Convention Center visitors and shoppers can reduce the public's ability to find a parking space for coastal access.

The City is attempting to bring about a more balanced use of the various parking reservoirs in the Downtown Shoreline through the management of the

parking fees. The implementation of a consistent parking fee system, along with time controls to separate long-term parkers from short-term parkers, will lead to a more efficient use of the parking supply during the periods of high demand which are expected in the near future.

The issue of parking rates for visitors is an important issue to address for their effect on public access to the coast. Past experience in the Downtown Shoreline area (see Coastal Development Permit 5-94-010 and amendments) has shown that discrepancies between parking rates in adjacent parking facilities can lead to competition for parking spaces between the visitors to the various attractions in the area. People will often drive around looking for the best parking deal when such discrepancies are known to exist. In the Downtown Shoreline area one can find a wide range of parking rates, from free to six dollars a day.

Competition for the free and lower cost parking spaces can result in the reduction of public access opportunities whenever the parking supply for one area or facility is filled-up, especially if it is filled-up with people visiting an entirely different facility of area. In order to protect and improve the public's ability to access this popular waterfront, it is important to have a coordinated parking management program for the Downtown Shoreline area.

Therefore, in order to protect the coastal access parking supply in the Marina Green public parking lots from being overburdened by other uses, it is necessary to implement a coordinated fee system for parking. Otherwise the free parking lots will be filled by people trying to avoid the pay lots which serve the convention center, the aquarium, and the commercial uses on the waterfront.

Protection of Public Parking

The public parking lots in the Marina Green, however, must be protected for public coastal access as they were originally intended pursuant to Coastal Development Permits P-79-5250, 5-94-127 and 5-94-010. The proposed parking on Shoreline Drive must also be protected for public use. Therefore, the permit contains several special conditions that are intended to protect the availability of the public parking spaces for use by coastal recreational visitors and the public in general. All of the parking spaces located south of the Chapter 138 Line, including all of the parking spaces subject to this permit, are located on State tidelands owned by the people of California (Exhibit #2).

A condition of the permit requires that all parking in the Marina Green public parking lots and on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way shall be reserved for the use of the general public and shall be available for use on a first-come, first-served basis. There shall be no exclusive use of parking spaces or reserved parking spaces within the Marina Green public parking lots or on the Shoreline Drive right-of-way by any person or group other than the general public (handicapped spaces excluded).

The requirement that all the parking spaces are public spaces, reserved for the use of the general public, and available for use on a first-come,

first-served basis is based upon the requirements of the Queensway Bay Plan and the certified LCP. The LCP requires that the parking supplies in the Downtown Shoreline, all of which are located on public tidelands, shall be available for use by the general public on a first-come, first-served basis. No parking may be reserved for the exclusive use of any tenant or development. These certified LCP parking policies enhance the public's ability to access the Downtown Shoreline area to use both the lower cost recreational facilities and the visitor-serving commercial uses.

5-98-042 Page 12

The certified LCP also requires the provision of adequate parking supplies to meet the parking demands of the development in the Downtown Shoreline area. Because all of the Downtown Shoreline area is located on public tidelands, the certified LCP parking policies encourage the use of shared parking and joint use parking arrangements to meet the total parking demands of the public and private visitor-serving and recreational facilities in the area. In addition, the certified LCP includes a provision to encourage the shared use of the parking supply in downtown Long Beach north of the Downtown Shoreline area and outside the coastal zone. The LCP also states that the public transportation system, including the Blue Line light-rail, Long Beach Transit, and free trams, are expected to reduce the demand for parking in the Downtown Shoreline area.

In order to carry out the public access policies of the Coastal Act, as well as the above stated certified LCP policies, the permit is conditioned to require that all parking shall be reserved for the use of the general public on a first-come, first-served basis. Only as conditioned is the proposed amendment consistent with the public access and recreation policies of the Coastal Act.

Parking Fees

The fees for parking can also negatively impact the public's ability to access the coast. Excessively high parking fees for coastal visitors will discourage lower-cost recreational uses in the area, especially if higher-end restaurants and commercial uses excuse customers from paying for parking with validations while beach goers and other recreationists are required to pay full price for parking.

Section 30213 of the Coastal Act states, in part:

Lower-cost visitor and recreational facilities shall be protected, encouraged, and, where feasible, provided. Developments providing public recreational opportunities are preferred...

Section 30213 of the Coastal Act requires the protection of lower cost visitor and recreational facilities. To be a lower cost recreational opportunity, the parking for access to the opportunity must also be lower cost. In order to protect public access to the coast, the parking supplies in the area must be available and affordable to the general public. The City proposes to charge a rate of one dollar for each thirty minutes of time purchased in the Marina Green and on Shoreline Drive. Currently, there is no charge for parking in the Marina Green public parking lots and no parking on Shoreline Drive.

Two hours (four dollars) will probably be the approximate length of the average short-term visit to the area. Longer-term parkers (less than one day) will pay six to seven dollars for a full day and evening of parking in the five-level parking structure or at the convention center. Four or more dollars (for two hours) may be too expensive to many of the area's economically disadvantaged citizens, but are within the range of prices commonly charged at other Los Angeles County and Orange County waterfront areas. Lower cost parking is available in downtown Long Beach about one-half mile north of the Downtown Shoreline area.

Any increase in fees above the proposed rates could have a negative affect on coastal access. Therefore, in order to allow the Commission to review any such impacts on coastal access in the future, the permit is conditioned to require that any increase in the approved parking fees which exceed 25% in any one-year period, or 50% in any three-year period, shall require an amendment to the Coastal Development Permit. The City shall submit any increase in the parking fees to the Executive Director to determine whether an amendment to this permit is necessary.

The above stated fee increase condition has been used on other Commission approved permits for parking fees in the Downtown Shoreline area. Coastal Development Permit 5-96-268 for the five-level parking structure and Coastal Development Permit 5-94-010-A2 for paid parking in the Shoreline Village public parking lot both have the same special condition which allows the Commission to review substantive fee increases. Only as conditioned is the proposed project consistent with the public access and recreation policies of the Coastal Act.

Traffic and Parking Management Association

. 4

The issue of parking rates is one important issue which affects public access to the coast. In the Downtown Shoreline area one can currently find a wide range of parking rates, from free to six dollars a day. Location of parking and convenience of use is another important coastal access issue. There are many different parking lots in the Downtown Shoreline area to choose from including Shoreline Village, Shoreline Park, the new five-level parking structure, and the Convention Center's lots. Competition for the free and lower cost parking spaces can result in the reduction of public access opportunities whenever the parking supply for one area or facility is filled-up, especially if it is filled-up with people visiting an entirely different facility of area. Therefore, in order to protect and improve the public's ability to access this popular waterfront, it is important to have a coordinated parking management program for the Downtown Shoreline area.

The City's Queensway Bay Plan anticipates the problems which could arise as a result of uncoordinated management of the Downtown Shoreline area's many parking facilities, all of which are located on public tidelands. The Queensway Bay Plan requires the formation of a traffic and parking management association to plan and monitor the joint use of public and private parking facilities in the Downtown Shoreline area. The traffic and parking management association will be charged with the implementation of specific parking management strategies and transportation demand management programs. The goal of the traffic and parking management program, according to the plan, will be

to provide adequate parking in a cost-effective manner while protecting public access to the coast. All development in the Downtown Shoreline area will be required by the City to join the traffic and parking management association. The association is now in the process of being established. It must be formed prior to commencement of development of commercial uses in LCP Subarea 5 and Subarea 6 west of Pine Avenue (the park area located on the north side of Rainbow Harbor west of Pine Avenue; Exhibit #2).

The Queensway Bay Plan, including the above stated requirement for the formation of a traffic and parking management association, has been incorporated into the certified City of Long Beach LCP. The Commission certified the Queensway Bay Plan when it approved LCP Amendment No. 1-95 on May 10, 1995.

An opportunity to further address the management of the Downtown Shoreline area's many parking facilities will be created with the formation of the traffic and parking management association called for in the LCP and the Queensway Bay Plan. The participants of the traffic and parking management association can determine the most appropriate parking rates for the area and standardize them in order to eliminate any large discrepancies. Although the association is just being formed, the current City proposal will already eliminate the largest discrepancy in parking fees by installing parking meters on all parking spaces in the area which are currently free.

The City itself, as the operator of the proposed parking and metered parking system, must be included in the traffic and parking management association in order to cooperate with the other developments in the Downtown Shoreline area. In order to ensure that the City of Long Beach and all designated operators and managers of the parking structure participate in the traffic and parking management association, they are required join it as a condition of approval.

The condition of approval requires that the City of Long Beach, and all designated operators and managers of the affected parking supplies, join the Downtown Shoreline area traffic and parking management association when it is formed to meet the requirements of the LCP. A Coastal Development Permit or amendment request must be submitted for Commission review and approval in order to implement any specific parking lot management strategies developed by the traffic and parking management association which may alter the parking fees and management practices that have previously been approved or required by the Commission. Only as conditioned to join the traffic and parking management association is the proposed project consistent with Section 30252 of the Coastal Act.

All future developments in the Downtown Shoreline area shall also be required to join and participate in the traffic and parking management association when it is formed. The City has estimated that the total cost of participants in the association should not exceed \$5,000 annually.

Metered Parking Control

As indicated earlier in this report, controls on time limits for parking may be used to separate the short-term parkers from the long-term parkers, and to

protect public parking for recreational visitors near the beach or park that they are visiting. The parking in the Marina Green primarily serves lower-cost recreational users of the park, beach and waterfront area. Specific parking reservoirs are provided for other uses in the area like the Convention Center, the aquarium, and the Shoreline Village shopping center. Special measures can be taken to encourage the users of the commercial and non-coastal dependant uses to use the specific parking supplies provided for those uses, while leaving more parking available near the beach and park for beach and park visitors. Such measures, which the Commission has previously required in the Shoreline Park parking lot, will help to preserve public parking for coastal access.

The proposed project includes the installation of a metered parking system in the Marina Green public parking lots. The City has proposed to eliminate all free parking in Marina Green Park to prevent Convention Center visitors and shoppers from using free Marina Green parking in order to avoid paying parking fees in the other parking lots.

Although all of the parking spaces in the Downtown Shoreline area are available for use by the general public, the Marina Green parking lots should primarily serve park users and beach visitors such as picnickers and fishermen who need better access to their vehicles while using the park. People visiting the Convention Center for a full day should not usurp parking in the Marina Green from coastal recreationists.

Because there may be a shortage of available parking spaces in the area during peak park use periods, public access to the coast may be reduced by the competition for parking spaces between the many uses in the area. Therefore, it is important that the proposed project does not reduce the public's ability to access the coast in this area. Measures must be taken to assure that the proposed metered parking spaces in the Marina Green public parking lots are not monopolized by Convention Center visitors at the expense of persons who wish to use the park and beach. Convention Center visitors use parking spaces primarily for storage of their vehicles while they are inside the Convention Center across the street. Park and beach users need the parking spaces near the park's grassy areas and children's play areas in order to have easy access to their food and recreational equipment. There also should be a higher turnover of parking space users in the park in order to make direct access to the park available to the greatest number of people.

Therefore, in order to ensure that the proposed project does reduce the public's ability to access the Marina Green Park and 1st Place Beach, approval of the permit is conditioned to require that the metered parking system installed in the Marina Green public parking lots shall not allow persons to park their vehicles for more than two hours without returning to purchase additional time. However, the users of the public parking spaces in the Marina Green parking lots shall be permitted to use the metered parking spaces for at least four hours (if they keep paying the required fee for each two hour interval) before being required to vacate the parking space. Therefore, parking lot users must return to their vehicles and purchase additional time at two hour intervals. Parking for longer than four hours may also be permitted.

The above stated condition is very similar to a condition that the Commission imposed on Coastal Development Permits 5-95-055 and 5-96-124 for parking meters in the Shoreline Park public parking lot in order to keep aquarium visitors from using parking spaces in the park while they are inside the aquarium. The Shoreline Park condition limited the maximum time that could be purchased to ninety minutes at a time, with a minimum of four hours parking allowed before being required to vacate a parking space.

The special condition gives priority for parking within Marina Green to the public who use the park and beach near the parking lot. The park and beach users will be better able to return to their vehicles each two hour interval to purchase additional time from the parking meter. The time limit will encourage longer-term parkers to use the public parking lots which have a flat rate maximum. It would be difficult for a person in the Convention Center to keep going outside to the Marina Green in order to purchase more time from the parking meter every two hours.

As conditioned, the approval of this permit will protect public access opportunities to Marina Green Park and the coast. Only as conditioned does the Commission find that the proposed project is consistent with the coastal access and recreation policies of the Coastal Act.

Finally, the proposed project will increase the amount of public parking in the Downtown Shoreline area and in doing so will increase opportunities for public access to the coast. Special conditions on the management of the metered parking will ensure that public parking is available for coastal access. Therefore, the Commission finds that the proposed project, as conditioned, will not negatively affect the public's ability to access the Downtown Shoreline area and the coast, and is consistent with the public access and recreation policies of the Coastal Act.

D. Local Coastal Program

The City of Long Beach Local Coastal Program was certified by the Commission on July 22, 1980. Because the project is located seaward of the former mean high tide line on state tidelands in an area of original jurisdiction retained by the Commission, the LCP is advisory in nature and may provide guidance. The standard of review for this project is the Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act.

In any case, the certified LCP provides guidance for development in the Downtown Shoreline area. The LCP contains no prohibition against paid parking or metered parking. The certified LCP also contains general policies which protect public access to the Downtown Shoreline area. The public access policies of the certified LCP, as discussed in the previous section, require the formation of a traffic and parking management association to plan and monitor the joint use of public and private parking facilities prior to commencement of development of commercial uses in the park area located on the north side of Rainbow Harbor west of Pine Avenue. The close proximity of the existing and proposed commercial uses and the area's existing and proposed recreational uses will likely result in competition for parking spaces.

Because the commercial uses will be located on public lands, the LCP requires that the parking supplies shall be available for use by the general public on a first-come, first-served basis. No parking may be reserved for the exclusive use of any tenant or development. These parking policies enhance the public's ability to access the downtown shoreline area to use both the lower cost recreational facilities and the visitor-serving commercial uses. The conditions of approval carry out these provisions of the certified LCP.

E. <u>California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)</u>

Section 13096 of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations requires Commission approval of Coastal Development Permits to be supported by a finding showing the permit, as conditioned, to be consistent with any applicable requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Section 21080.5(d)(2)(A) of CEQA prohibits a proposed development from being approved if there are feasible alternatives or feasible mitigation measures available which would substantially lessen any significant adverse effect which the activity may have on the environment.

The proposed project, as conditioned, has been found to be consistent with the Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act. All adverse impacts have been mitigated by conditions of approval and there are no feasible alternatives or feasible mitigation measures available which would substantially lessen any significant adverse impact which the activity may have on the environment. Therefore, the Commission finds that the proposed project can be found consistent with the requirements of the Coastal Act to conform to CEQA.

0461G:CP















