

CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

45 FREMONT, SUITE 2000
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2219
VOICE AND TDD (415) 904-5200
FAX (415) 904-5400

**RECORD PACKET COPY****W3**

TO: ALL COMMISSIONERS

FROM: PETER DOUGLAS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

SUBJECT: MINUTES OF MEETING OF NOVEMBER 13-17, 2000
Furama Hotel
8601 Lincoln Blvd.
Los Angeles

Monday, November 13, 2000 pages 1 to 5

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Monday, November 13, 2000, at 10:00 a.m. by Chairman Wan.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Wan, Vice Chairman Potter, Commissioners Daniels, Desser, Dettloff, (Alternate) Allgood, (Alternate) Krueger, Nava, (Alternate) Rose and Woolley. Absent: Dean, Hart, Sanders and Sweeney. Neal arrived at 10:10 a.m., and McClain-Hill arrived at noon.

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT**3. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATION.**

a. **Application No. 6-00-128 (Hatherill, San Diego)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Approved: There being no objection, Chairman Wan ruled that this administrative permit be issued by the Executive Director.

4. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** See items a through d on page 3 of the Meeting Notice. Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: There being no speakers, Kruer moved staff recommendation, seconded by Woolley, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

5. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Lee reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

6. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved four items (9d, e, g & j) to the Calendar, and recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Kruer, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

7. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs)**

a. **Carlsbad LCP Amendment 1-2000 B&C (Affordable housing & basement definition).** Staff recommended approval with suggested modifications.

Debbie Fountain, representing City of Carlsbad, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote to Reject part B of Implementation: Potter moved to reject B of the implementation amendment (affordable housing) as submitted, seconded by Dettloff, and the roll call vote was 3 in favor (Desser, Allgood & Wan) and 7 opposed. The motion failed so the amendment was **approved.**

Motion & Vote to Reject part C of Implementation: Rose moved to reject part C of the implementation amendment (basements) as submitted, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. The motion failed so the amendment was **approved.**

b. **Port Plan Amendment No. 27 (North Embarcadero Redevelopment).**
Postponed.

c. **San Diego LCP Amendment No. 3-2000 (Affordable Housing)**. Staff recommended approval with suggested modifications.

Betsy McCullough, representing City of San Diego, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Myles Pomeroy, representing City of San Diego, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Susan Baldwin, representing San Diego Association of Governments, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Timothy O'Connell, representing Century Homes, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Brad Wiblin, representing Bridge Housing, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Joanne Pearson, representing S.D. Sierra Club, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation with modification. Mark Massara spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote to Reject Implementation: Nava moved to reject the implementation amendment as submitted, seconded by Allgood, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 1 opposed (Kruer). **Passed.**

Motion & Vote on Implementation with Modifications: Nava moved approval of the implementation with suggested modifications, seconded by Allgood, and Chairman Wan substituted the previous roll call vote (9-1). **Passed.**

McClain-Hill arrived before the next item.

d. **San Diego Centre City LCP Amendment No. 4-2000 (Centre City) Time Extension**. Staff recommended approval.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Desser, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

8. **NEW APPEAL.**

a. **Appeal No. A-6-00-86 (Encinitas soccer park)** **Postponed.**

9. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

a. **Application No. 6-00-38 (SANDAG beach replenishment)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Rob Rundle, representing San Diego Association of Governments, spoke in favor of the project. Mayor Dick Lyon, representing City of Oceanside, spoke in favor of the project. Cami Mattson, representing San Diego North Convention & Visitors Bureau, spoke in favor of the project. Todd T. Cardiff, representing Surfrider Foundation-San Diego Chapter, spoke in favor of the project. Marco Gonzalez, representing Surfrider Foundation, spoke in favor of the project. Steve Aceti, representing CA Coastal Coalition, spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Krueer moved staff recommendation, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

Neal left the meeting at 12:15 p.m. during the previous item.

b. **Application No. 6-00-54 (Encinitas soccer park) Postponed.**

c. **Application No. 6-00-57 (AT&T Wireless, San Diego Co.) Withdrawn.**

d. **Application No. 6-00-58 (AT&T Wireless, San Diego Co.)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

e. **Application No. 6-00-59 (AT&T Wireless, San Diego Co.)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

f. **Application No. 6-00-61 (Blake, Del Mar)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Tom Blake spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Woolley, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

g. **Application No. 6-00-100 (AT&T Wireless, Encinitas)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.** _____

h. **Application No. 6-00-110 (San Diego road improvements)** **Postponed.** _____

i. **Application No. 6-00-127 (Lord, San Diego)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Jeff Field, representing the applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Jim Kessel, representing Blue Sea Lodge, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Allgood moved staff recommendation, seconded by Woolley, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.** _____

j. **Application No. 6-00-143 (San Diego riparian enhancement)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.** _____

PUBLIC STATEMENTS. Norbert H. Dall said that the public couldn't participate effectively if staff reports are not distributed in advance of the meetings. _____

RECESS. The Commission recessed for the day at 12:30 p.m..

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Tuesday, November 14, 2000, at 11:05 a.m. by Chairman Wan.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Wan, Commissioners Dean, Desser, Dettloff, (Alternate) Allgood, Hart, McClain-Hill, Nava, Neal, (Alternate) Rose and Sweeney. Absent: Kehoe, Potter and Sanders. Daniels arrived at 11:10 a.m., and Woolley arrived during the lunch break.

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT

3. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** See items a & b on page 7 of the Meeting Notice. Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: Desser moved staff recommendation, seconded by Nava, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES and WATER QUALITY

4. **CONTAMINATED SEDIMENTS TASK FORCE WORKSHOP.** Dennis Dickerson representing LARWQCB, Maile Gee representing CCC, Dean Smith representing County of Los Angeles, Michael Lyons representing LARWQCB, Doland Cheung representing Army Corps of Engineers, and Mark Gold representing Heal the Bay discussed management of contaminated dredged material in the Los Angeles area.

PUBLIC STATEMENTS. John Davis wanted an investigation of hydrogen sulfides detected in Marina del Rey. Sabrina Venskaskas, representing Ballona Wetlands Land Trust, spoke about purchase of parcel C. John Davis, representing Coalition to Save the Marina, also spoke about review of the Marina del Rey LCP. Bruce Darian submitted a request to speak.

LUNCH RECESS. The Commission recessed for lunch at 12:15 and returned at 1:35 p.m. after closed session. Woolley arrived during the break.

REPORT of CLOSED SESSION. In closed session the Commission took action on Smiley v. CCC, et al..

5. **ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES and WATER QUALITY REPORT.** Deputy Director Kooser reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and status of offshore oil & gas exploration & development.

a. **Guadalupe Oil Field Remediation Status Report.** Informational only.

6. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATION.**

a. **Application No. E-00-14 (SCE, SDG&E, Anaheim & Riverside, San Diego Co.)**
Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Mike Hertel, representing SCE, spoke in favor of the project. Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club, spoke in opposition to the project. Stephanie Dorey, representing Re-Store the Shore, spoke in opposition to the project. Norbert H. Dall spoke in opposition to the project. Donna Varner spoke in favor of the project. Douglas Korthof spoke in opposition to the project. Lyn Harris Hicks, representing GUARD, spoke in opposition to the project. Lee Steelman, representing GUARD, spoke in opposition to the project. Eva Riley, representing GUARD, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Marilyn O'Brien, representing GUARD, spoke in opposition to the project. Wendy Morris, representing Guard, spoke in opposition to the project. Richard Redfield, representing GUARD, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Donis Davey, representing Guard, spoke in opposition to the project. Steve Netherby spoke in opposition to the project. John Davis spoke in opposition to the project.

Motion & Vote to Continue: Allgood moved to continue the hearing, seconded by Nava, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

7. **SONGS Status.** Informational only.

Nichols replaced Sweeney at 2:35 p.m..

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT

8. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Lee reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

9. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved items 12g & i to the Calendar, and recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: Dettloff moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

10. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

a. **Port of Long Beach Plan Amendment No. 15. Postponed.**

b. **Laguna Beach LCP Amendment No. 1-2000 (Downtown Area) Time Extension.** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & Vote: Allgood moved staff recommendation, seconded by Rose, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

c. **Manhattan Beach LCP Amendment No. 2-2000 (signs code).** Staff recommended approval with suggested modifications.

Bill Victor spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote to Reject Part of Implementation: McClain-Hill moved to reject part A (signs) of the implementation amendment as submitted, seconded by Daniels, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

Motion & Vote on Implementation with Modifications: McClain-Hill moved approval of the implementation with suggested modifications, seconded by Daniels, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

Motion & Vote to Reject Part of Implementation: McClain-Hill moved to reject part B (condominiums) of the implementation amendment as submitted, seconded by Daniels, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. The motion failed so the amendment was **approved.**

d. **Redondo Beach Plan Amendment No. 1-2000 (General plan update).** **Postponed.**

e. **Venice Plan (City of Los Angeles).** Staff recommended approval with suggested modifications as modified orally.

Ruth Galanter, representing City of Los Angeles, spoke in favor of the LCP. Betsy Weisman, representing City of Los Angeles Planning Dept., spoke in favor of the staff recommendation with modifications. Steven H. Kaufmann, representing Ballona Lagoon Marine Preserve, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Darryl DuFay, representing Venice Canals Association, requested visual protection. Diane Bush spoke in opposition to the project. Plinio Garcia, representing MPNA, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Esther Rydell, Sandra Hagan & Maurico Cortez all submitted requests to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Lowell Safier, representing Marina Peninsula Assoc./Coalition to Save the Marina, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. John Davis, representing Coalition to Save the Marina, spoke in favor of continuance. Babak Naficy spoke in favor of continuance. Teresa Zintgraff Youhanane spoke in opposition to the bikepath extension. Hal Amens spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Lynda Halpin, representing Marina Peninsula Neighborhood Assoc., submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Chuck Almdale, representing Santa Monica Bay Audubon Society, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Steven Robiner spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Sean Harrison, representing Marina Peninsula Neighborhood Assoc., submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Boston Dawna spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Kelly Doyle spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Pat Kandel & Patrick Crane both submitted requests to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Douglas Korthof spoke in opposition to the project. K. C. Mancebo & David DeLange, PhD, submitted requests to speak in opposition to the project. Barbara Lee Walker, representing Marina Penn., spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Sandy Elstar spoke in opposition to the project. Irv Bush spoke in opposition to the project. Sabrina Venskus submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote on Plan as Submitted: Daniels moved approval of the Land Use Plan Amendment as submitted, seconded by McClain-Hill, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Failed.**

Motion & Vote on Plan with Modifications: McClain-Hill moved approval of the Land Use Plan Amendment with suggested modifications, seconded by Daniels, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

11. **NEW APPEALS.**

a. **Appeal No. A-5-00-183 (Thompson, Laguna Beach)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Stephen Ball spoke in opposition to the project. Edward Finkbeiner spoke in opposition to the project. Christle Balvin spoke in opposition to the project. Holly Semler spoke in opposition to the project. Gwan Kim, representing Crescent Bay Inn, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Kay Erb submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Maria Rogan spoke in opposition to the project. Morris Skenderian, architect for the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Scott W. Thompson, the applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Desser moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill, and the roll call vote was 7 in favor and 2 opposed (Desser & Allgood). **Passed.**

b. **Appeal No. A-5-00-184 (Thompson, Laguna Beach)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

The hearing was combined with item a above.

Motion & Vote: Desser moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill, and Chairman Wan substituted the previous roll call vote (7-2). **Passed.**

c. **Appeal No. A-5-00-296 (Rancho Palos Verdes, beach and bluff park)**
Postponed.

d. **Appeal No. A-5-00-417 (Playa Vista Capital, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended continuance. There being no objection Chairman Wan opened the hearing, and **continued** it to a future meeting. John Davis, representing Coalition to Save the Marina Inc. & Doug Korthof spoke.

e. **Appeal No. A-5-00-421 (Carl, Rancho Palos Verdes)** **Withdrawn.**

12. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.

a. **Application No. 5-00-34 (McKinley & Bass, San Clemente)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Alan Block, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Michael McKinley, an applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Bill Hart spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mark Cabirean, representing Surfrider Foundation; Lyn Harris Hicks, representing GUARD; and Wendy Morris all submitted requests to speak.

Motion: Desser moved staff recommendation, seconded by Allgood.

Amending Motion & Vote: Allgood moved to delete texturization and require reports on landscaping after 5 & 10 years, seconded by Nava, and the roll call vote was 9 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

Vote on Main Motion: Chairman Wan substituted the previous roll call vote (9-0) for approval of the main motion as amended above. **Passed.**

b. **Application No. 5-00-192 (Blumenthal, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions as modified orally.

Susan Hori, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Mel Blumenthal submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Allgood moved staff recommendation, seconded by Dettloff, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

c. **Application No. 5-00-223 (Smith, Laguna Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Bill Smith submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Donna Olsen & Blair Ballard, representing the applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Desser moved staff recommendation, seconded by Rose, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

d. **Application No. 5-00-261 (Pearson, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Sandy Pearson spoke in favor of the project. David Skelly, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. John Morgan, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote to Continue: Nava moved to continue the hearing, seconded by Rose, and the roll call vote was 5 in favor and 4 opposed (Desser, Dettloff, Hart & McClain-Hill). **Passed.**

e. **Application No. 5-00-262 (Puntoriero, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

John Morgan, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Allgood moved staff recommendation, seconded by Nava, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

f. **Application No. 5-00-285 (Collins, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

John Morgan, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Rose moved staff recommendation, seconded by Allgood, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

g. **Application No. 5-00-375 (Miller, Los Angeles)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

Nichols left at 8:05 p.m., during the following item.

h. **Application No. 5-00-384 (Caltrans, Port of Los Angeles)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Karl Price, representing CalTrans, spoke in favor of the project. Roella H. Louie, representing City of L.A. Cultural Affairs Dept., spoke in favor of the project. Chip Israel, representing Lighting Design Alliance spoke in favor of the project. Julie Reeves, representing Lighting Design Alliance, spoke in favor of the project. Chuck Taylor, representing Senator Betty Karnette, spoke in favor of the project. Mary Lou Echternach, representing Assemblymember Alan Lowenthal, spoke in favor of the

project. Eric Moses, representing Mayor Richard Riordan, spoke in favor of the project. Irene Mendoza, representing Councilmember Rudy Svorinich, Jr., spoke in favor of the project. John M. Olguin, representing Vincent Thomas Bridge Com., spoke in favor of the project. Louis Dominguez, representing Vincent Thomas Bridge Lighting Comm., spoke in favor of the project. Carol Rugnetta, representing Vincent Thomas Bridge Lighting Comm., spoke in favor of the project. Arlene C. Zimmer, representing Vincent Thomas Bridge Lighting Committee, spoke in favor of the project. Jerry Gaines spoke in favor of the project. Tiffany Fine spoke in favor of the project. Marie Ritter spoke in favor of the project. John M. Wilson, representing L.A. Harbor Commission, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. James Cross, representing San Pedro Chamber of Commerce, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Mary Jo Walker submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Dr Travis Longcore, representing the Urban Wildlands Group, spoke in opposition to the project. Ann Cantrell, representing El Dorado Audubon, spoke in opposition to the project. William Whiddon, representing South Bay Astronomical Society, spoke in opposition to the project. Prof. Steven Morris, representing Physics & Astronomy Dept's, L.A. Harbor College, spoke in opposition to the project. Joseph H. Fierstein, representing Int'l Dark Sky Assn. & So. Bay Astronomical Soc., spoke in opposition to the project. Frederick W. Weber Jr. submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Marcia Hanscom, representing Wetlands Action Network, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Catherine Rich, representing the Urban Wildlands Group, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Robert van de Hoek, representing Sierra Club, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Adrea Stoker, representing Surfrider, Los Cerritos Wetlands Taskforce, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Nina Whiddon submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Ronald Renne, representing South Bay Astronomical Society, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Laverne Booth, representing International Dark-Sky Assoc. Los Angeles Section, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Douglas Korthof spoke in opposition to the project. John Davis, representing Coalition to Save the Marina, submitted a request to speak.

Motion: Daniels moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill.

Amending Motion & Vote: Nava moved to require monitoring of environmental impacts, seconded by Allgood, and the roll call vote was 3 in favor (Desser, Nava & Rose) and 9 opposed. **Failed.**

Amending Motion & Vote: Daniels moved to require monitoring prior to request for amendment, seconded by McClain-Hill, and the roll call vote was 5 in favor and 4 opposed (Desser, Allgood, Nava & Rose). **Passed.**

Vote on Main Motion: The roll call vote, on the main motion, as amended above, was 5 in favor and 4 opposed (Desser, Allgood, Nava & Rose). **Passed.**

i. **Application No. 5-00-397 (Hickey, Los Angeles)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

j. **Application No. 5-00-96 (L.A. Co. Beaches & Harbors, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions as modified orally.

Dean Smith, representing L.A. County, spoke in favor of the project. Greg Reid, representing L.A. County Dep. of Beaches & Harbor, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Alan Redhead, representing Gladstones Restaurant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Rose moved staff recommendation, seconded by Allgood, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

k. **Application No. 5-00-420 (Collins, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

John Morgan, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote: Allgood moved staff recommendation, seconded by Nava, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

13. FINDINGS.

a. **Application No. 5-99-28 (Palisades Bay Club, Los Angeles)** **Postponed.**

RECESS. The Commission recessed for the day at 9:45 p.m..

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Wednesday, November 15, 2000, at 9:05 a.m. by Chairman Wan.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Wan, Vice Chairman Potter, Commissioners Dean, Desser, Dettloff, (Alternate) Allgood, Hart, (Alternate) Kruer, Nava, Neal, Nichols and Reilly. Absent: McClain-Hill and Sanders. Daniels arrived at 9:15 a.m., and Woolley arrived at 10:30 a.m..

CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

3. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATION.

a. **Application No. 3-00-75 (Watterworth, San Luis Obispo Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special condition.

Approved: There being no objection, Chairman Wan ruled that this administrative permit be issued by the Executive Director.

STATEWIDE

Desser left the meeting at 12:10, during the following item.

4. CALIFORNIA COASTAL MANAGEMENT PROGRAM WORKSHOP. Informational only.

William Boyd & Rod Meade, representing CSAC, League of Cities & 13 other State associations, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Seven other speakers submitted requests to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation: Rikki Alberson, representing Calif. Building Industry Assoc.; Jeff Brinton, representing statewide associations; Nancy Burt, representing CSAC, League of Cities; Leonard Frank, representing Calif. Bus. Property Association; Jerry Livingston, representing Cal Building Industry Association; David C. Smith, representing Building Industry Legal Defense Foundation; and James Whalen, representing Alliance for Habitat Conservation. Ellen Stern Harris, representing Fund for the Environment, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Alan Sieroty spoke about the history of coastal legislation. Tom Livengood, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica, spoke in opposition to diluting the Coastal Act. Joseph R. Blum, representing NOAA-Fisheries, spoke about role of NMFS in

HCP-IT permits. Kathleen Kunysz, representing Metropolitan Water District of So. California, requested the matter be handled differently. Tom Story, representing City of San Diego, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Stephanie Dall spoke. Norbert Dall spoke. Robert Asher, representing County of San Diego, submitted a letter. Janet Fairbanks, representing San Diego Association of Governments, spoke about plan. Ruth Gerson, representing REC, submitted a request to speak. Joan Jackson, representing League for Coastal Protection, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Kate Neiswender, representing Senate Cte on Natural Resources, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Eileen Murphy submitted a request to speak. Dan Silver, representing Endangered Habitat League, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Vern Goehring, representing Calif. Native Plant Society, spoke. Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club, submitted a request to speak. Bill Yeates, representing Planning & Conservation League, spoke. Bill Allayaud, representing Sierra Club Calif., spoke. Susan Jordan, representing LCP, spoke. Nancy Donaven submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Travis Longcore, representing the Urban Wildlands Group, spoke. Cindy Burrascano, representing San Diego Chapter CA Native Plant Society, spoke. Flossie Horgan, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, spoke. Linda Moon, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica, spoke. Mel Nutter, representing League for Coastal Protection, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Joey Racano spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Inez Yoder, representing Canyons Network, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Isabelle Kay spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Gordon Hensley, representing EDC, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Allison Rolfe, representing San Diego Bay Council, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Joanne Pearson, representing San Diego Sierra Club, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Marcia Hanscom, representing Wetlands Action Network/Sierra Club Wetlands Con., spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Tanya Gulesserian, representing Environmental Defense Center, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Doug Korthof spoke. Teresa T. Young spoke. Greg Sotir spoke. Dr Suzanne De Beneditis, representing concerned citizens for the environment, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Rex Frankel, representing Ballona Ecosystem Education Project, spoke in favor of the project. Leslie Purcell spoke. Three other speakers submitted requests to speak: Jonathan Aurthur; Mark Gold, representing Heal the Bay; and Robert F. Kevane.

Nichols left at 4:15 during the previous item.

LUNCH RECESS. The Commission recessed for lunch at 12:55 and returned at 1:45 p.m..

5. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** Reilly moved approval of the minutes of October 2000, seconded by Woolley, and unanimously **approved**.

6. **COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS.** On Friday, Hart reported on Port San Luis request for a Conservancy grant.

a. **Budget Sub-Committee** was unanimously re-appointed and gave a status report.

7. **CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.

8. **SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.

9. **DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL'S REPORT.** Informational only, on Friday.

10. **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Informational only.

CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

11. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Grove reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

a. **Carmel-by-the-Sea LCP Status Report.** Staff presented options for processing future demolition applications.

Mayor Sue McCloud, representing City of Carmel, spoke. Richard Guillen & Brian Roseth, both representing City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, submitted a request to speak. Anthony Lombardo spoke in favor of the City LCP. Brian Finegan spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club & Carmel Residents Assoc., spoke.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved to continue processing demolition permits as public hearings, with regular reports on LCP status until April 2001, seconded by Kruer, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

Daniels left the meeting at 5:15, during the previous item.

12. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved items 15i & j to the Calendar, and recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Woolley, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

13. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM (LCP).**

a. **San Luis Obispo Co. LCP Amendment No. 2-00 (Avila Beach Plan).** Staff recommended approval.

Peg Pinard, Chair of County of San Luis Obispo, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Vic Holanda, Director of San Luis Obispo County Planning Dept., spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Motion & Vote on Plan as Submitted: Hart moved approval of the Land Use Plan Amendment as submitted, seconded by Kruer, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

14. **NEW APPEALS.**

a. **Appeal No. A-3-00-119 (Todd, San Luis Obispo Co.)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised substantial issue. There being no objection, Chairman Wan ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue**. The applicant requested a continuance. Chairman Wan opened the hearing on the merits of the project, **and continued** it to a future meeting.

b. **Appeal No. A-3-00-130 (Kasulka, San Luis Obispo Co.)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Vern Kalshan, representing the appellants, spoke in opposition to the project. Don L. Anderson spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Bruce Koontz, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Kruer moved staff recommendation, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

c. **Appeal No. A-3-00-147 (Rhein, Monterey Co.)** Staff recommended continuance. There being no objection, Chairman Wan opened the hearing and **continued** it to a future meeting.

15. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

a. **Appeal No. A-3-99-82 (Tri W, Morro Bay)** **Postponed.**

b. **Application No. 3-00-90 (Mandurrago & Mission St. Properties, Carmel) Postponed.**

c. **Application No. 3-00-93 (Shellooe, Carmel) Postponed.**

d. **Application No. 3-00-101 (Stewart, Carmel) Postponed.**

e. **Application No. 3-00-104 (Ingle, Carmel) Postponed.**

f. **Application No. 3-00-107 (Tipton, Carmel) Postponed.**

g. **Application No. 3-00-115 (Dority, Carmel) Postponed.**

h. **Application No. 3-00-120 (Martin, Carmel) Postponed.**

i. **Application No. 3-00-133 (Becom, Pacific Grove) Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. Approved.**

j. **Application No. 3-00-138 (Martin, Pacific Grove) Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. Approved.**

16. **PERMIT EXTENSION.**

a. **Permit No. A-4-89-134-E7 (Tri-W, Morro Bay) Postponed.**

NORTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

17. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Scholl reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

18. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar). None.**

19. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM (LCP).**

a. **San Mateo Co. LCP Amendment No. 3-00 (Mid-Coast Design and Surface Mining) Time Extension.** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Allgood, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

b. **Sonoma Co. LCP Amendment No. 2-99 (General Plan consistency).** **Withdrawn.**

20. **NEW APPEAL.**

a. **Appeal No. A-2-00-34 (Mickelsen, San Mateo Co.)** **Postponed.**

21. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATION.**

a. **Application No. 2-00-19 (San Mateo Co. Harbor Dist.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions as modified orally.

Randy Mason spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote: Allgood moved staff recommendation, seconded by Krueer, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

REPORT of CLOSED SESSION. In closed session the Commission took action on CCC v. Furmanski, et al.; Rust Trust, et al. v. CCC; Morro Bay Mini Storage, Inc. v. CCC; Bolsa Chica Land Trust, et al. v CCC (RPI, The Robert Mayer Trust et al.); and the matter of Permit Application Nos. A-5-00-28 & 5-00-147 (Getty Trust).

RECESS. The Commission recessed for the day at 6:15 p.m..

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Thursday, November 16, 2000, at 9:05 a.m. by Chairman Wan.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Wan, Vice Chairman Potter, Commissioners Daniels, Dean, (Alternate) Soto, Dettloff, Hart, (Alternate) Kruer, Nava, Neal, Reilly, Sanders and Woolley. Absent: None. Estolano and McClain-Hill arrived at 9:15 a.m., and Nichols arrived at 9:45 a.m..

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

3. CONSENT CALENDAR.

a. **Application No. 4-00-227 (Santa Barbara Waterfront Dept.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Motion & Vote: Reilly moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

4. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Damm reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

5. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 7 items (7c, 7e, 7f, 7h, 7i, 7k & 8d) to the Calendar, and recommended approval with special conditions.

7f) There being more than 3 votes to remove it, this item was returned to the public hearing calendar below.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation on the remainder of the Calendar, seconded by Reilly, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

6. **NEW APPEAL.**

a. **Appeal No A-4-00-172 (Suncal, Oxnard)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised substantial issue. There being no objection, Chairman Wan ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue**. Chairman Wan opened the hearing on the merits of the project **and continued** it to a future meeting.

7. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS:**

a. **Application No. 4-95-105 (Higgins, Malibu)** Staff recommended partial approval with special conditions.

Don Schmitz, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Donald Kousalewsky, representing the applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Paula Yankopoulos spoke in opposition to the project.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Nava, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

b. **Application No. 4-99-29 (Cornfield et al., Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions as modified in addendum.

Steve Besbeck, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Stephanie Abronson, representing Santa Monica Trails Council & Mountains Restoration Trust, spoke in favor of the project. Richard A. Brandewie spoke in favor of the project with new condition.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

c. **Application No. 4-00-87 (Sheldon & Berger, Malibu)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

d. **Application No. 4-00-122 (Bell, Malibu)** **Postponed.**

e. **Application No. 4-00-124 (Mednick, Malibu)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

f. **Application No. 4-00-139 (Malibu Cove Colony Property Owners, Malibu)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Lynn Heacox spoke in favor of the project. Emily L. Harlow spoke about impacts on her property.

Motion & Vote: Woolley moved staff recommendation, seconded by Daniels, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

g. **Application No. 4-00-151 (Yardley, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended denial.

J. Nelson Yardley spoke in favor of the project. Cary Gepner, representing the applicants, spoke in favor of the project. Gail Yardley spoke in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote to Continue: Potter moved to continue the hearing, seconded by Daniels, and the roll call vote was 8 in favor and 4 opposed (Estolano, Hart, Kruer & McClain-Hill). **Passed.**

h. **Application No. 4-00-167 (Santa Barbara Waterfront Dept.)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

i. **Application No. 4-00-199 (Carpinteria sand berm)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

j. **Application No. 4-00-205 (Santa Barbara Co., Atascadero Cr. maintenance)** Staff recommended approval with special conditions.

Tom Fayram, representing Santa Barbara County Flood Control, spoke in favor of the project. Carl Chyberger & Larry Fosset were available for questions.

Motion & Vote: Potter moved staff recommendation, seconded by Kruer, and the roll call vote was 12 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

k. **Application No. 4-00-206 (Santa Barbara Co., Goleta Slough)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

8. PERMIT AMENDMENTS.

a. **Permit No. 4-96-25-A3 (Jason, Los Angeles Co.)** Staff recommended approval with one new special condition.

Mark Jason spoke in favor of the project. Scott Moores, representing the applicant, spoke in favor of the project. Terry Valente, representing the applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project. Kay Austen, representing Tuna United Neighborhood Assoc., spoke in opposition to the project. Sabine Lesavoy, representing T.U.N.A., submitted a request to speak in opposition to the project. Vince Scipioni spoke in opposition to the project.

Motion & Vote: Kruer moved staff recommendation, seconded by McClain-Hill, and the roll call vote was 10 in favor and 2 opposed (Woolley & Wan). **Passed.**

b. **Permit No. 4-97-31-A (Zucker, Malibu)** **Postponed.**

c. **Permit No. 4-99-133-A (Clarfield, Malibu)** **Immaterial.**

d. **Permit No. 4-00-1029-A3 (Antseliovich, Malibu)** Moved to expanded Consent Calendar. **Approved.**

PUBLIC STATEMENTS. John Davis wanted to communicate via zip disks, and requested a field trip to Marina del Rey. Mark Massara praised the Santa Barbara Surfrider newsletter. Doug Korthof wanted to eliminate travel for short hearings.

LUNCH RECESS. The Commission recessed for lunch at 12:15 and reconvened at 12:55 p.m..

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT

9. LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM (LCP).

a. **Bolsa Chica LCP (County of Orange).** Staff recommended approval with suggested modifications as modified orally.

Jack Golden, County Counsel, requested postponement. There being no motion to continue, Chairman Wan opened the hearing. Jack Golden, County Counsel, representing County of Orange, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation.

Lucy Dunn, representing Hearthside Homes, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Cindy Starrett, representing Hearthside Homes, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Tom Mathews, representing County of Orange, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation.

Richard Jacobs, representing Ocean View School District, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Supervisor Jim Silva representing Orange County Supervisors spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Harriett Wider spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Dave Sullivan spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Ralph Bauer, Huntington Beach City Council member, spoke in favor of the project. Peter Green spoke in favor of the project. Debbie Cook, HB Councilwoman-elect, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Patricia Campbell, Mayor of City of Seal Beach, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Ron Metzler, representing Shea Homes, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Shawn Zovod, representing McCutchen, Doyle Brown & Enersen, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Betty Jo Woollett, representing Orange County Realtors, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Nancy Burt, representing Woolley Group, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Gary Petersen, representing Environmental Problem Solving Ent., spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Adrienne Morrison, representing Bolsa Chica Conservancy, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Julie Jiménez, representing Hearth Side, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Darrell Bass, representing Hearthside Homes, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Lucille De Mon submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Mary Jo Jeffes spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Geri LaPlante, representing Hearthside, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Pat Davis spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Dick White, representing Hearthside Homes, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. David Piper spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Sue Marguarite submitted a request to speak. Colette Stoddard submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Marie Slovacek submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Mary Ann Barbara, representing Hearthside Homes, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Chuck Barbara submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Barbara Baker submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Audrey M. Hart, representing Hearthside, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. David Smith, representing BIA of Southern Calif., spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Art Aviles, representing Californians, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Sandra Ward spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Jim McLaughlin spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Carole Ann Wall, representing Bolsa Chica Alliance, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Pat Downey, representing Bolsa Chica Alliance, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Peggy Freeman, representing Hearthside Homes, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Kristy Selleck, representing Bolsa Chica Alliance, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Domenic Iorfino,

representing Bolsa Chica Alliance, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Joyce Riddell, representing Huntington Beach Chamber of Commerce, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Corrie Broussard spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Cindy Cross spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Reed Royalty, representing Orange County Taxpayers Association, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. George Cross spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Carl Lawrence, representing Bolsa Chica Alliance, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Mike Sciutto spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Sandra Sciutto spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Casey Estrada spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Ernest Bartolo spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. John Erskine spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Richard Hill Adams spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Shirley C. Long spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Frank Williams spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Robert S. Zemel II, representing California Young Americans for Freedom, submitted a request to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation. Brad White spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Robert W. Sulnick, representing Environmental Problem Solving Enterprise, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Wendy Flotow spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Lloyd Skaggs spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Joel Thurwachter, representing IUOE Local 12, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. John V. Ibarra, representing IUOE Local 12, spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Eric Smalstig spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. Richard Harlow spoke in opposition to the staff recommendation. The following speakers submitted requests to speak in opposition to the staff recommendation: Fred Ameri; Walter Baider; Rod Edwards representing IUOE Local; Abdur-Rahim Hampel representing Black Contractors Assoc.; Darin M. Henry; Mark Hoover; Jon Johnson; Pat Kapp; Billie Kennedy representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Daniel B. Rego, representing Cal YAF; and David C. Smith.

Cathy Keane spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Roger West, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Vi & Scott Cowden, representing BCLT, submitted requests to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Lillian Robles, representing Juaneño, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Robert Leon, representing Chumash, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Aaron Sloan, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Glenna Touhey, representing BCLT, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Evan Henry, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Connie Boardman, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Jan Vander Sloot, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Ed Howard, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Linda Moon, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. David Carlberg, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Terry A. Dolton, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mel Nutter,

representing League for Coastal Protection, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Susan Jordan, representing League for Coastal Protection, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mark Massara, representing Sierra Club Coastal Program, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Matthew T. Bivens, representing Wetland & Mesa Rainbows, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Ruth Cherico, representing Ballona Wetlands Land Trust, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Carl Zichella submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Marcia Hanscom, representing Wetlands Action Network, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Lynnette Gaynor, representing Cerritos College, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Chuck Pitman submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Gary Brown, representing Orange County Coastkeeper, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Doug Korthof spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Rob Drury submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Ian Baillie submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Joy Zedler submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Gene Mathiowetz submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Anna Valcarcel spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Toby Derbyshire submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Chauncey Alexander, representing Democratic Club of West Orange County, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Judith A. Lewis, representing League of Women Voters of Orange Coast, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Geeta Sacred Song spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Lynn Reeves submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Laura D. Zahn, representing F.O.R.C.E., spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Barbara Boskovich spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Jacqueline Dickson, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Sandra Genis spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Conrad Housley submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Joey Racano spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mary Stamponess submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Vince Costa spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Dr Gary Herbertson, representing North American Coalition on Religion & Ecology, and Southern California Ecumenical Council, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mark Rauscher, representing Surfrider Foundation, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Linda Harmon spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Mary K. Antonelli spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Steve Ray spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Elaine Tubini, representing BCLT, submitted a request to speak in favor of the staff recommendation. Joel Sheldon spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

The following speakers submitted requests to speak in favor of the staff recommendation: Raymond Mille Aguilar, representing Juaneno Band of Mission Indians; Michael R. Alvarez, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Paul Arms; Charlene Bauer, representing League of Women Voters; Virginia Whipple, representing League of Women Voters; Clair De Beauvoir; Virginia Bickford; James Bieber; James Blomquist; Dr Peter Bowler; Anja Garwick, representing BCLT; Betty Combs, representing Bolsa

Chica Land Trust; John Davis, representing Coalition to Save the Marina; Rick Davitt; Cassandra DuBourdieu, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Janet Frumhoff, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Caroline Fuelling, representing BCLT; Marinka Horack, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Flossie Horgan, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Paul Horgan, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Edward F. Hughes, representing Bolsa Ch. Land Trust; Jules Kerker; Stan Krutsick, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Dick Le Grue, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Dr Patricia Martz; Nancy Donaven, representing BCLT; Don May, representing California Earth Corps; Jane McCloughlin, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica; Karen Merickel, representing BCLT; Marge Allen, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Barbara Morel, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Eileen Murphy, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Larry Porter; Rebecca Roberts, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Jim Robins, representing Amigos de Bolsa Chica; Michelle Savin, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust; Dr Allan Schoenherr; Ted Dowding, representing BCLT; Ken Settle; Aaron Sloan, representing Bolsa Chica Land Trust & Sierra Club; Andy Valcárcel; Lee Whittenberg, Director of Development, City of Seal Beach; Donald Wilkie; Grace Winchell, representing BCLT; and Robert Winchell.

Motion & Vote on Plan as Submitted: Dettloff moved approval of the Land Use Plan Amendment as submitted, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Failed.**

Motion & Vote on Plan with Modifications: Dettloff moved approval of the Land Use Plan Amendment with suggested modifications, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

Motion & Vote to Reject Implementation: Dettloff moved to reject the implementation amendment as submitted, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan substituted the previous roll call vote (12-0). **Passed.**

Motion & Vote on Implementation with Modifications: Dettloff moved approval of the implementation with suggested modifications, seconded by Potter, and Chairman Wan ruled that the vote was unanimous. **Passed.**

RECESS. The Commission recessed for the day at 7:50 p.m..

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order on Friday, November 17, 2000, at 9:00 a.m. by Chairman Wan.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chairman Wan, Vice Chairman Potter, Commissioners Daniels, Dettloff, Hart, Nava, Reilly and Woolley. Absent: Dean, Dessler, Kehoe, Neal, Sanders and Sweeney. McClain-Hill and Estolano arrived at 9:10 a.m..

NORTH COAST DISTRICT

3. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Deputy Director Scholl reported on matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.
4. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.
5. **NEW APPEAL.**
 - a. **Appeal No. A-1-00-43 (Williams Communications, Mendocino Co.)** Staff recommended that the appeal raised substantial issue. There being 3 votes to hear testimony on substantial issue, Chairman Wan opened the hearing on substantial issue.

Julie Verran, representing Redwood Chapter Sierra Club, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation. Dan Flemming, representing Williams Communications, spoke in favor of the project. Howard Coleman, Bill Pfanner & Diana Parks, all representing Williams Communications, submitted requests to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote on No Substantial Issue: Reilly moved to find no substantial issue, seconded by Woolley, and the roll call vote was 1 in favor (Estolano) and 9 opposed. **Failed.**

Chairman Wan opened the hearing on the merits of the project and continued it to a future meeting.

6. **FINDINGS.**

a. **Permit No. 1-83-223-A (Webber, Mendocino Co.) Postponed.**

b. **Application No. 1-99-8 (Wages Creek Campground, Mendocino Co.)** Staff recommended approval of findings.

Motion & Vote: Woolley moved staff recommendation, seconded by Dettloff, and the hand vote was 8 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

c. **Application No. 1-99-63 (Fish & Game, Humboldt Co.)** Staff recommended approval of findings.

Motion & Vote: Woolley moved staff recommendation, seconded by Estolano, and the hand vote was 7 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

STATEWIDE

7. **FEDERAL CONSISTENCY REPORT.** Deputy Director Damm reported on Negative Determinations issued by the federal consistency staff, and status of non-energy federal consistency matters.

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

8. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

a. **Application No. 4-99-192 (Mariposa Land, Malibu) Postponed.**

b. **Application No. 4-00-21 (Herzig, Malibu)** Staff recommended denial.

Susan McCabe, representing the applicant, submitted a request to speak in favor of the project.

Motion & Vote to Continue: McClain-Hill moved to continue the hearing, seconded by Reilly, and the hand vote was 10 in favor and 0 opposed. **Passed.**

ADJOURNMENT. There being no old or new business, the meeting adjourned at 10:20 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

PETER M. DOUGLAS
Executive Director

pmg

Draft

