CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST AREA 89 SOUTH CALIFORNIA ST., SUITE 200 VENTURA, CA 93001 (805) 585-1800





DATE: August 22, 2013

TO: Commissioners and Interested Parties

FROM: Charles Lester, Executive Director

John Ainsworth, Senior Deputy Director Deanna Christensen, Coastal Program Analyst

SUBJECT: City of Oxnard LCP Amendment No. OXN-MAJ-1-12 (Seabridge School

Use): Executive Director's determination that action by the City of Oxnard, acknowledging receipt, acceptance, and agreement with the Commission's certification with suggested modifications is legally adequate. This determination will be reported to the Commission at the September 11, 2013 meeting in Eureka.

On March 7, 2013, the Commission approved Local Coastal Program (LCP) Amendment No. OXN-MAJ-1-12 with suggested modifications. The subject amendment dealt with adding schools as an allowable use within the Coastal Planned Community/Mandalay Bay Specific Plan zone of the certified LCP.

On June 4, 2013, the City Council adopted Resolution Nos. 14,345, 14,344, 14,343 and Ordinance No. 2868 (attached) acknowledging receipt of the Commission's certification of LCP Amendment No. OXN-MAJ-1-12 and accepting and agreeing to all modifications suggested by the Commission. The document was transmitted to Commission staff on July 15, 2013.

Pursuant to Section 13544 of the California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Division 5.5, the Executive Director must determine that the action taken by the City of Oxnard acknowledging receipt and acceptance of, and agreement with, the Commission's certification of the above referenced LCP amendment with suggested modifications is legally adequate and report that determination to the Commission. The certification shall become effective unless a majority of the Commissioners present object to the Executive Director's determination.

I have reviewed the City's acknowledgement and acceptance of, and agreement with the terms and suggested modifications of LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12, as certified by the Commission on March 7, 2013, as contained in the adopted Resolution Nos. 14,345, 14,344, 14,343 and Ordinance No. 2868 of June 4, 2013, and find that the City's action and notification procedures for appealable development are legally adequate to satisfy the terms and requirements of the Commission's certification. I therefore recommend that the Commission concur in this determination.

CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF OXNARD

RESOLUTION NO. 14,345

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF OXNARD ACKNOWLEDGING RECEIPT OF THE CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION (COMMISSION) CERTIFICATION OF COASTAL LAND USE PLAN (LCP) AMENDMENT OXN-MAJ-1-12 WITH MODIFICATIONS, ACCEPTING AND AGREEING TO SAID MODIFICATIONS, AND AGREEING TO ISSUE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMITS FOR THE LCP AREA, FILED BY DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT, PLANNING DIVISION, 214 SOUTH C STREET, OXNARD, CALIFORNIA, 93030.

- WHEREAS, on October 15, 2009, the City Council, after a public hearing and consideration of the recommendation of the Planning Commission, of the City of Oxnard approved and adopted amendments to the Oxnard LCP, Mandalay Bay Specific Plan, and Coastal Planned Community (CPC) zone to allow a school land use within the CPC Zone; and
- WHEREAS, in accordance with Section 30514 of the California Public Resource Code, a certified LCP and all local implementing ordinances, regulations, and other actions may be amended by the appropriate local government, but no such amendment shall take effect until it has been certified by the Commission; and
- WHEREAS, the Oxnard LCP, Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan, and Coastal Planned Community (CPC) zone amendments were forwarded to the Commission for certification and were together designated by the Commission as LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission considered and approved LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Planning Manager received correspondence dated March 20, 2013 from the Executive Director of the Commission notifying the City of Oxnard that LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 was certified by the Commission at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission modified the three components of LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 compared to the original submittals by the Oxnard City Council; and
- WHEREAS, Section 13544 of the Commission's Administrative Regulations states that the Commission's certification shall not be deemed final until the local government body takes the following actions:
 - 1. Acknowledges receipt of the Commission's resolution of certification including suggested modifications,
 - 2. Accepts and agrees to the modifications and takes formal action to satisfy the modifications, and

- 3. Agrees to issue coastal development permits for the LCP area; and
- WHEREAS, the City Council hereby acknowledges receipt of the Commission's resolution of certification including suggested modifications; and
- WHEREAS, the City Council has amended the CPC zone text consistent with the Commission's modifications by approving the first reading by title only and subsequent adoption of an ordinance amending City Code Section 17-15(C), amending Policy 45.f of the Oxnard LCP by amending Resolution 13,744 consistent with the Commission's modifications, and amending the Mandalay Phase IV Specific Plan by amending Resolution 13,745 consistent with the Commission's modifications; and
- WHEREAS, the City Council agrees to issue coastal development permits for the Oxnard LCP area; and
- WHEREAS, the documents and other materials that constitute the record of proceedings regarding LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 are located in the Planning Division of the City of Oxnard, and the custodian of the record is the Planning Manager.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the City Council has complied with the requests of the Executive Director of the Commission related to certification of LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 and directs the Planning Manager to, following adoption of the ordinance amending City Code Section 17-15(C), transmit documentation related to the actions stated herein to the Commission Executive Director in a timely manner.

PASSED AND ADOPTED by the City Council of the City of Oxnard on this 4th of June, 2013 by the following vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Flynn, Ramirez, MacDonald and Padilla.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: None.

Tim Flynn, Mayor

ATTEST:

Daniel Martinez, City Clerk

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF OXNARD

RESOLUTION NO. 14,344

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL AMENDING RESOLUTION NO. 13,745 TO IMPLEMENT CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION (COMMISSION) RECOMMENDED CHANGES PURSUANT TO COMMISSION CERTIFICATION OF LOCAL COASTAL PLAN (LCP) AMENDMENT OXN-MAJ-1-12. FILED BY DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT, PLANNING DIVISION, 214 SOUTH C STREET, OXNARD, CALIFORNIA, 93030.

- WHEREAS, on October 15, 2009, the City Council, after a public hearing and consideration of the recommendation of the Planning Commission, of the City of Oxnard approved an amendment to Section III B of the Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan relating to allowing school use as a permitted use within the Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan area; and
- WHEREAS, in accordance with Section 30514 of the California Public Resource Code, a certified LCP and all local implementing ordinances, regulations, and other actions may be amended by the appropriate local government, but no such amendment shall take effect until it has been certified by the Commission; and
- WHEREAS, the Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan amendment was forwarded to the Commission for certification and was designated by the Commission as a component of LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission considered and approved LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Planning Manager received correspondence dated March 20, 2013 from the Executive Director of the Commission notifying the City of Oxnard that LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 was certified by the Commission at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission modified the Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan amendment compared to the original submittals by the Oxnard City Council; and
- WHEREAS, the City Council finds after due study and deliberation that the public interest and general welfare require the adoption of the Commission modifications to the Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan previously approved by Resolution No. 13,745; and
- WHEREAS, amendments to Resolution No. 13,745 are shown by <u>underline</u> for added text and <u>strikethrough</u> for deleted text.

NOW, THEREFORE, the City Council of the City of Oxnard hereby resolves as follows:

Part 1. Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan, Section III, Land Use Program, B. Description of Uses, set forth in Resolution No. 13,745, is hereby amended to read as follows:

"The Local Coastal Program Phase III Zoning Regulations establishes on this project site the CPC, "Coastal Planned Community," sub-zone "to assure orderly development of a large scale mixed-use planned development...". Under the CPC sub-zone numerous permitted and conditionally permitted uses will be allowed subject to the adoption of a specific plan for the entire 220-acre site. This zoning regulation further states that these uses shall be only those allowed in the R-W-1, R-W-2, R-2-C, R-3-C, CNC, CVC, and RC coastal sub-zones established in the Coastal Zoning Ordinance, with the addition of school uses. In addition, a public elementary school facility may be a conditionally permitted use subject to the provisions of this Specific Plan and of the Oxnard Coastal Land Use Plan and Coastal Zoning Ordinance. This Specific Plan assumes that these coastal zoning regulations will be adopted in their current general form, and therefore meet these general land use requirements (with the inclusion of mixed-use as previously stated).

Mixed Use (Residential and Commercial): Mixed-use will be considered as an appropriate land use, containing Neighborhood or Visitor Serving support commercial uses within the same complex or structure with residential uses.

School use is limited to the construction, maintenance, and operation of a public elementary school facility, in conjunction with public access and recreational components, located on the approximately 8.79-acre property (APN 188-0-250-015) on the south side of Wooley Road between Tradewinds Drive and Seabridge Lane. Approval of any school use shall be conditioned upon the school use being limited to only that portion of the 8.79-acre property that was approved for mixed-use (residential/commercial) pursuant to CDP A-4-OXN-03-014, with the remainder of the property required to be dedicated to the City of Oxnard and developed with an approximately 2.5 acre public waterfront park, as well as public accessways around perimeter of the entire property. In addition to the other applicable requirements of this specific plan, any school use on the property is also subject to specific urban-rural buffer provisions contained Section VI of this plan. The school use must satisfy the following minimum requirements:

a) Landscaped public accessways shall be provided parallel to the northern and eastern property boundaries in order to connect to existing public accessways, and shall be consistent with the type, size, and extent of the existing public accessways in the vicinity. The required public access improvements shall be constructed and made available to the public prior to the occupancy of any school development on the property.

- b) The public park shall be developed with public recreational amenities, including, but not limited to, picnic tables, benches, tot lot/playground, drinking fountains, landscaping, parking, and restroom. The public park area shall not be fenced or otherwise restricted, to allow for unimpeded public access. The public park may be used jointly by the school, as long as public access is not restricted.
- c) Designated public parking shall be provided to serve the public's use of the park and accessways. Public parking shall be sited and designed to be easily accessible from Wooley Road and as compact as feasible to provide adequate public access parking while also preserving as much area as possible for public park use.
- d) The public park, parking, and accessways shall be restricted to public access and public recreation uses and shall be dedicated in fee interest to the City of Oxnard for recreational use and public access. The property owner shall be required to execute and record a document, in a form and content acceptable to the City, dedicating to the City of Oxnard a fee interest in the required public park, parking, and public accessway areas for the express purpose of public recreational use and public access. The recorded document shall include legal descriptions of both the entire project site and the area of dedication. The document shall be recorded free of prior liens and any other encumbrances which the City of Oxnard determines may affect the interest being conveyed.
- e) The required public park, parking, and public access improvements shall be constructed and made available to the public prior to the occupancy of any school development on the property.
- f) If fencing is required for safety purposes along the waterfront, fencing may be placed between the existing public accessway and the water if it is visually permeable, no more than 4 feet in height, and compatible with the character of the area.
- g) Signage shall be provided that identifies the public park, public accessways, and public parking areas. Such signage shall be adequate to ensure that members of the public can easily identify the available public access and recreation opportunities.
- h) School facility fencing and landscaping shall be sensitively designed and visually compatible with the character of the area and adjacent land uses and public access areas. School facility fencing shall be setback at least 15 feet from the northern edge of the existing waterfront public accessway. Landscaping and public waterfront-viewing benches shall be provided within the 15 foot setback area.
- i) The school's Multi-Purpose Room shall be joint-use, in the sense that it must be made available to the community after school hours, subject to reservation. The

- school's Multi-Purpose Room shall have an area designated for a coastal-related art and/or education exhibit.
- j) The new school shall add a coastal-themed environmental education component to its curriculum."
- Part 2. Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan, Section IV, Urban/Rural Buffer, set forth in Resolution No. 13,745, is hereby amended to read as follows:

"As required by the Coastal Land Use Plan, this Specific Plan includes a significant buffer zone along the entire northern most property line and the extension of Wooley Road, to protect and to separate the adjacent farmland to the north from the proposed urban uses and to protect the future Mandalay Bay development from the activities associated with agricultural production.

The agricultural buffer for the northern portion of the Mandalay development shall include at least 200 feet in width (north to south) of parking lot along the length of the development as depicted in Specific Plan Map (page 2). The parking buffer area shall be legally restricted in perpetuity by the appropriate legal instrument (i.e. deed restriction, easement, dedication, etc.) and shall be held and maintained as such by the developer, land owner(s), or appropriate third party.

The following agricultural buffer provisions shall apply to any school use on the approximately 8.79-acre property (APN 188-0-250-015) located on the south side of Wooley Road between Tradewinds Drive and Seabridge Lane:

- (a) Siting and design alternatives shall be considered in order to maximize the width of the agricultural buffer area to the maximum extent feasible in order to effectively minimize conflicts between agricultural and school uses and to avoid future conversion of existing agricultural land uses due to potential land use conflicts. In no case shall the agricultural buffer be less than 200 feet in width. The agricultural buffer shall incorporate vegetative and other physical barriers and shall be permanently protected (i.e. by deed restriction, easement, or fee dedication) as required by a condition of approval and implemented prior to issuance of a coastal development permit in order to minimize potential land use conflicts. Buildings, parks, or play areas are prohibited within the buffer area, however, parking areas may be allowed.
- (b) The most current version of the "Agricultural/Urban Buffer Policy Guidelines", prepared by the Ventura County Agricultural Commissioner shall be followed, to the maximum extent feasible, to avoid potential land use conflicts with the adjacent agricultural uses, including but not limited to, creation and

implementation of a written agreement between the project proponent and the adjacent agricultural operator(s) regarding the timing and conditions for the application of pesticides, herbicides, and/or fertilizers by either ground-based or aerial spraying application methods.

- (c) As a condition of approval, the entity developing and operating a school (e.g. school district) shall be required, prior to issuance of a coastal development permit, to provide the City with an executed written agreement that describes the property where the school will be authorized and which states the following:
 - The undersigned do hereby acknowledge and agree: (a) that the property described herein (the "Property") is adjacent to land utilized and/or designated for agricultural purposes; (b) that students, staff, or other users of the Property may be subject to inconvenience or discomfort or other adverse effects arising from adjacent agricultural operations including, but not limited to, dust, smoke, noise, odors, fumes, grazing, insects, application of chemical herbicides, pesticides, fertilizers, and operation of machinery; (c) that users of the Property accept such inconveniences, discomforts and/or other adverse effects from normal necessary farm operations as an integral part of occupying property adjacent to agricultural uses; and (d) to assume the risks of inconveniences, discomforts, and/or other adverse effects to themselves and any users of the Property from such agricultural use in connection with this permitted development. It is understood that the City has required an agricultural setback on the herein described Property to separate agricultural parcels and non-agricultural uses to help mitigate, but not necessarily completely alleviate, these conflicts.
- (d) As a condition of approval, the entity developing and operating a school (e.g. school district) shall be required to provide annual notification to all school staff and parents/guardians of students enrolled at the school with information regarding the school's proximity to land utilized and designated for agricultural purposes, what agricultural herbicide, pesticide, or fertilizer products are expected to be applied on the adjacent agricultural land in the upcoming year, opportunity to receive additional notification of individual applications at least 72 hours prior to applications, and any other information the Superintendent deems necessary."

PASSED AND ADOPTED by the City Council of the City of Oxnard on this 4thdayof June, 2013 by the following vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Flynn, Ramirez, MacDonald and Padilla.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: None.

Tim Flynn, Mayor

ATTEST:

Daniel Martinez, City Clerk

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF OXNARD

RESOLUTION NO. 14,343

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL AMENDING RESOLUTION NO. 13,744 TO IMPLEMENT CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION (COMMISSION) RECOMMENDED CHANGES PURSUANT TO COMMISSION CERTIFICATION OF LOCAL COASTAL PLAN (LCP) AMENDMENT OXN-MAJ-1-12. FILED BY DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT, PLANNING DIVISION, 214 SOUTH C STREET, OXNARD, CALIFORNIA, 93030.

- WHEREAS, on October 15, 2009, the City Council, after a public hearing and consideration of the recommendation of the Planning Commission, of the City of Oxnard approved an amendment to Oxnard Local Coastal Plan (LCP) Policy 45 relating to allowing school use as a permitted use within the Mandalay Bay Phase IV Specific Plan area; and
- WHEREAS, in accordance with Section 30514 of the California Public Resource Code, a certified LCP and all local implementing ordinances, regulations, and other actions may be amended by the appropriate local government, but no such amendment shall take effect until it has been certified by the Commission; and
- WHEREAS, the LCP Policy 45 amendment was forwarded to the Commission for certification and was designated by the Commission as a component of LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission considered and approved LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Planning Manager received correspondence dated March 20, 2013 from the Executive Director of the Commission notifying the City of Oxnard that LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 was certified by the Commission at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission modified the LCP Policy 45 amendment compared to the original submittals by the Oxnard City Council; and
- WHEREAS, the City Council finds after due study and deliberation that the public interest and general welfare require the adoption of the Commission modifications to the LCP Policy 45 previously approved by Resolution No. 13,744; and
- WHEREAS, amendments to Resolution No. 13,744 are shown by <u>underline</u> for added text and <u>strikethrough</u>-for deleted text.

NOW, THEREFORE, the City Council of the City of Oxnard hereby resolves that subsection f. of Policy 45, set forth in Resolution No. 13,744, is amended to read as follows:

- "f. Land uses shall consist of a mix of visitor-serving commercial, school, residential and public recreational areas oriented to an expansion of the existing Inland Waterway. The visitor-serving commercial, public recreation and open water shall comprise at least 50 percent of the overall project area. At least 12.5 percent of the total project area shall be public recreation areas and at least 12.5 percent of the total project area shall be visitor-serving commercial. Water area shall comprise the remaining 50 percent of the visitor-serving commercial and public recreation area.
- Total Project Site: 220 acres (100 percent)
- Area required for visitor-serving commercial, public recreation and open water: 110 acres (50 percent)
- Area for residential development: 110 acres (50 percent)

BREAKDOWN OF PUBLIC AND VISITOR SERVING AREAS

Element	Minimum Acreage	Percent of Public Area	Percent of Total Project
Visitor-serving Commercial	110.0	100	50
Public Recreation and Open			
Water			
a. Visitor-serving Commercial	27.5	25	12.5
b. Public Recreation	27.5 ¹	25	12.5
c. Open Water ²	55.0	50	25.0

School(s) to be counted in either the residential development category.

School use is limited to the construction, maintenance, and operation of a public elementary school facility, in conjunction with public access and recreational components, located on the approximately 8.79-acre property (APN 188-0-250-015) on the south side of Wooley Road between Tradewinds Drive and Seabridge Lane. Approval of any school use shall be conditioned upon the school use being limited to only that portion of the 8.79-acre property that was approved for mixed-use (residential/commercial) pursuant to CDP A-4-OXN-03-014, with the remainder of the property required to be dedicated to the City of Oxnard and developed with an approximately 2.5 acre public waterfront park, as well as public accessways around perimeter of the entire property.

¹ Must all be on land

² Up to 10 percent of open water may be devoted to public marinas or boat slips available to the public

The public park shall be developed with public recreational amenities, including, but not limited to, picnic tables, benches, tot lot/playground, drinking fountains, landscaping, parking, and restroom. The public park area shall not be fenced or otherwise restricted, to allow for unimpeded public access at all times. The public park may be used jointly by the school, as long as public access is not restricted."

PASSED AND ADOPTED by the City Council of the City of Oxnard on this 4th day of June, 2013 by the following vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Flynn, Ramirez, MacDonald and Padilla.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: None.

Tim Flynn, Mayo

ATTEST:

Daniel Martinez, City Clerk

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF OXNARD

ORDINANCE NO. 2868

ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF OXNARD AMENDING SECTION 17-15(C) OF THE CITY CODE TO IMPLEMENT CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION (COMMISSION) RECOMMENDED CHANGES PURSUANT TO COMMISSION CERTIFICATION OF LOCAL COASTAL PLAN (LCP) AMENDMENT OXN-MAJ-1-12. FILED BY DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT, PLANNING DIVISION, 214 SOUTH C STREET, OXNARD, CALIFORNIA, 93030.

- WHEREAS, on October 15, 2009, after a public hearing and consideration of the recommendation of the Planning Commission, the City Council of the City of Oxnard approved and adopted Ordinance 2816 to amend the Coastal Planned Community (CPC) zone to allow a school land use within the CPC Zone; and
- WHEREAS, in accordance with Section 30514 of the California Public Resource Code, a certified LCP and all local implementing ordinances, regulations, and other actions may be amended by the appropriate local government, but no such amendment shall take effect until it has been certified by the Commission; and
- WHEREAS, the Coastal Planned Community (CPC) zone amendment was forwarded to the Commission for certification and was designated by the Commission as a component of LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission considered and approved LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Planning Manager received correspondence dated March 20, 2013 from the Executive Director of the Commission notifying the City of Oxnard that LCP Amendment OXN-MAJ-1-12 was certified by the Commission at its meeting of March 7, 2013; and
- WHEREAS, the Commission modified the CPC Zone amendment compared to the original submittals by the Oxnard City Council; and
- WHEREAS, the City Council finds after due study and deliberation that the public interest and general welfare require the adoption of the Commission modifications to the CPC Zone (OCC §17-15(C)) previously approved by Ordinance 2816; and
- WHEREAS, amendments to Section 17-15(C) of the City Code are shown with underlined text.

Ordinance No. 2868 June 4, 2013

NOW, THEREFORE, the City Council of the City of Oxnard does ordain as follows:

Part 1. Subdivision (C) of Section 17-15 of the Oxnard City Code is hereby amended to read as follows:

"(C) Other uses, coastal development permit or development review required - Residential, visitor-serving commercial, school, and public passive and active recreation uses may be permitted subject to the adoption of a specific plan for the planned unit development which shall establish the development pattern for the project site. Permitted and conditionally permitted uses shall then be allowed subject to the provisions of the Oxnard coastal land use plan and the general provisions of this chapter. Permitted and conditionally permitted uses shall be only those allowed in the R-W-1, R-W-2, R-2-C, R-3-C, CNC, CVC and RC zones. In addition, a public elementary school facility may be a conditionally permitted use subject to the development standards and provisions of the CNC sub-zone and the Mandalay Bay Specific Plan."

Part 2. Within fifteen days after passage, the City Clerk shall cause this ordinance to be published one time in a newspaper of general circulation within the City. Ordinance No. 2868 was first read on <u>June 4</u>, 2013, and finally adopted on <u>June 18</u>, 2013.

AYES: Councilmembers Flynn, Ramirez, Macdonald and Padilla.

NOES: Councilmember Perello.

ABSENT: None.

Tim Flynn, Mayor

ATTEST:

Daniel Martinez, City Clerk

APPROVED AS TO FORM: