CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION SAN DIEGO AREA

575 METROPOLITAN DRIVE, SUITE 103 SAN DIEGO, CA 92108-4421 (619) 767-2370



W12b

Filed:	4/16/15
180th Day:	10/16/15
Staff:	R. Casswell - SD
Staff Report:	4/21//15
Hearing Date:	5/13/15 -5/15/15

STAFF REPORT: REGULAR CALENDAR

Application No.:	6-14-1930
Applicant:	Mark Oliver
Location:	4541 Cove Drive, Carlsbad, San Diego County. (APN: 270-150-73)
Project Description:	Construction of a new 3,185 square foot single- family home with attached 723 square foot garage and 320 square foot covered patio, and associated landscaping, on a vacant 4,680 square foot lot, located on Bristol Cove of Agua Hedionda Lagoon.
Staff Recommendation:	Approval with Conditions

SUMMARY OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The proposed project will involve construction of a new 3,185 square foot single-family home with attached 723 square foot garage and 320 square foot covered patio, and associated landscaping, on a vacant 4,680 square foot lot. The subject site is located on the north side of Cove Drive, and abuts Bristol Cove on the north shore of Agua

Hedionda Lagoon. The primary residence is proposed to extend up to 32 feet in height, at its highest point, with the main roofline being 28 ½ feet in height. A 31 ½ foot setback between an attached patio cover and the mean high tide line (MHTL) is proposed, and would be consistent with adjacent development patterns along Bristol Cove's shoreline. The subject lot has previously been graded, so no grading is proposed as part of this project.

Staff is recommending approval of the proposed project with **three special conditions**. Since the project abuts Bristol Cove, an approximately 800-foot long, 50-foot wide, private cove that runs northwest from Agua Hedionda Lagoon's north shore, the proposed development has the potential to adversely impact runoff/water quality, visual resources, and public access. <u>Special Condition No. 1</u> requires that final plans shall undertake development in accordance with the approved plans, submitted on April 16, 2015, in order to maintain appropriate setbacks between the proposed new development and the shoreline. <u>Special Condition No. 2</u> requires final landscape plans to conform with the approved plans submitted on March 19, 2015, to ensure the onsite installation of drought-tolerant native or non-invasive vegetation only; and to require the applicant to provide a landscape monitoring report five years from the date of Commission approval. <u>Special Condition No. 3</u> requires that final drainage plans that conform with the approved plans submitted on March 19, 2015, be provided to avoid runoff associated with the new development from entering the lagoon.

Commission staff recommends **approval** of coastal development permit application 6-14-1930, as conditioned. The certified Agua Hedionda Land Use Plan (LUP) is one of six segments of the City of Carlsbad's LCP and Bristol Cove is within the area governed by this document. While most of the city's coastal zone has a fully certified LCP, with the city issuing coastal development permits, an Implementation Plan (IP) for the Agua Hedionda segment has not been certified. Thus, permit responsibility remains with the Commission, and Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act is the standard of review, with the certified Agua Hedionda LUP used as guidance.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	MOTION AND RESOLUTION	4
II.	STANDARD CONDITIONS	4
III.	SPECIAL CONDITIONS	5
IV.	FINDINGS AND DECLARATIONS	7
	A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION	
	B. WATER QUALITY	8
	C. SCENIC RESOURCES/VISUAL QUALITY	
	D. PUBLIC ACCESS	
	E. UNPERMITTED DEVELOPMENT	12
	F. LOCAL COASTAL PLANNING	
	G. CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT	13

APPENDICES

Appendix A – Substantive File Documents

EXHIBITS

Exhibit 1 – Location Map Exhibit 2 – Site Plan Exhibit 3 – Landscape Plan Exhibit 4 – Images of Property

I. MOTION AND RESOLUTION

Motion:

I move that the Commission **approve** *Coastal Development Permit Application No.* 6-14-1930 subject to the conditions set forth in the staff recommendation.

Staff recommends a **YES** vote on the foregoing motion. Passage of this motion will result in conditional approval of the permit and adoption of the following resolution and findings. The motion passes only by affirmative vote of a majority of the Commissioners present.

Resolution:

The Commission hereby approves coastal development permit 6-14-1930 and adopts the findings set forth below on grounds that the development as conditioned will be in conformity with the policies of Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act and will not prejudice the ability of the local government having jurisdiction over the area to prepare a Local Coastal Program conforming to the provisions of Chapter 3. Approval of the permit complies with the California Environmental Quality Act because either 1) feasible mitigation measures and/or alternatives have been incorporated to substantially lessen any significant adverse effects of the development on the environment, or 2) there are no further feasible mitigation measures or alternatives that would substantially lessen any significant adverse impacts of the development on the environment.

II. STANDARD CONDITIONS

This permit is granted subject to the following standard conditions:

- 1. **Notice of Receipt and Acknowledgment**. The permit is not valid and development shall not commence until a copy of the permit, signed by the permittee or authorized agent, acknowledging receipt of the permit and acceptance of the terms and conditions, is returned to the Commission office.
- 2. **Expiration.** If development has not commenced, the permit will expire two years from the date on which the Commission voted on the application. Development shall be pursued in a diligent manner and completed in a reasonable period of time. Application for extension of the permit must be made prior to the expiration date.
- 3. **Interpretation.** Any questions of intent of interpretation of any condition will be resolved by the Executive Director or the Commission.

- 4. **Assignment.** The permit may be assigned to any qualified person, provided assignee files with the Commission an affidavit accepting all terms and conditions of the permit.
- 5. **Terms and Conditions Run with the Land.** These terms and conditions shall be perpetual, and it is the intention of the Commission and the permittee to bind all future owners and possessors of the subject property to the terms and conditions.

III. SPECIAL CONDITIONS

This permit is granted subject to the following special conditions:

1. Final Plans.

PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit for review and written approval by the Executive Director, final plans approved by the City of Carlsbad that are in substantial conformance with the plans by Steve Murcko and Associates, Inc., received April 16, 2015.

The applicant shall undertake development in accordance with the approved plans. Any proposed changes to the approved plans shall be reported to the Executive Director. No changes to the plans shall occur without a Coastal Commission approved amendment to this coastal development permit unless the Executive Director determines that no amendment is legally required.

2. **Final Revised Landscape Plans.**

PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit a final landscaping plan to the Executive Director for review and written approval. The plans shall be in substantial conformance with the landscape plans by Mark A. Leone, received on March 19, 2015, and shall reflect the following:

- a. A maintenance plan for the landscaped area that shall describe the herbicide, pesticide and fertilizer practices as well as list the chemical pesticides and fertilizers that will be employed on site. Said chemicals shall not be toxic to fish or wildlife or persistent in the environment. Herbicides and pesticides, if used at all, shall be applied by hand application or by other means that will prevent leakage, percolation, or aerial drift into adjacent lagoon;
- b. A plan showing the type, size, extent and location of all plant materials used;
- c. Only drought-tolerant native or non-invasive plant materials shall be utilized;
- d. The 216 square foot bio retention area shall be maintained in good growing condition, and whenever necessary, shall be replaced with new drought-tolerant

native or non-invasive plant materials to ensure continued compliance with landscape requirements; and

- e. All landscaping shall be drought-tolerant and native or non-invasive plant species. No plant species listed as problematic or invasive by the California Native Plant Society, the California Exotic Pest Plant Council, or as may be identified from time to time by the State of California, shall be employed or allowed to naturalize or persist on the site. No plant species listed as 'noxious weed' by the State of California or the U.S. Federal Government shall be utilized within the property.
- f. If using potable water for irrigation, only drip or micro spray irrigation systems may be used.
- g. (1) A written commitment by the applicant that five years from the date of the issuance of the coastal development permit for the residential structure, the applicant will submit for the review and written approval of the Executive Director, a landscape monitoring report, prepared by a licensed Landscape Architect or qualified Resource Specialist, that certifies whether the on-site landscaping is in conformance with the landscape plan approved pursuant to this Special Condition. The monitoring report shall include photographic documentation of plant species and plant coverage.

(2) If the landscape monitoring report indicates the landscaping is not in conformance with or has failed to meet the performance standards specified in the landscaping plan approved pursuant to this permit, the applicant or successors in interest shall submit a revised or supplemental landscape plan for the review and written approval of the Executive Director. The revised landscaping plan must be prepared by a licensed Landscape Architect or Resource Specialist and shall specify measures to remediate those portions of the original plan that have failed or are not in conformance with the original approved plan.

h. The applicant shall undertake the development in accordance with the approved landscape plans. Any proposed changes to the approved plans shall be reported to the Executive Director. No changes to the plans shall occur without a Commission-approved amendment to the permit unless the Executive Director determines that no such amendment is legally required.

3. **Final Drainage Plans.**

PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit final drainage plans for review and written approval by the Executive Director that are in substantial conformance with the plans prepared by Mark A. Leone, received on March 19, 2015.

The applicant shall undertake development in accordance with the approved plans. Any proposed changes to the approved plans shall be reported to the Executive Director. No changes to the plans shall occur without a Coastal Commission approved amendment to

this coastal development permit unless the Executive Director determines that no amendment is legally required.

IV. FINDINGS AND DECLARATIONS

A. **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The proposed project will involve construction of a new 3,185 square foot single-family home with attached 723 square foot garage and 320 square foot patio cover, and associated landscaping, on a vacant 4,680 square foot lot. The subject site is located on the north side of Cove Drive, and is adjacent to Bristol Cove, an inland waterway connected to the north shore of Agua Hedionda Lagoon. The primary residence is proposed to extend up to 32 feet in height, at its highest point, with the main roofline being 28 ½ feet in height. A 31 ½ foot setback between an attached patio cover and the mean high tide line (MHTL) is proposed to be consistent with adjacent development along Bristol Cove's shoreline (Exhibit 1 and 2). The subject lot has previously been graded, so no grading is proposed as part of this project. There is an existing private "stringer" ramp located on the riprap, between the subject property's rear property line and the water; however, there is no existing boat dock and a boat dock or other improvements to the existing ramp have not been proposed as part of this project. The existing deck is not part of the subject approval and a separate enforcement action may be necessary.

Bristol Cove is a private cove and marina facility located off the inner basin of Agua Hedionda Lagoon. The cove is owned by Bristol Cove Property Owner's Association, which comprises the residential condominium complexes along the shoreline of the cove channel. Since 1972, over three dozen permits have been issued for the construction of condominium complexes and duplexes, as well as single-family residences, along Bristol Cove, ranging in size from 2-unit structures to a 100-unit complex.

Agua Hedionda Lagoon is an artificial water body that was originally dredged in 1954 to -11 feet MSL (Mean Sea Level), out of a historical 230-acre salt marsh slough, to provide cooling water for the Encina Power Plant. Several coastal development permits have been issued since 1980 for the dredging of Bristol Cove and other areas of the lagoon.

The certified Agua Hedionda LUP is one of six segments of the City of Carlsbad's LCP and Bristol Cove is within the area governed by this document. While most of the city's coastal zone has a fully certified LCP, with the city issuing coastal development permits, an IP for the Agua Hedionda segment has not been certified as yet. Thus, permit responsibility remains with the Commission, and Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act is the standard of review with the certified Agua Hedionda LUP used as guidance.

B. WATER QUALITY

Section 30230 of the Coastal Act states:

Marine resources shall be maintained, enhanced, and where feasible, restored. Special protection shall be given to areas and species of special biological or economic significance. Uses of the marine environment shall be carried out in a manner that will sustain the biological productivity of coastal waters and that will maintain healthy populations of all species of marine organisms adequate for long-term commercial, recreational, scientific, and educational purposes.

Section 30231 of the Coastal Act states:

The biological productivity and the quality of coastal waters, streams, wetlands, estuaries, and lakes appropriate to maintain optimum populations of marine organisms and for the protection of human health shall be maintained and, where feasible, restored through, among other means, minimizing adverse effects of waste water discharges and entrainment, controlling runoff, preventing depletion of ground water supplies and substantial interference with surface water flow, encouraging waste water reclamation, maintaining natural vegetation buffer areas that protect riparian habitats, and minimizing alteration of natural streams.

Section 30250 of the Coastal Act states, in part:

(a) New residential, commercial, or industrial development, except as otherwise provided in this division, shall be located within, contiguous with, or in close proximity to, existing developed areas with adequate public services and where it will not have significant adverse effects, either individually or cumulatively, on coastal resources...

The project site is adjacent to Bristol Cove, which connects to Agua Hedionda Lagoon. The site is currently undeveloped and surrounded by existing residential development. The proposed single-family residence will create new impervious surfaces. This reduction in pervious surface leads to an increase in the volume and velocity of stormwater runoff that can be expected to leave the site, and potentially enter the adjacent lagoon water. Pollutants commonly found in runoff associated with residential use include petroleum hydrocarbons, such as oil from vehicles; heavy metals; synthetic organic chemicals, like paint and household cleaners; soap and dirt from washing vehicles; dirt and vegetation from yard maintenance; fertilizers, herbicides and pesticides; and bacteria and pathogens from animal waste. All of these potential pollutants can degrade the marine environment and reduce the biological productivity of coastal waters containing sensitive marine organisms.

The proposed development includes on-site drainage improvements to ensure that runoff is collected and dissipated prior to entering the storm drain and the lagoon itself. The drainage plan submitted with the application includes a 216 square foot vegetated bio retention area between the rear property line and the patio cover, attached to the rear of the residence, in which the majority of the onsite runoff will be directed to for infiltration and percolation (Exhibit 3). Onsite hardscape will also be somewhat pervious, with concrete pavers and flagstone steppers being used to allow for percolation of runoff on those surfaces, while additional runoff from those surfaces has been directed toward landscaped "planting areas." Directing runoff into landscaping is a well-established BMP (Best Management Practice) for treating runoff from small developments such as the subject proposal. Additionally, all gutter downspouts will tie into the drainage system, which includes an existing dissipater and seepage pit. <u>Special Condition Nos. 2</u> and 3 require the applicant to comply with the proposed landscape and drainage plans, which includes a BMP note confirming that no chemicals or pesticides harmful to fish or wildlife will be used on the subject property. As conditioned, the Commission finds the proposed project is consistent with Sections 30230 and 30231 of the Coastal Act.

The project site is a waterfront lot that has been previously graded and does not contain any native vegetation, wetlands, or upland habitat. While the lot extends towards the water, an existing, approximately 18 ½ feet wide rock revetment ('riprap') runs along the shoreline of Bristol Cove, in between the properties' rear property lines and the water's edge. No wetland or upland vegetation exists on site and no fill of wetlands is proposed.

The Agua Hedionda LUP requires a 100-foot buffer between new development and the water's edge for much of the lagoon. Historically, the Commission requires that buffer areas remain undeveloped to provide physical space between development and environmentally sensitive areas like Agua Hedionda Lagoon. However, the project site is within an area where development pre-dates the Coastal Act, with most of the lots around Bristol Cove having been developed in the 1960's. Additionally, the Agua Hedionda LUP does not establish a setback from the water's edge for properties located within Bristol Cove. The current pattern for development along Bristol Cove establishes a 20-foot rear yard setback between the shoreline (measured as the MHTL) of Bristol Cove and the primary building, which has been applied to recent residential projects along Bristol Cove (including CDP #6-01-175, #6-02-136 and #6-05-054). This project proposal includes an approximately 31 ¹/₂ ft setback between the proposed building footprint and the MHTL. and this setback is consistent with neighboring structures and maintains the existing character of the surrounding area. Special Condition No. 1 requires that final plans conform with the approved plans received on April 16, 2015, which establish this setback.

Special Condition No. 2 also requires landscape plans to conform with the approved plans received on March 19, 2015, which includes: only drought-tolerant native or non-invasive plants and plant materials to be used; the bio retention area to be maintained in good growing condition; and for only non-toxic herbicides and pesticides to be used. Additionally, **Special Condition No. 2** requires the applicant to provide Commission staff with a landscape monitoring report after 5 years. This condition helps to protect marine resources through minimizing runoff and potential runoff pollutants which could enter the Bristol Cove channel.

The subject property is a vacant lot located within an existing residential subdivision with sufficient infrastructure (including existing connectivity to the City's sewer line and

public streets, the local water supply and electrical grid) to accommodate the proposed infill development. Therefore, the proposed project is located in an area with adequate public services and will not have an adverse effect on coastal resources, in accordance with Section 30250 of the Coastal Act.

In summary, the proposed residential development does not involve impacts to any sensitive habitat or any fill of wetlands, and as proposed, assures coastal resources will be preserved. Therefore, as conditioned, the Commission finds the proposed project consistent with the cited Coastal Act policies.

C. SCENIC RESOURCES/VISUAL QUALITY

Section 30251 of the Coastal Act states:

The scenic and visual qualities of coastal areas shall be considered and protected as a resource of public importance. Permitted development shall be sited and designed to protect views to and along the ocean and scenic coastal areas, to minimize the alteration of natural land forms, to be visually compatible with the character of surrounding areas...

In response to Section 30251 of the Coastal Act, one of the issues addressed in the Land Use Plan is the preservation of views from Adams Street. This street is a designated scenic corridor that runs along the north shore of the lagoon, and briefly runs above Cove Drive. Policy 8.3 of the Agua Hedionda LUP requires that development of the lots that lie between Adams Street and Agua Hedionda Lagoon be designed so as to preserve the public views from Adams Street. Additionally, Policy 1.9 also establishes that building height shall be limited to a maximum of 35 feet.

In the case of the proposed development, the apex of the proposed residence's roofline will be at an elevation of 32 feet, which is below the 45-ft elevation of Adams Street west of the project site, and also under the 35-foot building height limit established in Agua Hedionda LUP Policy 1.9. Thus, the project conforms to the LUP requirement and will not impact any existing public views from Adams Street. Further, the existing community along Bristol Cove is made up primarily of two-story, multi-unit apartment and condominium complexes that create a solid wall of development along the shoreline such that no significant views to Bristol Cove exist along Cove Drive. The proposed development will construct a large single-family residence between the road and shoreline of the Cove, but this will not block any views of the lagoon from Adams Street, or Bristol Cove itself, and will maintain the existing pattern of development consistent with the size and character of other development along Bristol Cove. Special Condition **No. 1** requires the final plans to be in substantial conformance with the plans received by Commission staff on April 16, 2015. Said plans limit all onsite development to a maximum height of 32 feet and require a setback from the MHTL consistent with adjacent properties. Therefore, the bulk and scale of the development would be in keeping with the surrounding two-story residential development, and would be consistent with the visual protection and preservation policies of the Coastal Act.

In summary, the residential development, as proposed, provides for the required view preservation from the adjacent scenic roadway, and the Commission finds that the proposed development is consistent with Section 30251 of the Coastal Act and the applicable policies of the Agua Hedionda LUP regarding scenic preservation.

D. PUBLIC ACCESS

Section 30210 of the Coastal Act states:

In carrying out the requirements of Section 4 of Article X of the California Constitution, maximum access, which shall be conspicuously posted, and recreational opportunities shall be provided for all the people consistent with public safety needs and the need to protect public rights, rights of private property owners, and natural resource areas from overuse.

Section 30212 of the Coastal Act states, in part:

(a) Public access from the nearest public roadway to the shoreline and along the coast shall be provided in new development projects except where: (1) it is inconsistent with public safety, military security needs, or the protection of fragile coastal resources, (2) adequate access exists nearby, or, (3) agriculture would be adversely affected...

Section 30604 of the Coastal Act states, in part:

[...]

(c) Every coastal development permit issued for any development between the nearest public road and the sea or the shoreline of any body of water located within the coastal zone shall include a specific finding that the development is in conformity with the public access and public recreation policies of Chapter 3 (commencing with Section 30200).

In this particular location, Adams Street serves as the first continuous public roadway, and the proposed development would be located between Adams Street and Agua Hedionda Lagoon.

The project site is located adjacent to Bristol Cove, a private, inland waterway that includes a riprap-lined shoreline. Vertical public access to the Agua Hedionda Lagoon shoreline is provided southeast of the proposed site, at the terminus of Cove Drive approximately a quarter of a mile away. From there, public trail segments exist to the east in front of the Bristol Cove multi-family project and at the two residential lots to the west. The project site itself does not provide any views of the main channel, and there is no evidence that it has been used by the public to access the shoreline. Typically, the construction of a single-family residence along a coastal shoreline raises potential issues of consistency with Coastal Act policies protecting public access to and along the shoreline (including the shoreline of coastal lagoons). However, the Agua Hedionda LUP does not identify public access along the shoreline of Bristol Cove and private development currently exists on all surrounding lots located along the Bristol Cove shoreline. Pedestrian trail access outlined in the LUP ends at the entrance of Bristol Cove on the western bank, continues inland along Cove Drive to Park Drive, and resumes again along the Lagoon on the opposite side of the cove mouth at the eastern shore. Currently there is no other public access to any part of the Bristol Cove shoreline, as it is fully developed (except for the subject site and one other vacant parcel to the northwest) with existing residential development, and construction of the proposed project will not impact public access to the area.

Therefore, in the case of the proposed development, adequate public access to Agua Hedionda Lagoon is provided south of the subject site. Additionally, the proposed development would not interfere with existing public access. The Commission finds the proposed project is consistent with the public access policies of both the Coastal Act and the Agua Hedionda LUP.

E. UNPERMITTED DEVELOPMENT

Unpermitted development, in the form of an existing private "stringer" ramp located on the adjacent riprap, has occurred on the subject site without the required coastal development permit (Exhibit 4). The current property owner bought the property with this existing unpermitted development, and is not currently proposing further improvements to the ramp. Any future improvements to the stringer ramp will require a separate application for a coastal development permit.

Although development has taken place prior to submission of this permit application, consideration of this application by the Commission has been based solely upon the Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act. Approval of this permit does not constitute an admission as to the legality of any development undertaken on the subject site without a coastal permit. Approval of this permit, and undertaking the activities authorized herein, will not resolve the unpermitted development described above. Resolution of this unpermitted development activity may be addressed as through a separate enforcement action.

F. LOCAL COASTAL PLANNING

Section 30604(a) also requires that a coastal development permit shall be issued only if the Commission finds that the permitted development will not prejudice the ability of the local government to prepare a Local Coastal Program (LCP) in conformity with the provisions of Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act. In this case, such a finding can be made.

The project meets all of the requirements of the City of Carlsbad's underlying Residential Waterway (R-W) zone. However, the subject site is located in an area of deferred

certification, where the Commission retains permit authority, because, although the Commission has certified the Agua Hedionda LUP, no implementing ordinances have been submitted. Thus, the standard of review for this application is Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act. The Agua Hedionda Lagoon LUP designates the site for residential development; and the project is consistent with that designation. As conditioned, the project is consistent with the policies of the Agua Hedionda LUP regarding water quality, visual resources and public access, as well as the corresponding Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act, Therefore approval of the project will not prejudice the ability of the City of Carlsbad to prepare a fully certifiable Local Coastal Program for its Agua Hedionda Lagoon segment.

G. CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT

Section 13096 of the Commission's Code of Regulations requires Commission approval of Coastal Development Permits to be supported by a finding showing the permit, as conditioned, to be consistent with any applicable requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Section 21080.5(d)(2)(A) of CEQA prohibits a proposed development from being approved if there are feasible alternatives or feasible mitigation measures available which would substantially lessen any significant adverse effect which the activity may have on the environment.

The proposed project has been conditioned in order to be found consistent with the Chapter 3 policies of the Coastal Act. Mitigation measures, including conditions addressing the height, bulk, and scale of the proposed building, will minimize all adverse environmental impacts. As conditioned, there are no feasible alternatives or feasible mitigation measures available which would substantially lessen any significant adverse impact which the activity may have on the environment. Therefore, the Commission finds that the proposed project is the least environmentally-damaging feasible alternative and can be found consistent with the requirements of the Coastal Act to conform to CEQA.

(G:\Reports\2014\6-14-1930 Oliver Residence.docx)

6-14-1930 (Oliver)

APPENDIX A SUBSTANTIVE FILE DOCUMENTS

- Certified Agua Hedionda Lagoon Land Use Plan
- Coastal Development Permits: #6-01-175, #6-02-136 and #6-05-054









