

CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

45 FREMONT, SUITE 2000
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2219
VOICE (415) 904-5200
FAX (415) 904-5400
TDD (415) 597-5885

**W19a**

DATE: June 29, 2017
TO: Coastal Commissioners
FROM: John Ainsworth, Executive Director
SUBJECT: **DRAFT MINUTES** of MEETING of **AUGUST 10-12, 2016**
Hilton Santa Cruz/Scotts Valley
6001 Madonna Rd.
Santa Cruz, CA 95060

WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 10, 2016

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Kinsey.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chair Kinsey, Vice Chair Bochco, Cox, Groom, Howell, Luevano, McClure, Mitchell, Pestor (alternate), Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga. Vargas arrived at 9:15 a.m. Non-voting present: Beland.
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.
5. **CHAIR'S REPORT.**

STATEWIDE

6. **ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**
 - a. **Executive Director's Report.**
 - b. **Legislative Report.** Trailed to Friday's agenda.
 - c. **Budget Update.** Presentation and possible discussion of Commission's use of federal grant funds, upcoming Coastal Zone Management Act Section 312 evaluation, and other background budget information. **Informational item only.**
 - d. **Interagency Agreement.**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to authorize approval of the transfer of federal funds to BCDC for implementation of the California Coastal Management Program for Fiscal Year 2016-2017 and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Luevano. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to authorize approval of the transfer of federal funds to SCC for implementation of the California Coastal Management Program for Fiscal Year 2016-2017 and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Luevano. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- e. **Public Education Grant Program.** Staff recommended approval of the proposed targeted grants.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to approve the proposed targeted grant awards from sales of the WHALE TAIL License Plate and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- f. **2016 and 2017 Schedules of Meeting Dates and Locations.** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & vote: Uranga moved to adjust Commission meeting locations in 2016 and 2017 as suggested and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- 6.5. **STATUS REPORT ON EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR SEARCH PROCESS.** Information only.

ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES AND FEDERAL CONSISTENCY

- 7. **ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES and FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.** Report by the Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, negative determinations, matters not requiring public hearings, and status report on offshore oil & gas exploration & development.

- a. **Informational Briefing on California Ocean Plan Desalination Amendment.** [POSTPONED]
- b. **Proposal to Upgrade Mandalay Generating Station.** [POSTPONED]
- c. **Proposal to Modify Huntington Beach Energy Project.** Staff recommended approval. (Uranga recused).

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to adopt the report and directed staff to forward the report to the California Energy Commission and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Cox. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

8. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.

NORTH COAST DISTRICT

9. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

10. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 2 items [11a, 12a] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: McClure moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendations and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

11. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 1-16-0423 (Humboldt County Public Works Department)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

12. **PERMIT AMENDMENTS.**

- a. **Permit No. 1-08-012-A1 (Northcoast Regional Land Trust, Humboldt Co.)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

13. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

14. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.

15. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

[Howell, McClure, Uranga out of room]

- a. **City of Carmel-by-the-Sea LCP Amendment No. LCP-3-CML-16-0005-1 Part A (Affordable Housing Incentives).** Staff recommended approval as submitted.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a no vote, seconded by Turnbull-Sanders. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Approved as submitted.**

16. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-3-PSB-12-042 (Capistrano Seawall, Pismo Beach) [POSTPONED]**
- b. **Appeal No. A-3-PSB-12-043 (Vista del Mar Seawall, Pismo Beach) [POSTPONED]**

[Howell, McClure, Uranga returned; Turnbull-Sanders out of room]

- c. **Appeal No. A-3-MCO-16-0017 (Moro Cojo Affordable Housing, Monterey Co)**
Staff recommended that the Commission determine that Appeal No. A-3-MCO-16-0017 raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to determine that Appeal No. A-3-MCO-16-0017 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a no vote, seconded by McClure. The roll call vote was 2 in favor (Uranga, Vargas) and 9 opposed (Bochco, Cox, Groom, Howell, Luevano, McClure, Mitchell, Pestor, Kinsey). **Substantial Issue found. De novo phase continued.**

[Turnbull-Sanders returned]

- d. **Appeal No. A-3-CML-16-0057 (Henderson, Carmel-by-the-Sea)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-3-CML-16-0057** raised substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and continued the de novo phase of the hearing to a future meeting. **Substantial issue found. Continued.**
- e. **Appeal No. A-3-STC-16-0063 (Overnight RV Parking Restrictions, Santa Cruz)**
Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-3-STC-16-0063** raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed.

Motion & vote: Vargas moved to determine that **Appeal No. A-3-STC-16-0063** raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a no vote, seconded by McClure. The roll call vote one in favor (Kinsey) and 11 opposed (Cox, Groom, Howell, Luevano, McClure, Mitchell, Pestor, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Vargas, Bochco). **Substantial issued found.**

- f. **Appeal No. A-3-SCO-16-0069 (Verizon Wireless, Santa Cruz Co.)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-3-SCO-16-0069** raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to determine that **Appeal No. A-3-SCO-16-0069** raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No Substantial Issue found.**

17. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. A-3-SLO-09-058 (Cayucos Del Mar Mixed Use, San Luis Obispo Co.) [POSTPONED]**
- b. **Application No. A-3-SLO-15-0001 (Loperena, San Luis Obispo Co.)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Howell moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by McClure. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

STATEWIDE

- 18. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** The Commission approved the minutes of June 2016 and July 2016. **Motion & vote:** McClure moved to approve the minutes as written and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**
- 19. **COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS.** None.
- 20. **CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.
- 21. **SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.
- 22. **SANTA MONICA BAY RESTORATION REPORT.** None.
- 23. **DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL'S REPORT.** Information only.

The Commission recessed for the day at 4:30 p.m.

THURSDAY, AUGUST 11, 2016

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order by Vice Chair Bochco at 9:00 a.m.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Vice Chair Bochco, Cox, Groom, Luevano, McClure, Mitchell, Pestor(alternate), Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga. Howell arrived at 9:05 a.m.; Vargas arrived at 9:45 a.m.; Kinsey arrived at 10:35 a.m. Non-voting present: Beland.
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (ORANGE COUNTY)

5. **ADMINISTRATIVE CALENDAR.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination. There being no objection, Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the Commission concurred.
 - a. **Application No. 5-15-1789 (Orange County Parks)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-16-0106 (Roos, Newport Beach)**
 - c. **Application No. 5-16-0128 (Pilalas, Newport Beach)**
 - d. **Application No. 5-16-0649 (Newport Banning Ranch, LLC, Newport Beach)**
6. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** Staff recommended approval of the consent calendar.

Motion & vote: Turnbull-Sanders moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by McClure. Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

- a. **Application No. 5-15-0983 (KPMW Integral, LLC, Newport Beach)**
- b. **Application No. 5-16-0037 (Cyprus, Huntington Beach)**
- c. **Application No. 5-16-0149 (Bosserman and Piatt, Newport Beach)**
- d. **Application No. 5-16-0312 (PSC Strategic Investments, LLC, Newport Beach)**

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT

7. **ADMINISTRATIVE CALENDAR.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination. There being no objection, Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the Commission concurred.
 - a. **Application No. 6-16-0616 (Agua Hedionda Lagoon Foundation, Carlsbad)**

ENFORCEMENT

8. **ENFORCEMENT REPORT.** None.

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (ORANGE COUNTY)

9. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR ORANGE COUNTY.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the Commission concurred. (Pestor recused)
10. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved one item [12b] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

11. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**
 - a. **City of Newport Beach LCP-5-NPB-15-0039-1. (Implementation Plan).**
[POSTPONED]
12. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**
 - a. **Application No. 5-13-1231 (Khalil, Newport Beach) [POSTPONED]**
 - b. **Application No. 5-16-0059 (City of Newport Beach)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
 - c. **Application No. 5-15-0123 (Mesa Water District, Newport Beach) [POSTPONED]**

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT

13. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the Commission concurred.
14. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 3 items [17a, 17b, 17c] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Mitchell moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

15. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

- a. **City of Encinitas LCP Amendment No. LCP-6-ENC-16-0032-1 (Urban AG Ordinance).** Staff recommended approval of the Implementation Plan as submitted.

Motion & vote: Turnbull-Sanders moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a no vote, seconded by McClure. Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Approved as submitted.**

- b. **City of San Diego LCP Amendment No. LCP-6-SAN-16-0026-3 (Rooming House Ordinance).** Staff recommended approval of the Implementation Plan as submitted.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a no vote, seconded by Turnbull-Sanders. Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Approved as submitted.**

- c. **City of Carlsbad LCP Amendment No. LCP-6-CAR-15-0034-2 (General Plan Update/LCP Map Revisions) Certification Review.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination that the action by the City of Carlsbad is legally adequate. There being no objection, Vice Chair Bochco ruled that the Commission concurred.

[Kinsey arrived]

16. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-6-ENC-16-0067 (Meardon, Encinitas)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-6-ENC-16-0067** raised substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and continued the de novo hearing to a future meeting.
- b. **Appeal No. A-6-ENC-16-0068 (Hurst, Encinitas)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-6-ENC-16-0068** raised substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found substantial issue** and continued the de novo hearing to a future meeting.

17. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 6-16-0133 (SeaWorld, San Diego)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**
- b. **Application No. 6-16-0390 (TYD Industries, San Diego)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

- c. **Application No. 6-16-0561 (Carlsbad Bridge Improvements, Carlsbad)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

18. **REVISED FINDINGS.**

- a. **Application No. 6-10-018 (Brown, Encinitas)** Staff recommended approval of the revised findings.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to adopt the revised findings and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Cox. The vote of the prevailing side was 8 in favor (Cox, Groom, Luevano, McClure, Pestor, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Kinsey) and none opposed. **Approved.**

NORTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

- 19. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public.

- 20. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.

- 21. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

- a. **Marin County LCP Amendment No. LCP-2-MAR-15-0029-1 (Marin LCP Update). Time Extension Only.** Staff recommended approval.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to grant the time extension and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Uranga. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- b. **Sonoma County LCP Amendment No. LCP-2-SON-15-0025-1 Part A (Coastal Zoning Database).** Staff recommended denial as submitted and approval with modifications.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Certification denied as submitted.**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to certify the Implementation Plan if modified as suggested and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with modifications.**

- c. **Sonoma County LCP Amendment No. LCP-2-SON-15-0025-1 Part B (Duncan Mills Historic District).** Staff recommended denial as submitted and approval with modifications.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Certification denied as submitted.**

Motion & vote: Groom moved to certify the Implementation Plan if modified as suggested and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Luevano. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with modifications.**

22. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-2-HMB-16-0058 (Coastside Fire Protection District, Half Moon Bay)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-2-HMB-16-0058** raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to determine that **Appeal No. A-2-HMB-16-0058** raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No Substantial Issue found.**

- b. **Appeal No. A-2-SMC-16-0066 (Kalpakoff, San Mateo Co.)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-2-SMC-16-0066** raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to determine that **Appeal No. A-2-SMC-16-0066** raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by McClure. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No Substantial Issue found.**

The Commission recessed the meeting at 11:45 and went into closed session.

CLOSED SESSION REPORT. The Commission received litigation information and advice regarding the following matters:

*Fiery et al. v. California Dept. of Fish & Game et al.,
Friends of Martin's Beach v. Martins Beach I LLC et al.,
Surfrider Foundation v. Martins Beach I LLC et al.,
Friends of the Canyon v. CCC (Longi et al., RPI),
Grassroots Coalition v. CCC (Lester et al., RPI),
Hanscom v. CCC et al. (MDR Hotels LLC et al.),
Pappas et al. v. State of California et al.,
Rubino v. CCC et al. (Mendocino Land Trust, RPI),
San Clemente Vacation Rental Alliance v. City of San Clemente et al. (CCC, RPI),
Seacliff Beach Colony Homeowners Assn. v. State of California et al.,*

Sea World LLC v. CCC,
Smith v. Benefiel et al.,
Surfrider Foundation et al. v. CCC (County of Santa Barbara et al.),
Water Ratepayers Assn. v. County of Monterey et al. (California American Water Co., RPI)
One matter of potential litigation

The Commission received litigation information and advice and provided direction regarding the following matters:

AquaLegacy Development LLC v. CCC et al., (Case No. M125474),
AquaLegacy Development LLC v. CCC et al., (Case No. H042782),

FRIDAY, AUGUST 12, 2016

1. **CALL TO ORDER.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Kinsey.
2. **ROLL CALL.** Present: Chair Kinsey, Vice Chair Bochco, Cox, Groom, Luevano, McClure, Mitchell, Pestor, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Vargas. Howell arrived at 9:10 a.m.
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.

Trailed from Wednesday's agenda.

6. **ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

b. **Legislative Report.**

AB1453 (Bloom). Staff recommended support of the bill.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to support the bill and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Mitchell. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion.

Passed.

Proposition 67 (Plastic bag ban). Staff recommended support.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to support Proposition 67 and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Luevano. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Passed.**

[Vargas departed]

STATEWIDE

5. **LCP Grants.** Public hearing and possible Commission action on recommended grant awards for Round 3 of the Commission's LCP Grant Program.

Motion & vote: Cox moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded Uranga. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (LOS ANGELES COUNTY)

6. **ADMINISTRATIVE CALENDAR.** Staff removed one item [**6b**] from the Administrative calendar and recommended concurrence with the Executive Director on the remaining items. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
 - a. **Application No. 5-15-1524 (Alger, Santa Monica)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-16-0251 (Mascola, Venice, Los Angeles) (*Removed*)**
 - c. **Application No. 5-16-0330 (DP005 Hurricane, LLC, Venice, Los Angeles)**
 - d. **Application No. 5-16-0331 (DP005 Hurricane, LLC, Venice, Los Angeles)**
 - e. **Application No. 5-16-0527 (Wirth, Venice, Los Angeles)**
 - f. **Application No. 5-16-0551 (Revilo Investments LLC, Venice, Los Angeles)**
 - g. **Application No. 5-16-0555 (Howard, Venice, Los Angeles)**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (LOS ANGELES COUNTY)

7. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR LOS ANGELES COUNTY.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

8. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved one item [**10a**] to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Turnbull-Sanders. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved with conditions.**

9. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

- a. **City of Manhattan Beach LCP Amendment No. 1-15 (LCP-5-MNB-15-0046-1) (Short-Term Rentals). Time Extension.** Staff recommended approval of the time extension.

Motion & vote: Groom moved to grant the time extension pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **Approved.**

- 9.5. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-5-VEN-16-0055 (Carelton & Smith, Los Angeles)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to determine that Appeal No. A-5-VEN-16-0055 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Mitchell. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No substantial issue found.**

10. **PERMIT AMENDMENTS.**

- a. **Application No. 5-13-033-A1 (City of Los Angeles, Venice, Los Angeles)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions**

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

11. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, LCP matters not requiring public hearings, and on comments from the public. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

12. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.

13. **NEW APPEAL.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-4-STB-14-0060 (Schlesinger, Santa Barbara Co.)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-4-STB-14-0060** raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission **found** substantial issue and continued the de novo phase of the hearing to a future meeting. **Substantial issue found. Continued.**
- b. **Appeal No. A-4-STB-14-0061 (Makarechian, Santa Barbara Co.)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that **Appeal No. A-4-STB-14-0061** raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Kinsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the de novo phase of the hearing. Staff recommended denial of the permit.

Motion & vote: Bochco moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a no vote, seconded by McClure. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Denied.**

14. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-4-STB-14-0073 (CTS Properties, Santa Barbara Co.) [POSTPONED]**
[Groom departed]

- b. **Appeal No. A-4-STB-16-0046 (McGaughey, Santa Barbara Co.)** Staff recommended denial.

Motion & vote: Turnbull-Sanders moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a no vote, seconded by Bochco. Chair Kinsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Denied.**

There being no old or new business, the meeting of the California Coastal Commission adjourned at 1:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

John Ainsworth
Executive Director