

CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

455 MARKET STREET, SUITE 300
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2219
FAX (415) 904-5400
TDD (415) 597-5885

**W20**

DATE: May 8, 2024
TO: Coastal Commissioners
FROM: Kate Huckelbridge, Executive Director
SUBJECT: **DRAFT MINUTES** of MEETING of October 11-13, 2023
Pier South Resort
800 Seacoast Drive
Imperial Beach, CA 91932

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 11, 2023

1. **CALL TO ORDER and ROLL CALL.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Brownsey. **Present:** Chair Brownsey, Vice Chair Hart, Aguirre, O'Malley(alternate), Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson. **Non-voting present:** Calfee, Ketchum, Kounalakis.

After roll call, the Commission departed for a field trip to the Tijuana River Valley and returned to resume the meeting at 1:30pm.

2. **VIRTUAL MEETING PROCEDURES.**
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.
5. **Chair's Report.** None.

STATEWIDE

6. **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**
 - a. **Executive Director's Report.** Information only.
 - b. **Informational Briefing on the Trans-boundary Pollution Crisis in the Tijuana River and Tijuana River Valley.** Discussion and information only.
 - c. **Commission Correspondence.** None.

- d. **Legislative Report.** Information only.
- e. **Budget Update.** Information only.
- f. **Interagency Agreements for Implementing California’s Coastal Management Program, FY 2023-24 Coastal Zone Management Grant Award.** Staff recommended that the Commission approve the grant award.
(Harmon out of room)

Motion & vote: Rice moved to authorize Executive Director to pass through \$391,250.00 of Federal funds to SFBCDC (San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission) for FY23/24 pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (Aguirre, O’Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved.**

Motion & vote: Rice moved to authorize Executive Director to pass through \$393,750.00 of Federal funds to SCC (State Coastal Conservancy) for FY23/24 pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (Aguirre, O’Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved.**

- 7. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** Staff recommended that the Commission approve the consent calendar with conditions. (Aguirre & Turnbull-Sanders out of room)

Motion & vote: Wilson moved to approve the consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Hart. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O’Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Hart, Harmon, Notthoff, Rice, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved with conditions.**

- 8. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** None.+

ENFORCEMENT

- 9. **ENFORCEMENT REPORT.** Report by Chief of Enforcement on Statewide Enforcement Program. Information only. [This item was trailed to Thursday’s agenda.]

NORTH COAST DISTRICT

- 10. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

11. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-1-MEN-23-0036 (AT&T California, Albion)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised a substantial on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and continued the denovo phase of the hearing.

STATEWIDE

19. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** The minutes of May & June 2023 were approved as written.

Motion & vote: Uranga moved to approve the April 2023 minutes as written and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. The roll call vote was 12 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved.**

20. **COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS.** None.
21. **COMMISSION SUB-COMMITTEE REPORTS.** None
22. **CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.
23. **SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS CONSERVANCY REPORT.** None.
24. **SANTA MONICA BAY RESTORATION REPORT.** None.
25. **DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL'S REPORT.** Information only.

The Commission recessed for the day at 6:30 p.m.

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 12, 2023

1. **CALL TO ORDER and ROLL CALL.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Brownsey. Present: Chair Brownsey, Vice Chair Hart, Aguirre, O'Malley(alternate), Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson. Non-voting present: Calfee, Ketchum, Kounalakis.
2. **VIRTUAL MEETING PROCEDURES.**
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.
5. **ADMINISTRATIVE CALENDAR.** Staff recommended that the Commission concur with the Executive Director's determination. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
 - a. **Application No. 5-23-0070 (Salisbury, Long Beach)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-23-0641 (Richley and Sustayta, Newport Beach)**
6. **CONSENT CALENDAR.** Staff recommended approval of the consent calendar. (Aguirre & Escalante out of room)
 - a. **Application No. 5-21-0873 (City of Santa Monica, Santa Monica)**
 - b. **Application No. 5-23-0275 (Isacowitz, Sunset Beach)**
 - c. **Application No. 6-23-0428 (San Diego Fire & Rescue, San Diego)**

Motion & vote: Wilson moved approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Harmon. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved with conditions.**
7. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 3 items (**10a, 16d, 20a**) to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval. (Escalante returned)

Motion & vote: Notthoff moved to approve the expanded consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed.. **Approved as recommended.**

SOUTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

8. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification, and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

9. **NEW APPEAL.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-4-MMT-23-0010 (Sullivan, Los Angeles CO.)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Hart moved to determine that Appeal No. A-4-MMT-23-0010 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Turnbull-Sanders. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **No substantial issue found.**

10. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 4-23-0362 (City of Goleta, Santa Barbara Co.)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (LOS ANGELES COUNTY)

11. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR LOS ANGELES COUNTY.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification, and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

12. **NEW APPEALS.**

- a. **Appeal No. A-5-PPL-21-0037 (California Food Managers, LLC & Heavenly Tigers, LLC (Attn: Michael Aminpour), Pacific Palisades)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Rice moved to determine that Appeal No. A-5-PPL-21-0037 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Escalante. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-

Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and 1 abstention (Aguirre). **No substantial issue found.**

- b. **Appeal No. A-5-VEN-22-0048 (Gottlieb/Spalding Commercial, LLC, Venice)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that Appeal No. A-5-VEN-22-0048 raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the denovo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Uranga moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendations and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson Brownsey) and one opposed (Escalante). **Approved with special conditions.**

The Commission recessed for lunch and went into closed session.

REPORT OF CLOSED SESSION

The Commission received litigation information and advice and took action on the following cases:

AMJT Capital LLC, et al. v. California Coastal Commission
Seider, et al. v. City of Malibu, et al.,

- c. **Appeal No. A-5-LOB-23-0032 (Holland Partner Group, Long Beach)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Uranga moved to determine that Appeal No. A-5-LOB-23-0032 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Hart. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and 2 abstentions (Escalante, Turnbull-Sanders). **No substantial issue found.**

- d. **Appeal No. A-5-LOB-23-0033 (Belmont Brewing Company, Inc., Long Beach)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Uranga moved to determine that Appeal No. A-5-LOB-23-0033 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Turnbull-Sanders. The roll call vote was 4 in favor (Aguirre, Harmon, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga) and 8 opposed (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Wilson, Brownsey). **Substantial issue found, de novo phase of the appeal continued.**

- e. **Appeal No. A-5-PPL-19-0168 (WSBO LLC, Pacific Palisades)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that Appeal No. A-5-PPL-19-0168 raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the denovo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Rice moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Notthoff. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Brownsey), 1 opposed (Wilson) and 1 abstention (Aguirre). **Approved with conditions.**

- f. **Appeal No. A-5-PPL-19-0169 (WSBO LLC, Pacific Palisades)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that Appeal No. A-5-PPL-19-0169 raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the denovo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Rice moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Notthoff. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Brownsey), 1 opposed (Wilson) and 1 abstention (Aguirre). **Approved with conditions.**

- g. **Appeal No. A-5-PPL-19-0170 (WSBO LLC, Pacific Palisades)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that Appeal No. A-5-PPL-19-0170 raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the denovo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Rice moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Notthoff. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Brownsey), 1 opposed (Wilson) and 1 abstention (Aguirre). **Approved with conditions.**

13. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. A-5-PPL-19-0168/5-23-0568 (WSBO LLC, Pacific Palisades)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Rice moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Notthoff. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Brownsey), 1 opposed (Wilson) and 1 abstention (Aguirre). **Approved with conditions.**

- b. **Application No. A-5-PPL-19-0170/5-23-0569 (WSBO LLC, Pacific Palisades)**
Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Rice moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Notthoff. The roll call vote was 10 in favor (O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Brownsey), 1 opposed (Wilson) and 1 abstention (Aguirre). **Approved with conditions.**

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT (ORANGE COUNTY)

- 14. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR ORANGE COUNTY.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.

- 15. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**

- a. **City of Newport Beach LCP Amendment No. LCP-5-NPB-23-0020-2 (Fractional Ownership) Time Extension.** Staff recommended approval as submitted.

Motion & vote: Cummings moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a no vote, seconded by Hart. The roll call vote was none in favor and 12 opposed to the motion (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey). **Approved as submitted.**

- 16. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 5-18-0930 (Graham Property Management, LLC, San Clemente) [POSTPONED]**
- b. **Application No. 5-22-0602 (Gabriel, Newport Beach)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Hart moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by O'Malley. The roll call vote was 12 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved with conditions.**

- c. **Application No. 5-22-0939 (Chaim, Newport Beach)[POSTPONED]**
- d. **Application No. 5-23-0238 (Orange County Parks, Costa Mesa)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

SAN DIEGO COAST DISTRICT

- 17. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification, and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
- 18. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**
 - a. **City of Oceanside LCP Amendment No. LCP-6-OCN-23-0035-1 (Coast Highway Incentive District) [POSTPONED]**
- 19. **NEW APPEALS.**
 - a. **Appeal No. A-6-ENC-22-0049 (Encinitas Beach Land Venture I, LLC, Encinitas)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine Appeal No. A-6-ENC-22-0049 raised a substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission found substantial issue and opened the denovo hearing. Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion: Aguirre moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Hart.

Amending motion: Wilson moved to amend the motion to require that the hotel consist of 32 rooms, none of which are required to be lower or moderate cost, and that the applicant pay a \$1,158,000 fee in lieu of providing lower cost rooms on site, seconded by Aguirre. The roll call vote was 9 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Escalante, Harmon, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Wilson, and Chair Brownsey) and 3 opposed (Cummings, Hart, and Uranga).

Vote on main motion: The roll call vote was 9 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Escalante, Harmon, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Wilson, and Chair Brownsey) and 3 opposed (Cummings, Hart, and Uranga) and 3 opposed (Cummings, Hart, and Uranga). **Approved with conditions.**

20. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**

- a. **Application No. 6-20-0628 (BAE Systems San Diego Ship Repair Inc., San Diego)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved with conditions.**

- b. **Application No. 6-22-0551 (Schrager, Encinitas)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: Aguirre moved to approve pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and one opposed (Notthoff). **Approved with conditions.**

- c. **Application No. 6-23-0186 (Barlow Capital Investment, LLC, San Diego)**[POSTPONED]

- d. **Application No. 6-23-0562/A-6-OCN-22-0519 (Dillon et al, Oceanside)** Staff recommended approval with conditions.

Motion & vote: O'Malley moved to approve Application No. 6-23-0562 pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Aguirre. The roll call vote was 12 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved with conditions.**

Motion & vote: Wilson moved to approve Application No. A-6-OCN-22-0519 pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Aguirre. The roll call vote was 12 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved with conditions.**

The Commission recessed for the day at 9:00 p.m.

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 13, 2023

1. **CALL TO ORDER and ROLL CALL.** The meeting of the California Coastal Commission was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chair Brownsey. Present: Chair Brownsey, Vice Chair Hart, O'Malley(alternate), Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Wilson. Arrived after roll call: Aguirre, Uranga . Non-voting present: Calfee, Dumlao.
2. **VIRTUAL MEETING PROCEDURES.**
3. **AGENDA CHANGES.**
4. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.** Members of the public addressed the Commission on various issues affecting the coast.
5. **CONSENT CALENDAR.**
6. **CONSENT CALENDAR (removed from Regular Calendar).** Staff moved 3 items (9a, 13a, 14a) to the expanded consent calendar and recommended approval.

Motion & vote: Cummings moved to approve the expanded consent calendar pursuant to the staff recommendation and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Turnbull Sanders. The roll call vote was 12 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Notthoff, Rice, Turnbull-Sanders, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **Approved as recommended.**

ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES AND FEDERAL CONSISTENCY

7. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT for ENERGY, OCEAN RESOURCES and FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.** Report by the Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, negative determinations, matters not requiring public hearings, and status report on offshore oil & gas exploration & development. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
8. **COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.**
 - a. **Application No. 9-23-0599 (Pacific Gas & Electric Company, San Luis Obispo).[POSTPONED]**
9. **FEDERAL CONSISTENCY.**
 - a. **CC-0003-22 (Union Pacific Railroad)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved.**

NORTH CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

10. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification, and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report.
11. **NEW APPEALS.**
 - a. **Appeal No. A-2-MAR-23-0034 (Alexander Ag Development, Bolinas)**
[POSTPONED]

CENTRAL COAST DISTRICT

12. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT.** Report by Deputy Director on permit waivers, emergency permits, immaterial amendments & extensions, local government acceptance of modifications for LCP certification, and on comments from the public relating to the Deputy Director's report. There being no objection, Chair Brownsey ruled that the Commission concurred.
13. **LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAMS (LCPs).**
 - a. **City of Santa Cruz LCP Amendment No. LCP-3-STC-23-0005-1 Part A (Small Housing Units). Time Extension.** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved.**
 - b. **City of Carmel-by-the-Sea LCP Amendment No. LCP-3-CML-23-0022-1-Part B (Timeshare Provisions).** Staff recommended approval as submitted.

Motion & vote: Cummings moved to reject the Implementation Plan as submitted and recommended a no vote, seconded by Turnbull-Sanders. Chair Brownsney ruled that the vote was unanimous in opposition to the motion. **Approved as submitted.**

14. **NOTICE OF IMPENDING DEVELOPMENT.**
 - a. **NOID No. MCO-NOID-0001-23 (Rancho Rico Forest Health and Vegetation Treatment Project, Big Sur)** Moved by staff to the expanded consent calendar. **Approved.**

[Turnbull-Sanders departed; Notthoff departed; Newsom arrived]

15. **NEW APPEALS.**
 - a. **Appeal No. A-3-SLO-23-0029 (Valley SFD, Cayucos)** Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Cummings moved to determine Appeal No. A-3-SLO-23-0029 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Newsom. The roll call vote was 11 in favor (Aguirre, O'Malley, Cummings, Escalante, Harmon, Hart, Newsom, Rice, Uranga, Wilson, Brownsey) and none opposed. **No substantial issue found.**

b. **Appeal No. A-3-STC-23-0037 (King SFD, Santa Cruz)** . Staff recommended that the Commission determine that the appeal raised no substantial issue.

Motion & vote: Cummings moved to determine Appeal No. A-3-SLO-23-0029 raised no substantial issue on the grounds on which the appeal was filed and recommended a yes vote, seconded by Wilson. Chair Brownsey ruled that the vote was unanimous in favor of the motion. **No substantial issue found.**

16. COASTAL PERMIT APPLICATIONS.

a. **Application No. 3-22-0463 (Oceano Airport Improvements, Oceano)**
[POSTPONED]

There being no old or new business, the meeting of the California Coastal Commission adjourned at 11:31 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kate Huckelbridge
Executive Director

Approved as Submitted _____

Dr. Caryl Hart
Chair