CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION

SOUTH COAST DISTRICT OFFICE 301 E. OCEAN BLVD, SUITE 300 LONG BEACH, CA 90802-4325 VOICE (562) 590-5071 FAX (562) 590-5084



Th17e

ADDENDUM

August 13, 2025

TO: Coastal Commissioners and Interested Parties

FROM: South Coast District Staff

SUBJECT: ADDENDUM TO ITEM Th17E, APPLICATION NO. 5-24-0767 (LONG

BEACH YACHT CLUB) FOR THE COMMISSION MEETING OF

THURSDAY, AUGUST 14, 2025.

This addendum is intended to identify the support letters received for the proposed project and to address issues and concerns raised in objection letters that were received on Thursday, August 7, 2025, and Friday, August 8, 2025, and to make changes to the staff report dated July 25, 2025. The objection letters collectively raise various concerns, but the larger concerns relate to the use of the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot for parking by Yacht Club members and guests, the adequacy of public benefits offered by the Long Beach Yacht Club; and biological resource and public access impacts of the proposed project.

I. CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED AND RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

Correspondence Received

On Thursday, August 7, 2025, and Friday, August 8, 2025, the Commission received thirteen (13) letters supporting the proposed project. On those two dates, the Commission also received three (3) letters in opposition to the proposed project. The three (3) letters of opposition generally raise the following issues: 1) the Commission should defer action on the CDP to address the existing enforcement matter relating to unpermitted development; 2) impacts of the proposed development on scenic resources; 3) submission of Construction Staging Plans, Special Condition No. 17, should occur prior to approval of the CDP; 4) lack of CEQA review: 5) traffic impacts; 6) the use of public parking in the adjacent Basin 4 Public Parking Lot by members and guests of the private club; 7) adequacy of public benefits provided by the Long Beach Yacht Club in consideration that the club is located on public land; 8) biological resource impacts; and 9) public access impacts.

Responses to comments received are incorporated into the findings as a new section entitled **J. RESPONSE TO COMMENTS**. This would result in re-lettering the CEQA section to **K. CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA)**.

Response to Comments

One of the issues raised in the objection letters is that the Commission should defer action on the CDP to address the existing enforcement matter relating to unpermitted development. The unpermitted development referred to in the objection letters are renovations that occurred to the existing structure without the necessary CDPs. However, as addressed in Section H of the staff report, the proposed project would demolish portions of the renovated structures, or approve the renovations "after-the-fact." Therefore, the unpermitted development will be removed or authorized through the subject Commission action on this project at this time.

Another issue raised in the objection letters is the project's impact upon scenic resources. Section B of the staff report addresses impacts to scenic resources. However, to briefly summarize, views of Alamitos Bay, including the water, are available from the adjacent public walkway bayward of the existing and proposed Pool Building and will continue to be available as the proposed Pool Building will be located landward of the public walkway. Views of Alamitos Bay are also available from the public parking lot (Basin 4 Public Parking Lot) adjacent to the project site located landward of the proposed Pool Building. However, these views are already obscured by the existing Pool Building, and views of Alamitos Bay are only of the sky and masts of the boats docked in Alamitos Bay. Therefore, the existing view of Alamitos Bay from the public parking lot toward the existing Pool House is minimal, and while the proposed Pool Building will be taller, it will not significantly change the already hindered view.

An additional issue raised pertains to the submission of Construction Staging Plans as required by Special Condition No. 17. Opponents of the proposed project suggest that submission of those plans should occur prior to approval of the CDP so that access impacts, as well as habitat impacts are evaluated prior to approval. The potential impacts to access and habitat are considered and analyzed in Section E of the staff report. The special condition requires submittal of Construction Staging Plans prior to issuance of the CDP, which ensure the applicant's adherence to the requirements of the special condition. If there are that plans do not conform to the requirements of the special condition, they must be revised to be consistent with the special condition, and the CDP will not be issued until those issues corrected. Thus, this proposed special condition change is not necessary at this time.

Opposition letters raise concerns regarding the City's determination that the proposed project is exempt from CEQA review and, thus, potential impacts that would typically be analyzed through the CEQA review process, were not identified or addressed. However, while the Commission has its own obligations under CEQA as stated in this report's CEQA findings, CEQA compliance is not a standard of review for the purposes of compliance with the Coastal Act and any relevant LCP policies.

Opposition letters also raise concerns with traffic impacts associated with the proposed project. The applicant has indicated that proposed remodel and addition to the Yacht Club is intended to help modernize the various rooms within the facility to meet the current needs of the Club membership and will not increase Club membership, which in turn would not increase traffic. Thus, significant traffic impacts are not anticipated to occur with the proposed completed project.

Opposition letters further raise concerns regarding the use of public parking in the adjacent Basin 4 Public Parking Lot by members and guests of the private Yacht Club. These issues are discussed in Section F of the staff report. However, to briefly summarize, the Yacht Club currently has 72 private parking stalls on-site. Additionally, the City has previously approved 46 parking permits for four parking spaces each (up to 184 parking spaces out of the 316 available parking spaces) for Yacht Club members in the Basin 4 public parking lot on a first come, first served basis; thus, the forecasted demand associated with the proposed development, including for summertime conditions, can be accommodated under the current parking conditions.

However, further private use or restrictions on the public's ability to park in the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot would adversely impact the public's ability to use that parking lot and access that portion of the coast. Thus, Special Condition No. 14, prohibits reserving any parking spaces is the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot for exclusive use by Yacht Club members or their guests at any time. To further address potential adverse public parking impacts, the applicant has proposed Transportation Demand Management Plan (TDMP) measures. such as installation of bicycle racks in a designated bicycle/scooter parking area as part of a Bike Share Program, an incentive program for employees to ride bicycles to work; although no specific plan has been submitted. Thus, Special Condition No. 15, requires submittal of a Transportation Demand Management Plan (TDMP). Additionally, to improve upon the TDMP requirements, additional requirements are being proposed, as further described in this addendum, which include Long Beach Transit discounted bus fares and passes to employees and a public transit fare reimbursement program to provide or cover the full cost of a monthly transit pass for all employees of the Long Beach Yacht Club. Thus, as conditioned, the proposed project addresses any adverse impacts to public access as provided through the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot.

An additional issue that is raised in the opposition letters pertains to lack of public benefits proposed by the Yacht Club considering its location on public lands (Tidelands). However, while the Yacht Club is private, the Yacht Club does provide public benefits through programs that promote aquatic safety, environmental responsibility, sailing education, and charitable fundraising for the Long Beach community. For example, the Yacht Club provides a Safety at Sea course yearly where most of the participants are not Yacht Club members; provides a Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM) outreach program, to middle schools throughout Long Beach and the surrounding areas; provides the Sea Gals Program that is offered 2-3 times during the summer that teaches novice sailing through entry level racing designed and taught by women; and provides the Panthers at Sea Program that provides a day on the water for students from Jordan High School in North Long Beach on privately-owned sailboats that is free to participants; and offers a year round Junior Sailing Program for all skill levels.

While the applicant currently provides these public benefit programs, there is no requirement for these public benefit programs to be maintained for the development. In order to enhance and memorialize the public benefits provided by the Yacht Club, the applicant, in coordination with Commission staff, has revised their proposal to include additional measures including a commitment to provide a \$50,000 annual payment to the Long Beach Sailing Foundation, which will be used to support programs for the public that promote aquatic safety, environmental responsibility, sailing education, and charitable fundraising for the Long Beach community. The applicant also proposes to provide 10 full scholarships to non-members per year for beginning swimming classes and 28 scholarships per year for beginning sailing lessons and sailing safety. The applicant will

partner with appropriate non-profit groups, including but not limited the Boys and Girls Club, YMCA, and other local environmental justice groups to provide these scholarships to non-members from disadvantaged communities whom might not otherwise be provided these opportunities.

Moreover, Special Condition 23, as revised by this addendum, requires all provisions of the Public Benefits Program, including but not limited to the in-lieu fee to the Long Beach Sailing Foundation and the free scholarships to non-members for swimming and sailing classes be provided by the applicant for the life of the development. In addition, to ensure that these programs are adequately implemented, Special Condition No. 23, requires the applicant provide an annual Final Public Benefits Plan requiring an annual monitoring report to the Executive Director.

Opposition letters also cite negative impacts to biological resources as a result of the proposed development. One point raised is that the bird survey area required pursuant to Special Condition No. 12 (Breeding and Nesting Bird Surveys During Construction) should be expanded beyond the identified 300 ft. and 500 ft. to include the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot, the roundabout at the east end of Appian Way, and adjacent green spaces and public parkways. A similar point is raised in conjunction with Special Condition No. 8 (Final Low Impact Development (LID) Plan) regarding expanding the area subject to a prohibition of fertilizers, herbicides, and pesticides known to negatively impact coastal birds and wildlife; prohibition of vacuum sweeping and/or leaf blowers during nesting season; and removal of existing waste containers under trees to include the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot, adjoining public green spaces, on the roundabout, and on public parkways along this section of Appian Way. Additionally, the same point was raised regarding Special Condition No. 13 (Final Tree Replacement Plan and Bird and Tree Monitoring Plan) in that tree replacement requirements should apply in the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot and adjoining public green spaces and parkways. The requirements outlined in the special conditions cited have been reviewed by Commission ecologist who have determined them to be adequate to protect such biological resources with regard to potential impacts from the proposed development. Thus, changes to these special conditions are not necessary in this case.

Opponents also raise concerns with construction activities and suggest they should be prohibited during nesting season. Special Condition No. 12 (Breeding and Nesting Bird Surveys During Construction) requires biological surveys during nesting season and incorporates protocols to avoid impacts to any nesting birds discovered during construction. For example, if any active nest(s) is found within 300 ft. of the project or bird nesting or courtship behavior is observed within the project site, the applicant's biologist shall monitor bird behavior and construction noise levels, and, if an active nest of a federally or state-listed threatened or endangered species, bird species of special concern, or designated migratory bird under the federal Migratory Bird Treaty Act, is found within 300 ft. of the project, or an active nest for any species of raptor is found within 500 ft. of the project, the permittee shall notify the appropriate state and/or federal wildlife agencies within 24 hours. The Commission's biologist concluded that these condition requirements are adequate to address nesting bird concerns during construction. Thus, the requested changes to this special condition are not necessary.

Opposition letters raise biological concerns with Special Condition No. 8 (Storage of Construction Materials Mechanized Equipment and Removal of Construction Debris) and suggest it should be modified to prohibit storage of construction materials and equipment at any time in the Basin 4 Public Parking Lot or any other Alamitos Bay Marina parking lot,

or in public lots at Mother's Beach or the Marine Stadium, or on Appian Way, or on any public street nearby. The concerns relate to water quality impacts and resulting biological resource impacts from runoff from construction equipment and materials. As detailed in Special Condition No. 7 (Construction Pollution Prevention Plan (CPPP)), which requires submittal of a plan that must describe Best Management Practices (BMPs) that the development will implement to minimize erosion and sedimentation during construction and minimize the discharge of other pollutants generated by construction activities, the concerns raised by project opponents have been addressed. Thus, the requested changes to the special condition are not necessary.

An additional biological resource concern related to whether nesting bird surveys would occur during nesting season when construction activities would take place was raised in the objection letters. As described in Special Condition No. 12 (Breeding and Nesting Bird Surveys During Construction) for any construction activities taking place between January 5th and September 1st (nesting season) the permittee shall retain the services of a qualified biologist with experience in nesting bird surveys to conduct said survey. Thus, the clarification sought in the objection letter is already in the special condition, which does require bird nesting surveys during the bird nesting season. Thus, staff does not believe that any changes to the special conditions that have been required are necessary to ensure the protection of birds and nesting habitat on site.

Another concern was raised with Special Condition No. 3 (No Future Shoreline Protective Device), more specifically Part C of the special condition that identifies who is responsible for removal of debris in the event that portions of the development fall to the beach or are submerged before they are removed. The special condition included in the July 25, 2025 report indicates that the landowner would be responsible for the removal. However, in this case, the objector requests that this obligation should fall to the party performing and benefitting from the development, the Long Beach Yacht Club. The objector states that doing this would remove the burden from the public agency and place it instead on the permittee. The Commission concurs with this suggested change. Thus, this proposed special condition will be modified to make this change.

The last biological concern raised in the opposition letters pertains to Special Condition No. 4 (Assumption of Risk, Waiver of Liability and Indemnity). The commentor is concerned with this special condition and its connection to the lease between the Long Beach Yacht Club and the City of Long Beach. Special Condition No. 4, specifically relating to Part C., only deals with this situation if the lease between the Long Beach Yacht Club (Lessee) and the City of Long Beach (Lessor) is terminated, then the City is aware of the obligations of the CDP. Thus, the suggested change to the proposed special condition is not necessary.

Lastly, a public access impact issue was raised in association with Special Condition No. 16 (Final Public Access Signage Plan). A point was made that the public access signage should include language identifying the historic, current, and projected numbers of local coastal birds and describing measures that are being taken or can be taken to ensure their survival. Such language inclusion would make the public aware of the history and plight of the birds in the area. As such, Special Condition No. 16 has been modified to include such language pertaining to birds.

II. CHANGES TO STAFF REPORT

The following changes and corrections are made to the staff report dated July 25, 2025. Language to be added is shown in <u>underlined text</u>, and language to be deleted is identified by strikethrough.

- a) Page 6 Modify and Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Condition No. 1 (Submittal of Revised Final Plans), as follows:
- 1. Submittal of Revised Final Plans.
 - A. PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit, for the review and written approval of the Executive Director, two full-size sets of revised final plans that have been reviewed and approved by the City of Long Beach Planning Department. The revised plans shall substantially conform with the plans submitted to the Commission on September 18, 2024, December 9, 2024 and July 9, 2025, except that they shall be modified as required below:

. . .

- **iii.** To minimize bird-strike hazards, any proposed <u>glass windows and</u> glass railings will be replaced with bird safe glass or frosted or etched glass screens or will be replaced with a different type of material (i.e. metal fence, etc.); and
- b) Page 15 Modify and Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Condition No.3 (No Future Shoreline Protective Device), as follows:
- 3. No Future Shoreline Protective Device.
 - A. By acceptance of this permit, the applicant agrees, on behalf of itself and any successors and assigns, that no new shoreline protective device(s) shall ever be constructed to protect the development approved pursuant to Coastal Development Permit No. 5-24-0767 including, but not limited to, the Main Building, Pool Building, terraces, foundations and any other future improvements including in the event that the development is threatened with damage or destruction from waves, erosion, storm conditions, liquefaction, or any other coastal hazards in the future, and as may be exacerbated by sea level rise. By acceptance of this permit, the applicant hereby waives, on behalf of itself and all successors and assigns, any rights to construct such devices that may exist under applicable law.

C. Prior to removal/relocation, the permittee shall submit two copies of a Removal/Relocation Plan to the Executive Director for the review and written approval. The Removal/Relocation Plan shall clearly describe the manner in which such development is to be removed/relocated and the affected area restored so as to best protect coastal resources, including the Pacific Ocean. In the event that portions of the development fall to the beach or are submerged before they are removed, the landowner permittees shall remove all recoverable debris associated with the development from the beach and ocean and lawfully dispose of the material in an approved disposal site and relocated any

salvageable portions of the development inland. Such removal shall require a coastal development permit.

- c) Page 16 Modify and Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Condition No. 13 (Final Tree Replacement Plan and Bird and Tree monitoring Plan, as follows:
- **13. Final Tree Replacement Plan and Bird and Tree Monitoring Plan.** BY ACCEPTANCE OF THIS PERMIT, the permittee hereby agrees to implement a Final Tree Replacement Plan and a Bird and Tree Monitoring Plan, in substantial conformance with the application on file, except as modified herein, for the existing trees and any trees planted within the project area for the life of the development.
 - **A.** Provide for replacement of any removed trees at a two to one ratio (2:1) ratio, including any trees removed from the site pursuant to the proposed project, any trees removed from the site within the last ten years without the benefit of a coastal development permit, and any trees removed from the site throughout the life of the development approved by this permit. Any trees which are, have been, or will be removed, shall be replaced with trees as large as a qualified arborist recommends that will survive consistent with the final approved landscaping plan and special conditions of this permit. Any trees currently onsite that have been used for nesting within the past five (5) years cannot be removed.

...

- d) Page 19 Modify and Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Conditions No. 15 (Final Transportation Management Program (TDMP)), as follows:
- 15. Final Transportation <u>Demand Management Program (TDMP)</u>.
 - A. PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit for the review and approval of the Executive Director, two (2) sets of a Final Transportation Demand Management Program (TDMP). The plan shall identify alternative transportation measures to reduce vehicle use including, but not limited to:

. . .

- 9. Incentive program for employees to ride bicycles to work; and
- 10. Information on the Yacht Club's website regarding how to transit or ridesharing services to and from the site.;
- 11. Arrange shift schedules to facilitate carpooling;
- 12. Host "Alternative Transit Day" for members and employees;
- 13. Encourage usage of the Circuit on-demand rideshare servicing the Alamitos Bay and Belmont Shore;
- 14. Support the continuation of the existing bike lanes on Appian Way and surrounding streets near the Yacht Club;

- 15. Employee parking shall be provided offsite (non-public lot) without charge and employees shall be shuttled to the Yacht Club from these offsite locations using Yacht Club transportation;
- 16. Any visitors to the Yacht Club that utilize parking offsite (non-public lots) shall be shuttled to the Yacht Club from offsite using Yacht Club transportation;
- 18. Long Beach Transit discounted bus fares and passes to employees;
- 19. A public transit fare reimbursement program which shall provide or cover the full cost of a monthly transit pass for all employees of the Long Beach Yacht Club; and
- 20. Caterers parked at off-site (non-public lots) locations will be transported and dropped off at the yacht club by yacht club staff using Yacht Club transportation.

. . .

- e) Page 20 Modify and Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Condition No. 16 (Final Public Access Signage Plan), as follows:
- 16. Final Public Access Signage Plan.
 - A. PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit, for the Executive Director's review and approval, two (2) full size sets of a Final Revised Public Access Signage Plan, which indicates the walkway along Alamitos Bay fronting the north, west and east sides of the project site is public. In addition to the specifications above, at a minimum the signage program shall include:
 - (1) Signage shall indicate, with graphics and text, the presence of, and location of, public access opportunities at the project site;
 - (2) Signage shall be clearly visible to pedestrians and occupants of vehicles traveling in either direction along Appian Way;
 - (3) The project plans shall include, at a minimum, the following components: dimensions and content (graphics and text) of each sign and/or stencil and a site plan depicting the location of each sign and/or stencil; and
 - (4) Language on the signs shall be multiple languages, including English and Spanish.
 - (5) Signage shall include language identifying the historic, current, and projected numbers of local coastal birds and describing measures that are being taken or can be taken to ensure their survival.
 - (6) Signage shall include information pertaining to the history of sailing in the local area.

B. The permittee shall undertake development in accordance with the approved final plans. Any proposed changes to the approved final plans shall be reported to the Executive Director. No changes to the approved final plans shall occur without a Commission amendment to this coastal development permit unless the Executive Director determines that no amendment is legally required.

f) Page 23 – Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Condition No. 22 (Final Lighting Plan), as follows:

22. Final Lighting Plan

PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit, for the review and written approval of the Executive Director, two (2) sets of a Final Lighting Plan that incorporates the following requirements:

- <u>A.</u> Exterior night lighting for all development shall be designed, installed, and, where applicable, retrofitted to minimize all forms of light pollution, including light trespass, glare, and sky glow consistent with the following:
 - a. Lighting shall be of low glare design.
 - b. No skyward-casting lighting shall be used.
 - c. Lighting shall use the best available visor technology to minimize light spill and direct/focalize lighting downward. All lighting shall be shielded and directed downward. Lighting fixtures shall be cut-off type fixtures that divert lighting downward onto the property and shall not cast light onto adjacent properties, roadways or waterways.
- B. All temporary lighting used for construction and security shall not include skyward-casting lighting or flashing lights. All construction and security lighting shall divert lighting downward onto the property and shall not cast light onto adjacent properties, roadways or waterways.
- <u>C.</u> The lowest intensity lighting shall be used that is appropriate to the intended use of the lighting. Lighting shall use the best available technology and a lighting spectrum designed to minimize lighting impacts on sensitive bird species. Specifications for all permanent and temporary lighting, including those used for security lighting or the operation of construction equipment, if performed at night, shall be included, with light temperatures maintained at 2,700 Kelvin (in no case shall exceed 3,000 Kelvin) and a foot candle value of no higher than 0.01 fc (lm./ft.) incident along the property's waterfront edge.
- <u>D.</u> The permittee shall undertake development in accordance with the approved final plans. Any proposed changes to the approved final plans shall be reported to the Executive Director. No changes to the approved final plans shall occur without a Commission amendment to this coastal development permit unless the Executive Director determines that no amendment is legally required.
- g) Page 23 Add to Section III. Special Conditions/Special Condition No. 23 (Public Benefits Plan), as follows:

23. Final Public Benefits Plan.

- A. PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF THE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, the applicant shall submit for the review and approval of the Executive Director, a Final Public Benefits Plan. The plan shall identify the public benefits provided by the Long Beach Yacht Club including, but not limited to:
 - 1. Use of designated room for City agencies, City-related agencies, Councilmembers, and neighborhood organizations;
 - 2. Use of designated room for regional sailing/aquatic non-profits such as Southern California Association of Clubs (SCYA), Association of South Bay Yacht Clubs (ASBYC), Aquatics Capital of America (ACOA), US Sailing, and Long Beach Sailing Foundation (LBSF);
 - 3. Meeting Space for Public Informational Meetings;
 - 4. Pool used for Public Education;
 - <u>5.</u> <u>Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM) Sailing outreach program;</u>
 - 6. Partnership with nonprofits (such as US Sailing Center and/or Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA) during Wednesday Regattas;
 - 7. Heroes Regatta (for first responders and service members and their families);
 - 8. Sea Gals Program;
 - 9. Panthers at Sea;
 - 10. Year round Junior Sailing Program for all skill levels:
 - 11. Long Beach Yacht Club Coaching of Local High School Sailing Teams and advanced/technical racing;
 - 12. Camp Corinthian;
 - 13. Pool access for training and assessment to First Responders, Sea Scouts, STEM students; and
 - 14. Blood drives.
 - B. These public benefit programs shall be provided yearly. Any program that ceases to exist shall be replaced by a program that provides a public benefit.
 - C. The applicant shall submit \$50,000 annually to the Long Beach Sailing
 Foundation (LBSF), or other appropriate organization acceptable to the
 Executive Director, that will be used to fund public benefit programs for the
 underserved such as sailing experiences and education to serve the youth in

- underserved communities. The submitted \$50,000 shall also be used to fund an outreach program to reach out to these underserved communities to make them aware of the public benefit programs located at the Long Beach Yacht Club.
- <u>D.</u> The applicant shall provide a minimum of ten (10) scholarships per year for swim classes and a minimum of twenty-eight (28) scholarships for sailing lessons for in underserved communities. The Long Beach Yacht Club shall partner with the South Coast area non-profit groups approved by the Executive Director, including the YMCA, Boys and Girls Club, Black Girls Surf, etc., to assist in reaching out to underserved communities to make them aware of the swimming and sailing public benefit programs located at the Long Beach Yacht Club.
- E. The permittee shall undertake development in accordance with the approved final plans. Any proposed changes to the approved final plans shall be reported to the Executive Director. No changes to the approved final plans shall occur without a Commission amendment to this coastal development permit unless the Executive Director determines that no amendment is legally required.
- F. An annual monitoring report providing details of the implementation and success of all public benefits provided by the public benefits program shall be submitted by December 31st each year for the life of the development, for the review of the Executive Director. Any changes to the Final Public Benefits Plan shall require an amendment to this coastal development permit, unless the Executive Director determines such changes to be in substantial conformance with the provisions of the program.

h) Page 39 – Modify Section IV. Findings and Declarations/E. Biological Resources, as follows:

...replaced with bird safe glass railing and wood brackets. Additionally, the existing lower level wrought iron perimeter screen wall will be replaced with a bird safe glass screen wall, which will be further discussed in the staff report. However, it is unclear if bird safe glass will also be used for proposed glass rails that are part of the project, for example the glass railing along the 2nd floor of the new Pool Building facing the public walkway and Alamitos Way. Thus, the Commission imposes **Special Condition No. 1**, which requires the applicant to submit revised plans indicating that any proposed glass rails will utilize bird safe glass or will be replaced with a different type of material (i.e. metal fence, etc.).

In order to make the public aware of the birds historically found in the area and the measures being taken to ensure their survival, the Commission imposes **Special**Condition No. 16, which requires language identifying the historic, current, and projected numbers of local coastal birds and describing measures that are being taken or can be taken to ensure their survival to be included on signs as part of the Final Public Access Signage Program.

Lighting

According to the project plans, outdoor lighting is proposed. Lighting that is not controlled could have adverse effects upon the adjacent marine habitat. The applicant has not

provided a Lighting Plan indicating measures necessary to make sure that the lighting will not have any adverse impacts to habitat. For example, low intensity lighting should be used, and skyward-casting lighting should be prohibited. To ensure that the proposed lighting does not impact adjacent marine habitat, the Commission imposes **Special**Condition No. 22, which requires the applicant to submit a Final Lighting Plan.

i) Page 43 – Modify Section IV. Findings and Declarations/F. Public Access, as follows:

To ensure that the future development of the property can be evaluated for consistency with the public access policies of the Coastal Act, the Commission imposes **Special Condition No. 5**, which requires the applicant to obtain a permit amendment or a new permit for future improvements and any repair or maintenance of the residence.

Public Benefit

While the Yacht Club is a private club, it is located on public land (Tidelands) and it provides programs that benefit the public. Specifically, the Yacht Club provides programs that promote aquatic safety, environmental responsibility, sailing education, and charitable fundraising for the Long Beach community. For example, the Yacht Club provides a Safety at Sea course yearly where most of the participants are not Yacht Club members; provides a Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM) outreach program, to middle schools throughout Long Beach and the surrounding areas; provides the Sea Gals Program that is offered 2-3 times during the summer that teaches novice sailing through entry level racing designed and taught by women; provides the Panthers at Sea Program that provides a day on the water for students from Jordan High school in North Long Beach on privately-owned sail boats that is completely free to participants: and year round Junior Sailing Program for all skill levels. The facility also provides event and meeting room rentals and banquet room rentals to local community groups and club members. For example, the Yacht Club provide a designated room allocated for use by City agencies, City-related agencies. Councilmembers, and neighborhood organizations throughout the City for 12 hours each week for 50 weeks during each year; for Regional sailing/aquatic non-profits such as Southern California Yachting Association (SYCA), US Sailing, and Long Beach Sailing Foundation (LBSF).

While the applicant currently provides these public benefit programs, there is no requirement for these public benefit programs to be maintained for the development. In order to enhance and memorialize the public benefits provided by the Yacht Club, the applicant, in coordination with Commission staff, has revised their proposal to include additional measures including a commitment to provide a \$50,000 annual payment to the Long Beach Sailing Foundation, which will be used to support programs for the public that promote aquatic safety, environmental responsibility, sailing education, and charitable fundraising for the Long Beach community. The applicant also proposes to provide 10 full scholarships to non-members per year for beginning swimming classes and 28 scholarships per year for beginning sailing lessons and sailing safety The applicant will partner with appropriate non-profit groups, including but not limited the Boys and Girls Club, YMCA, and other local environmental justice groups to provide these scholarships to non-members from disadvantaged communities whom might not otherwise be provided these opportunities.

Moreover, Special Condition 23, requires all provisions of the Public Benefits Program, including but not limited to the in-lieu fee to the Long Beach Sailing Foundation and the free scholarships to non-members for swimming and sailing classes be provided by the applicant for the life of the development. In addition, to ensure that these programs are adequately implemented, the Special Condition No. 23, requires the applicant provide an annual Final Public Benefits Plan requiring an annual monitoring report to the Executive Director.

j) Page 46 - Modify Section Appendix A Substantive File Documents, as follows:

City of Long Beach Approval-In-Concept dated September 9, 2024-; <u>CDP No. 5-08-187</u>; and LCDP Nos. LCDP20-033 and LCDP21-015,

k) Throughout the staff report, update the page numbers and Table of Contents to reflect the aforementioned changes.